E-Government implementation and administrative reform in Uzbekistan – interrelations and interference

The research paper is prepared by the team of national experts of UNDP Digital Development Initiative Programme (UNDP DDI) and Center for Economic Research (CER): N. Yusupova (Team Leader), B. Ergashev (Research Coordinator), S. Avganbaev, I. Djuraev, I. Kamilov, R. Sayfulin, B. Kuchkarov, Yu. Pavlova, A. Valiev, Kh. Teshbekova

Research consultant: A.D. Khodjaev

Tashkent, 2004
CONTENT

Introduction………………………………………………………………………………………………………..3

CHAPTER 1. IMPLEMENTATION OF E-GOVERNMENT IN UZBEKISTAN – CRITICAL ANALYSIS
1.1. Implementation of e-government and influence on raising efficiency of public administration: best practices…………………………………………………………5
1.2. Problems of e-government implementation in Uzbekistan in the context of administrative reform ………………………………………………………………………….7
1.3. Assessment of legislative basis of the Republic of Uzbekistan for e-government implementation …………………………………………………………………………..10

CHAPTER 2. E-GOVERNMENT IN UZBEKISTAN – DEVELOPMENT PROSPECTS
2.1. Interrelations of e-government and administrative reform: goals, principles and objectives…………………………………………………………………………………..12
2.2. Improvement of legislative basis for implementation of e-government in public administration ……………………………………………………………………………………..15
2.3. Main direction of e-government implementation in public administration in Uzbekistan ……………………………………………………………………………………..17
2.4. Main stages of e-government implementation in Uzbekistan and approaches to assessment of economic efficiency ……………………………………………………20

Conclusion………………………………………………………………………………………………………..27
Introduction

During the past years after gaining independence Uzbekistan has managed to establish basis for national state system. However public administration, including economy, to high extent has preserved numerous elements of administrative command system. This situation is incompatible with the course for further economy liberalization and ensuring sustainable economic growth. In this regard, implementation of administrative reform is priority driven assuming realization of programme aimed at optimization of functions, structure and mechanisms of executive power.

The President of the Republic of Uzbekistan, Islam Karimov, in his statement during the meeting of the Cabinet of Ministers\(^1\) defined 5 directions of administrative reform implementation in the country. One of them assumes fulfilling measures towards gradual modernization and raising efficiency of work carried out by public administration system based on introduction of advanced information and communication technologies, reduction of useless accounting and paper document circulation. Hence, the President set the objective to synchronize administrative reform and implementation of e-government elements.

Therefore the Government realizes that e-government implementation is one of the components of administrative reform implemented in the country.

---

\(^1\) Statement of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan during the meeting of the Cabinet of Ministers “On the results of socio-economic development for the first six months of the year 2003 and implementation of measures on the most crucial and priority driven reforms in this area”. July 18, 2003.
Under current conditions e-government in Uzbekistan means reconstruction of interrelation mechanisms between citizens and the state, private sector and the state with an aim to broaden public access to information and documentation of government authorities, ensuring transparency and accountability of power to population.

The main factors hindering ICT application in activity carried out by public administration bodies and creation of e-government in Uzbekistan are the following:

1. Unreadiness of existing public administration bodies to perform their duties under conditions of information openness, accessibility and transparency for citizens and private sector;
2. Lack of effective mechanisms promoting ICT introduction in all areas of social life;
3. Lack of open dialogue between the state, civil society and private sector on priorities as well as e-government formation mechanisms.

The break-through in the area of e-government is extremely important for Uzbekistan. In this regard it is not casual that the Government makes substantial efforts aimed at strategy formulation assuming broad introduction and application of modern ICT means. During the last two years the following acts were adopted in the country: the Decree of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan “On further computerization and introduction of information-communication technologies” of May 30, 2002, that defines the most urgent objectives in this area and “Programme on computerization and information-communication technologies development for 2002-2010” (June 6, 2002), endorsed by the Decree of the Cabinet of Ministers (the Programme is currently under revision).

The main goal of the research paper lies in definition of the main directions of e-government implementation in Uzbekistan through interrelations with administrative reform.

Objectives of the research paper: (1) analysis of best practices in the area of e-government implementation in developed countries; (2) analysis of problems related to e-government implementation in activity carried out by public administration bodies for the previous years; (3) analysis of legislative basis for e-government implementation and development of recommendations on introducing law amendments regulating e-government implementation; (4) based on analysis conducted definition of the main direction and stages of e-government implementation in activity carried out by public administration bodies.

The research paper consists of two chapters, introduction, conclusion and annexes.
CHAPTER 1. IMPLEMENTATION OF E-GOVERNMENT IN UZBEKISTAN – CRITICAL ANALYSIS

1.1 Implementation of e-government and influence on raising efficiency of public administration: best practices

E-government is a system of public administration and services rendered by government authorities to citizens and business structures based on electronic means of information processing, transferring and dissemination.

The following components are defined within the system of e-government:

- Focused on citizens – (Government – Citizen) G2C: defines rendering the whole complex of public services to citizens through Internet by creating single government portal with incorporated governmental database. By using this portal citizens can easily receive available information and services.

- Focused on private sector – (Government – Business) G2B: establishes effective interrelations between public administration bodies and business, thus providing opportunity to reduce necessity for paper documents, optimize accountability, apply interactive mechanisms of interrelation between the state and business, etc.

- Focused on raising efficiency of interaction within the system of public administration bodies - (Government – Government) G2G: establishes interrelation among public administration bodies through application of advanced technologies thus providing opportunity to redesign their activity and ensure integrated, not uncoordinated, service provision, introduce electronic document circulation, etc.

In 2002 Division for Public Economics and Public Administration (UNDPEPA) conducted research on problems and prospects for development of e-government (191 UN member-countries²). Based on international experience the research defines 5 consecutive stages of e-government development:

1) initial presence — on-line presence of government authorities in Internet;
2) extended presence — the number of governmental web-sites increases constantly, representing available information more dynamically;
3) interactive interrelation — users have an opportunity to download typical forms of various official documents by e-mail or by interaction through web-site;
4) transactions — users can make various on-line transactions with government institutions;
5) “weldless” interaction — full-scale integration of e-services within administrative frameworks.

Based on the results of the research there was developed a rating of countries by e-government development. During the rating preparation the experts applied so-called E-gov index covering set of factors. UNDPEPA experts assessed: a) presence of government authorities of certain countries in Internet; b) level of telecommunications development; c) general level of Internet-literacy of population. Uzbekistan ranked 89 place in this rating with 1.10 points. Among CIS countries higher points have Russia (1.89), Ukraine (1.80), Byelorussia (1.62), Armenia (1.59), Azerbaijan (1.30), Kazakhstan (1.28), Turkmenistan (1.15). Both Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan have lower points comparing with Uzbekistan, 1.01 and 1.00 accordingly.

² www.un.org
The research findings show that currently due to gaps in economic development of countries e-government implementation is at various development stages. Separate elements of e-government are currently applied in 173 states including Uzbekistan. However in majority of the countries the governments confine themselves by providing information without any feedback from citizens.

Only in 63 countries citizens have an opportunity to use public services through Internet and only in 33 countries these services can be paid through the system of e-payment.

According to the research findings the leading position by the rates of e-government implementation belongs to the USA (3.11 points by UNDPEPA rating). Based on the data of Momentum Research Group Company, 60% of Americans have used services rendered by governmental web-sites at least once. According to forecasts of Forrester Research Company, by 2006 there will be nearly 14 000 governmental web-sites, ensuring 15% of taxes imposed on the US population totaling to 600 billion USD.

New project, www.firstgov.gov, was launched in 2000 in the USA. This web-site contains nearly 27 million pages and joins 20 000 various web resources of US government institutions and services. The web-site provides US citizens with opportunity to undertake various on-line actions, from transactions with personal social insurance card to reserving camping spots in the national parks. More detailed information on best practices of the USA and other countries in the area of e-government introduction is in Annex 1.

By assessments of US experts, application of common methods of e-commerce focused on interrelations between business and government authorities ensures the latter at least 100% of state funds saved\(^3\). Introduction on one common facility to make e-purchasing – conducting auctions in Internet through centralized exchanges, electronic bulletin boards, trade platforms could have saved 20-30% of total budget expenditures allocated for the state purchases\(^4\).

Based on estimates of Russian experts, application of electronic document circulation at government authorities would ensure 15-20% reduction of expenditures for bureaucratic officials and would allow to decrease the number of bureaucratic staff by 23-30%. The poll conducted among civil servants who used to work with paper documents before e-government implementation showed the following:

- In 90% of cases implementation of e-government led to increase of efficiency;
- In 50% - increase of profitability;
- In 75% - better quality of internal management.

In the beginning of 2004 Russian experts estimated benefits from ICT introduction into activity carried out by government institutions: the State Customs Committee, the Ministry of Taxes and Duties, the Central Bank of Russian Federation. Based on assessments of Mikhail Senatorov, Deputy Chairman of the Central Bank of Russian Federation and Director of Department of Informational Systems: “ICT development within the Central Bank of Russian Federation ensured the result….. commensurable with 5% ADP increase constituting nearly 30

---

\(^3\) World Markets Telecom [http://www.wmrc.com/wma_t.html]

\(^4\) World Markets Telecom [http://www.wmrc.com/wma_t.html]
billion USD”.

One of the main advantages of e-government assumes that upon launching governmental Internet-portal the number of personal visits and requests to government authorities will tend to decrease. On average the level of using e-government services by the population of developed countries constitutes 26% as of the end of 2002. 20% of people having Internet access use e-government services to search for and access to information, 9% - to print out forms of official documents, etc., 7% - transfer personal information to government authorities on-line.

Analysis of foreign experience in the area of e-government implementation shows that e-technologies allow to achieve the following:

1. Raise efficiency of public administration bodies at all levels, reduce state budget costs.
2. Ensure appropriate functioning of interaction mechanisms between the state, business and citizens.
3. Ensure openness and transparency of activity carried out by public administration bodies for business and society.

The main principles of building e-government in the majority of countries are the following: (1) Necessity for common national strategy formulation that would define goals, principles, objectives, indicators evaluating the process of e-government implementation; (2) Synchronization of e-government implementation process with administrative reforms; (3) creating tax and institutional mechanisms promoting increase of demand for ICT; (4) openness of e-government introduction programme development and accountability on its implementation.

1.2. Problems of e-government implementation in Uzbekistan in the context of administrative reform

Current administrative system in the Republic of Uzbekistan has formed under influence of the following critical factors: (1) objective necessity for application of prior power mechanisms and (2) adaptation to solving fundamentally new objectives. The administrative system allowed to ensure initiating role of the state in development and implementation of reforms, achieving certain priority driven strategic development objectives. However today current administrative systems require reorganization and deep reformations, otherwise it may become one of the obstacles on the way to further reforms. The most critical problem of existing administrative system is low efficiency of civil service performance as a whole.

The following is considered as strategic objectives of administrative reform in Uzbekistan: (1) Decentralization of the current administration system; (2) increasing competency level and responsibility of local governments; (3) reducing interference of public administration bodies into activity carried out by legal entities and cutting down transaction costs of entrepreneurial activity; (4) ensuring transparency of administrative system performance at all levels. The most important strategic priority of administrative reform is improvement of interaction system among government authorities and with civil society institutions.

Achievement of these objectives require, first of all, overcoming existing drawbacks hindering introduction of e-government elements into public administration performance.

I. Non-optimized mechanism function and authority distribution among government institutions.

Public administration system in Uzbekistan is at the nascent stage of its formation and development, when effective mechanisms of self-regulation and self-adjustment have not been

---

6 World Markets Telecom [http://www.wmrc.com/wma_t.html](http://www.wmrc.com/wma_t.html)
7 - Current Condition and main directions of reforming central executive bodies in the Republic of Uzbekistan / Center for Economic Research, Tashkent, 2003
8 Decentralization of existing governance system require political solutions to grant more authorities to lower levels of the government. E-government by itself cannot ensure decentralization.
established yet. This situation results in excessive enlargement of public administration bodies, unjustified interference into business activity, in particular in excessive coordination procedures at various authorities, tense relations with regulation subjects when several institutions examine the same legal entity again and again, as well as in increase of transaction costs of entrepreneurial activity and other negative consequences.

It is necessary to conduct comprehensive functional analysis within the framework of administrative reform in Uzbekistan, which would allow to reveal current problems in function distribution within the system of public administration bodies, define the ways of their optimization including on the part of e-government implementation.

II. Imperfection of mechanisms encouraging civil servants to apply e-government in public administration performance.

Considering implementation of e-government the core issue is whether motivation mechanisms have been established to encourage civil servants to apply e-government. In order to make e-government comprehensive the steps undertaken should be strategic not tactical ones, direct executors (civil servants of all levels) should have strong motivation to encourage permanent introduction and application of e-government elements. E-government implementation is impossible without single motivation system stimulating civil servants to apply e-government when assessment of outputs of the work carried out by civil servants directly depends on use of ICT means. In this regard, e-government implementation is has strong connection with administrative and civil service reform assuming introduction of new systems to assess effectiveness of civil services performance.

Lack of incentives to apply e-government makes the process of e-government implementation just a formal procedure that makes no impact on existing work scheme (for instance – inefficient web-sites of regional khokimiyats), thus government officials consider r-government as another attribute more appropriate for image, impressive objectives than for solving actual problems.

III. Inefficient application of e-government facilities for ensuring information openness of public administration performance.

All governmental web-sites have information in Russian language, only 19% of them represent information in Uzbek and 21% - in English. Only 26% of web-sites developed by public administration bodies are regularly updated.

Study of government institutions’ web-sites shows that 29.8% represent information on their objectives and functions, 31.3% have structure or list of subdivisions, 11.9% place contact information of heads of organization and 10.7 % - contact information on subdivisions.

Dissemination of e-publications and e-documents, including news is hardly fulfilled by requests through web-sites.

Among all public administration bodies only the following render services on-line: the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (subscription for the news of Jahon Information Agency), the State Statistics Committee (order for statistics bulletin of the SSC), Central Hydrometeorology Service (hydrometeorologic information, images from satellite and maps), the State Paten Department (invoice forms and patent duties).

Information services on sales (tenders or display of the state share for sale) of the state property are represented on the web-site of the State Committee on Property and several sectoral public administration bodies. However full-scale information on the state purchases, sale of the state property is not available.

In this regard, we can note the portal www.gov.uz, main official informational resource of the Government of Uzbekistan represented in Internet. The information on the portal is available in Uzbek, Russian and English.

It should be noted that the portal provides only information not any web-solutions and tools that ensure interaction G2C, G2B, G2G. Lack of interactivity of this portal makes it nonfunctional. For the moment the portal serves as a provider to web-sites of separate public administration bodies.
This portal does not provide information on the latest news and events occurred in socio-political and economic life of the country, it is not focused on providing information to various segments of society: citizens, government institutions, private sector, NGOs.

The portal www.gov.uz has not become backbone element of infrastructure of e-interaction of the government and society; it does not provide support the processes and procedures of functional public administration performance.

IV. Imperfection of current official programmes of ICT implementation in activity carried out by public administration bodies.

Study of activity carried out by public administration bodies and legal entities in the area of ICT introduction\(^{10}\) showed that on average in the Republic of Uzbekistan ICT development and introduction programmes were elaborated only at 30.7 % of organizations questioned.

On average, 1 computer is used by 1.8 civil servants, 1 computer with Internet access is used by 21.5 civil servants employed by central government institutions and legal entities or 18 and 247 correspondingly by all institutions (see Annex2, Table 1).

The poll of public administration bodies testifies that on average 31% of respondents have specialized ICT introduction and application units, the number of staff in the general structure of the staff members does not exceed 0.5 % (see Annex 2, Table 1).

The level of employees working at the government institutions studied who have modern ICT skills is rather low as an average in the country. There exist substantial gap between the knowledge levels of the staff employed in administrative bodies and those employed in their subdivisions (see Annex 2, Table 1).

ICT training programmes are developed only at 34.6 % of government institutions and legal entities (see Annex 2, Table 1).

The majority of public administration bodies apply minor specialized programmes to solve specific objectives. Local area networks (LAN) are installed at 25 % of subdivisions and 42.8% of administrative bodies participated in the poll. At the same time there is a considerable gap in introducing LANs at administrative bodies of the government authorities, legal entities and subdivisions (see Annex 2, Table 1).

The created information systems operate mainly in the interests of separate structures and solve only specific organizational objectives. Each institution develops and maintains its information system that hardly interacts with the systems of other institutions, even more concerning providing access to information to all users interested. As a rule this results in data duplicating, higher costs of system creation and exploitation, complicates collecting primary information and proper maintaining.

V. Non-optimized system of public expenditures for ICT introduction.

Analysis of the state budget expenditure items and the guidelines on applying separate groups and sub-groups of economic classification of expenditures of the state budget of the Republic of Uzbekistan approved by the Order of the Ministry of Finance #27 of 06.03.2003 testifies existence of groups and sub-groups assuming ICT related costs. In particular such budget items as: Expenditures for telephone, information and telecommunication services; Expenditures for current repair; Expenditures for maintaining, exploitation costs and miscellaneous services; Expenditures for equipment and accessories for current needs, foodstuff; Capital costs; Purchasing the main capital assets (see Annex 3). Consequently, ICT related costs are spread among almost all expenditure items. This situation does not ensure target financing of e-government implementation, complicates the process of monitoring targeted funds allocated by the budget for ICT introduction and development.

Considering the aforementioned, we may conclude that in spite of decisions taken by the Government up to today public administration bodies cannot ensure effective implementation of e-government programme.

---

\(^{10}\) The poll was conducted in April 2004.
The following reasons stipulate current situation: a) Underdeveloped mechanism of stimulating civil servants to introduce e-government into public administration performance, thus resulting to unavailability of the majority of the heads of local governments and public administration bodies to implement e-government elements, lack of understanding of functioning mechanisms, underestimation of new tools of shaping public opinion proposed by e-government, interaction of citizens and business with the government as a result of their striving to work as they used to or fear of new technologies; b) underdeveloped ICT infrastructure within public administration system apparent in poor equipment with ICT means, insufficient level of ICT application means by civil servants, shortcomings of technological compatibility of information resources created; c) imperfection of financing system to introduce e-government into public administration performance.

1.3. Assessment of legislative basis of the Republic of Uzbekistan for e-government implementation

The following types of legislative acts can be distinguished in legislation of Uzbekistan regulating ICT area:

- The Constitution of the Republic of Uzbekistan;
- Backbone (framework) laws regulating basic ICT relations;
- Specific laws related to legal relationship in separate areas of ICT application or in separate component activities on ICT creation and application;
- Sectoral laws regulating information legal relations in specific areas of socio-economic life;
- General legislative acts (including the codes) regulating certain aspects of ICT application
- Sub-legislative acts (the decrees of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan, regulations and other acts of the Government of the Republic of Uzbekistan) related to ICT application;
- International agreements in the area of ICT development and application signed by the Republic of Uzbekistan;

The Constitution of the Republic of Uzbekistan defines main rights and obligations of participants of information legal relations based on the freedom of the individual and freedom of economic activity.


Sectoral legislation like general (codifying) one includes numerous legislative acts adopted during the last years and regularly amended.

The following aspects should be noted as the most urgent unsolved issues:

- Lack of thematic list of open information (including, first of all, information provided by governmental information resources) assuming that based on presumption of information

Box 2.
Following the political course of e-government implementation requires understanding that it is quite expensive undertaking and countries worldwide spend lots of money for e-government implementation. Gartner analytics forecasted that in 2003 European governments allocated more than 67.8 billion USD for ICT. It is 3.6% more than in 2002; by 2005 the volume of financial funds will reach 74.5 billion USD. The leading countries by ICT investments are Great Britain and with substantial gap - Germany. In 2003 the volume of investments for equipping public sector constituted 22 billion USD and 11 billion USD correspondingly.
openness this list should cover minimum compulsory data.

- Low pace of creating unified order of information interaction of public administration bodies with citizens and organizations, application of e-messages (documents) and information networks within such an interaction.
- Lack of systematization and proper detailed regulation of confidentiality institutions.

Analysis of legislative norms in the area of information interaction shows that the main shortcoming lies in poor provision of necessary legal, organizational, material-technical guarantees of their observation. This results in low efficiency of normative acts and imperfect mechanisms of ensuring the right of citizens for access to information.

Legislative basis in the area of ICT development needs to be improved in the following directions:

- Among numerous factors defining the rates of ICT application in public administration one of the most important is the level of telecommunication sector development. However currently provision of telecommunication services requires overcoming considerable number of permissive procedures – licensing, authorization, certification, thus leading to increase of costs and reduction of investment attractiveness of this sector.
- Regarding e-commerce regulation, the legislation (arranging and fulfilling the deals in the form of e-message exchange, especially those related to the state purchases and deals with foreign partners, fulfillment of financial obligations applying network technologies, ensuring consumer rights, efficient ways of settling down disagreements, etc.) is just at the nascent development stage.

The Government of Uzbekistan has already adopted the Law “On electronic digital signature” equated to the hand-signed on the paper document. An auxiliary document is currently at the stage of finalization, namely Standard regulations on the centers of electronic digital signature registration.

The following principally new laws have been adopted with an aim to further improve the legislative basis and create favorable environment for ICT development: “On Electronic Document Circulation”, “On E-commerce” as well as new edition of the Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan “On Informatization”. The Law “On E-payments” is currently at the stage of elaboration.

Nevertheless the main problems lie in the area of legal regulation of rendering on-line services to population and business. It necessary to legislatively determine common terms of provision of these services as well as the features of certain types of services, regulate the order and forms of requests and other documents to be further used. Special attention should be paid to ensuring legal guarantees for provision ICT services.
CHAPTER 2. E-GOVERNMENT IN UZBEKISTAN – DEVELOPMENT PROSPECTS

2.1. Interrelations of e-government and administrative reform: goals, principles and objectives

Study of best practices in the area of ICT implementation in public administration in developed countries shows that ICT mainly aimed at raising administrative effectiveness not at administrative reform as a whole. US researchers K. Kramer and D.L. King argue that “ICT can serve as a tool for administrative reform implementation but only in case expectations from administrative reform are clearly defined… ICT does not implement administrative reform. ICT can change the organizational structure, thus being strong instrument for reform implementation. But it is necessary to understand that ICT often can serve only for strengthening current administrative structures”[11].

Therefore we may ascertain that e-government implementation should base on the national public administration reform strategy defining the goals, principles, objectives and indicators of effectiveness assessment coordinated with the tools and advantages that may be provided by e-government. Developed countries approached to ICT introduction into public administration performance having established system of democratic, open and transparent public administration.

The feature of Uzbekistan lies in the fact that the process of e-government implementation must be synchronized with the general administrative reform which is much more difficult.

In this regard the starting point for e-government shaping in Uzbekistan at the current stage should become development of the E-government Development Concept and Strategy defining the main provisions base on the general logic of administrative reform.

But at the moment the situation with e-government implementation in Uzbekistan is complicated by lack of comprehensive administrative reform concept. As a result during development of ICT Concept and Strategy it is impossible to ensure interrelation of objectives, outputs and tools of e-government and administrative reform.

The following may de considered as the main principles of E-government Development Concept stipulated by general logic of administrative reform:

1. Leading role of the central Government. The Government should be ready to accept the leading position in the area of electronization and informatization of society through development of a common ICT introduction strategy.

2. Ensuring openness and broad coverage. It is necessary to substantially expand access to information and improvement of opportunities to use it due to innovations applied. It is important also to increase the range of e-services rendered by the Government and provision of full coverage of all social segments. The services should be available for all citizens any time.

3. User-oriented approach. First of all, the government institutions should focus on the needs of citizens (users) study their requirements and improve their work in order to fulfill them. In this regard some relative steps should be undertaken in this direction, in particular revision of assessment system of civil servants’ and government institutions’ performance, expanding opportunities for control over public administration performance by citizens and business.

4. Integrated public services. Public services should be rendered within the framework of fully integrated system. This assumes creation of a unified governmental portal to join web-sites of various government agencies. Moreover it is necessary to establish close government network ensuring integration of departmental databases – e-applications should ensure interaction among various government structures and bodies complying one single system and being fully compatible.

Close connection between the Government and private sector. Public administration bodies should cooperate with private sector more often with an aim to ensure fast and effective introduction of e-solutions, support permanent knowledge exchange among citizens, business and government authorities.

Administrative reform implementation and introduction of e-government elements are mutually related. It is necessary to consider that while evaluating perspective positive outputs to be achieved within the framework of administrative reform by using solutions and tools of e-government it is quite difficult to divide objectives of administrative reform and e-government tools to achieve the objectives set. The same tools of e-government can make positive effects in various aspects of administrative reform.

The objectives set define the following:
1. Raising efficiency of public administration bodies (both central and local) based on e-government tools application relates to:

   - Creation of governmental e-database, including opportunity for remote access (intranet);
   - Introduction of integrated systems of e-document circulation;
   - Discussion of draft decisions and governmental programmes at Internet-forums of governmental portals.
   - Development of electronic official and administrative regulations based on comprehensive functional analysis conducted.

2. Reduction of transaction costs of entrepreneurial activity and simplification of public service provision to citizens is possible only upon introduction of the following e-government elements:

   - Filling on-line e-forms of applications, accounting (in particular the tax ones), payment of services rendered by government institutions, etc.;
   - Creation of integrated information collecting and assembling systems, abolition of useless ones;
   - Practical implementation of “e-window” concept for solution of broad range of issues regulating economic activity (registration, licensing, taxes, subsidies, etc.);
   - Based on launching governmental portals creating environment for simplified access of citizens and business to official information, reduction of time loss of individuals and legal entities.

3. Ensuring more transparency of administrative system at all levels applying e-government tools can be achieved through the following:

   - Launching integrated governmental portals;
   - Placement of maximum volume of information for citizens and business including updated legislative base, description of administrative procedures necessary for citizens and private sector;
   - Arranging receipt of requests, appeals and claims of entrepreneurs through interactive instruments, establishment of e-delivery service for entrepreneurs containing various documents of public administration bodies interacting with private sector;
   - Introduction of electronic forms and mechanisms of conducting tenders for the state purchases and competition-based resource allocation.

The following outputs can be achieved applying comprehensive approach based on synchronized process of administrative reform implementation and introduction of e-government elements: (1) Optimization of information exchange among various government institutions and levels, improvement of public administration performance through creating integrated information collecting and assembling systems, abolition of useless ones, increase of the quality of document preparation, simplification of public service provision to citizens and business, reduction of costs related to fulfilling the procedures. (2) Optimization of budget expenditures for management and cutting down operation costs including information search, preparation of
references, reports, reviews and decision-taking. Direct economic effect resulted from increased efficiency of organization performance can be measured by larger quantity of requests processed, etc.; (3) Achievement of economic effect from introduction of electronic forms and mechanisms of conducting tender purchases for the state needs and competition-based allocation of resources (cutting down costs of resources purchased and reduction of budget expenditures); (4) Limited opportunities for corruption.

Lack of interrelation between administrative reform and e-government implementation inevitably results in appearance of problem nodes discrediting the very idea of e-government. The main threat to the objectives set within the process of e-government implementation will lie in efforts to informatize current inefficient procedures (for more details see Matrix 1).

**Matrix 1. Creating favorable environment for e-government implementation within the frameworks of administrative reform**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main steps towards e-government development</th>
<th>Required decisions within the frameworks of administrative reform</th>
<th>Consequences resulted from the problems unsolved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formulation and gradual implementation of comprehensive long-term strategy of ICT introduction and e-government development</td>
<td>National policy formulation. Development and publication of regular ICT development programmes adopted at government institutions considering improved service provision to citizens.</td>
<td>Unclear objectives and lack of guiding principles of e-government development. Lack of coordination and (or) strategic planning, opportunities for managing large-scale ICT projects. Inadequate system planning and economic inefficiency.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promoting baselines of civil society and democratic governance traditions. Focus of public administration bodies on the needs of citizens and business. Establishing interrelation with citizens within the course of democratic governance.</td>
<td>Creating conditions for the governance based on participatory approach. Public administration democratization. Ensuring openness of high government officials and transparency of law-making process at all administration levels. Actual provision of the right of every citizen for access to socially important information. Developing legal, technical and other preconditions for integration of governmental electronic infrastructure, information system, processes and services, user-oriented approach.</td>
<td>Deepening contradictions between the idea of e-government and certain interests of government officials. Resistance of government bodies, doubts on the necessity of creation of e-government and expansion of governmental presence in Internet. Prohibition by local high government officials of innovative initiatives due to “fear to make mistake”.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased information openness of public administration bodies. Increased number and stimulating enlargement of information provided by governmental web-sites.</td>
<td>Formulating relative legislation strictly regulating duties of government institutions to provide and publish information. Clarification of normative rules related to information protection (information security).</td>
<td>Underassessment of project costs and project incompleteness. Reduction of technical reliability of systems due to their cheapness. Lack of resources for 24-hour maintenance of e-government performance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allocation of targeted budget financing for ICT development and implementation of e-government projects at government agencies.</td>
<td>Introduction of relative amendments into legislation on budget and definition of financing for ICT and accountability on the funds allocated.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

14
### Training and capacity building.

- Increasing the level of training and retraining of respective staff due to modernization of education system based on ICT interrelated with education reform implemented.
- Development of mechanisms of rational human resource application at government institutions including the problems related to educating, recruiting and distribution of the personnel.

### Lack of skilled professionals.

- Ineffective application and maintenance of modern electronic systems.
- Lack of qualified technical system maintenance.
- Difficulties with implementing complicated e-projects in the area of public administration.

### Promoting development of private ICT companies.

- Attracting the world leading producers of soft- and hardware to the national market.

### Out-of-date legislation hinders innovations in private sector and attraction to implementation of e-government initiatives.

- Lack of developed ICT industrial base. Lack of service providers ensuring ICT means maintenance.
- Lack of well-known ICT providers on the domestic market. Isolation from sources of advanced technology development.

### Development of multi-functional web-portal, ensuring single infrastructure of separate information systems integration.

- Application of information infrastructures to improve internal administrative processes, introduction of e-document circulation.

### Incompatibility of different systems and necessity for additional costs for modernization and retuning in case of integration.

- Poor information management, lack of willingness of various agencies to share and exchange information, improper application of confidential information.
- Lack of willingness to implement ICT even to the prejudice of national efforts.

### 2.2. Improvement of legislative basis for implementation of e-government in public administration

The main directions of improving legislation in the area of informational technologies application within public administration are the following:

- Normative regulation of information legal status as a separate object of civil rights, information resources and systems as independent regulation objects.
- Eliminating unjustified normative barriers for activity of citizens and organizations in the area of ICT means development and application, provision of information services.
- Bringing sectoral legislation in line with realities of using advanced technologies of information exchange including international development of Internet as effective multifunctional tool for implementation of various civil-legal relation considering need for e-commerce development including e-purchases of goods (services) for the state needs.

Specific attention should be paid to the following:

1. Framework and specific laws defining the main terms and principles of regulation in the area of information relations are to be reformed. Separate laws require specific attention, in particular on information openness of public administration bodies, on the order of fulfilling information exchange among them, on protection of commercial and official confidentiality.

2. Preliminary control measures (licensing, certification, registration, authorization) need to be revised substantially with an aim to raise effectiveness and avoid unjustified restrictions as a result of their application. They should be applied only in case of impossibility to protect the
rights and interests of actors on the market by other means. Upon improving the system of current control within the course of administrative reform implementation the number of controlling functions should be reduced.

3. Licensing system needs to be deeply revised due to inconsistency to objective needs of the country development. The activities related to provision of information services, ICT means development, production, dissemination and sale should be eliminated from the list of activities to be obligatory licensed in case those ICT means do not belong to the means of state secrets protection and are not produced for utilization at government institutions.

In this regard more rational is voluntary certification confirming compliance of information systems developed for government needs, services (activities) on their application and protection means with the respective standards within the system of purchase and delivery of goods for the state needs.

Voluntary certification system development is possible only through simplifying all related procedures and enhancing authority of certificates provided. Obligatory certification procedure should also be reorganized in order to avoid additional difficulties for applicants. In this regard the law on certification should define principles of unicity of time and location as well as regulations assuming that all agreements necessary for obtaining the certificate and dealing with testing laboratories should be fulfilled by certifying agency.

4. Introduction of amendments into current normative base on obligatory registration and authorization in the area of ICT application should be based on differential approach. Registration of separate entities can be either voluntary or obligatory. Obligatory registration should be applied only in case the need for information on the facilities that are important for the state security as well as the facilities used by public administration bodies and relevant subdivisions. Expiations to the rules (for instance for identifying centers of electronic digital signatures) should be defined by the law. The registration procedure in both cases should be simple to the limit: upon purchasing facilities or their export to the territory of the country the registration should be fulfilled by the seller or customs agency, in case of developing the facility on the territory of Uzbekistan the registration should be based on application with attached documents identifying the facility to be submitted to single registering body. Any permission for purchase and application can be claimed only in case of impossibility to regulate the facility data circulation through certification, licensing or registration.

The procedure of permission delivery should not cause unjustified difficulties for applicants. In case of absence of socially important necessity requirements to obligatory registration or permission delivery regarding certain types of facilities (for example color copy equipment) should be abolished.

5. Regarding foreign trade (customs) regulation of ICT application there should be achieved some compromise between the obligation of the Republic of Uzbekistan in the area of non-proliferation of technologies of military and dual purposes and current ineffective mechanisms of control over information flows under conditions of rapid development of information networks. In this regard the work on renewing current normative base should be focused of the following directions:

• regulation of the legal status of software as commercial product for customs registration (which requires remedial amendments to be introduced into separate acts of customs legislation);

• control over non-proliferation of information with legislatively limited access should be implemented on the territory of the country including though applying responsibility measures to the individuals allowing unapproved dissemination of such information

6. Special attention should be paid to the issues related to adoption of current legislation to the realities of using such modern information exchange technologies as Internet including on the part of e-commerce development. Common approach should not be stipulated by aspiration to initiating adoption of new legislative act in certain cases but introduction of point amendments into current legislative acts. The following issues are the most priority driven requiring urgent
2.3. Main direction of e-government implementation in public administration in Uzbekistan.

ICT introduction into public administration and e-government implementation first of all aims at: (1) raising internal efficiency of public administration performance; (2) reducing costs for maintenance of the government apparatus and increasing efficiency of budget performance as a whole; (3) creating new mechanisms of social and economic activity regulation. More transparent public administration system and raising information openness are becoming the key factors of the state and society development.

The main directions of e-government implementation in Uzbekistan should become the following:

I. Formulation and gradual implementation of comprehensive strategy on ICT introduction and e-government development.
   • Formulation of the national e-government development policy through adopting e-government concept.
   • Elaboration and publication of regular ICT development programmes of public administration bodies considering improved service provision.

II. Enhancing efficiency of internal and interdepartmental interaction through introduction of ICT and e-government elements.
   • Introduction of e-document circulation into activity of public administration bodies and further establishment of integrated interdepartmental databases and information networks.
   • Coordination of record keeping at all government institutions involved, definition of competence of each government establishment (including staff members), toughening responsibility for breaking the discipline. Elaboration and improvement of universal document circulation standards. Improvement of normative-legal base for integration of government services and overcoming interdepartmental barriers.
   • Creation, in perspective, of a single computer network joining all the ministries, departments and government institutions in Tashkent city as well as local governments.
   • Introduction of electronic administrative and official regulations into activity of government agencies. E-regulations may become an effective management tool, means of unification and standardization of separate administrative processes and assist in shaping public authorities base on their functional and operational principle.\(^1\)

III. Increase of information openness of public administration bodies as well as the volume and accessibility of open (for public use) governmental information by using ICT advantages (through Internet).
   • Ensuring openness and transparency of the lawmaking process at all levels.
   • Formulating normative-legal base strictly regulating duties of government institutions on information provision and publication.
   • Legislative definition of available and clear rules of e-interaction of each government institution with citizens and organizations. Developing mechanisms and forms citizens’

---

\(^1\) For more information on the essence and introduction of administrative and official regulations, pls. see research paper prepared by CER “Current condition and main directions of reforming central executive bodies in the Republic of Uzbekistan”, www.cer.uz
requests through the web-site of a public administration body, terms of consideration, baselines for positive and negative response, appeal order. In this regard, it is necessary to introduce amendments and addenda considering specificity of e-interaction to the Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan “On Requests of Citizens” (Annex 8 and 9).

- Formulation and adoption of a normative-legislative act defining the compulsory information available at web-resources of government institutions and processing the procedures of placement at electronic resources (publications and Internet, etc.) as well as the procedures of receiving information by request (Annex 8).

- It is necessary to ensure publicity of procedures related to drafting and discussing blueprints affecting interests of the majority of social segments. Hence it is necessary to adopt a normative-legal act (the most appropriate – law) assuming obligatory consultations with various associations of citizens and legal entities during the decision preparation process and compulsory publicity of those consultations at web-resources of public administration bodies. Adoption of such a document provides ground for developing the system of public expertise of the decisions taken and will assist in avoiding unilateral advantages for separate groups to the prejudice of public interests. For the moment the most appropriate option of governmental web-resource for maintaining public discussions and consultations is www.gov.uz portal. On conditions of launching interactive instrument at the portal it can become the ground for public discussions within the process of drafting governmental decisions.

- Clarifying normative rules related to protection of information (information security).

IV. Allocation of targeted budget financing for ICT development and implementation of E-government projects at public administration bodies.

In order to speed up the process of ICT introduction into public administration performance it is necessary to determine separate item of expenditures for ICT introduction and development within the classification of the state budget expenditures. Moreover the mechanisms of coordination and monitoring of expense should be developed as well in order to reduce unjustified over-expenditure or non-targeted spending of budget funds. The funds allocated by this budget item should be allocated only for ICT projects implementation. Proposals on the draft item of economic classification of ICT expenses and Instructions on application of separate categories and sub-categories of economic classification of the state budget expenditures are attached (Annex 4).

V. Creation of multi-functional governmental web-portal, ensuring unified infrastructure for integration of information systems of various government institutions.

www.gov.uz, governmental portal that has already been launched, can be used for placing general and specific information on the work of the Government. Currently it is necessary to increase the volume of information represented by the portal as well as to development web-sites of other government agencies. It is purposeful to optimize the www.gov.uz portal through more effective information organization. For instance, the web-site of Irish Government is focused on the thematic scope that is interesting for population, not on government agencies performance, in particular how to find job or buy a house, how to obtain driving license or register for participation in elections, thus providing links to the relative web-site of the ministries and agencies.

VI. Creating favorable environment for ICT development in the country directly affects the process of e-government implementation, providing required technological, innovative and human resource basis. The main directions in this area are the following:

(a) Improvement of tax policy related to SMEs operating in the area of ICT is considered as extremely crucial. Flexible tax policy will allow to attract more new actors and investors including foreign ones. Given the necessity of attracting substantial foreign investments this factor can be one the most important.

(b) Liberalization of telecommunication sphere is among other factors can become a powerful tool for speeding up the process of ICT development. This process should be fulfilled
in two directions. On the one hand, undertaking measures towards communication infrastructure liberalization and creating the market fully open for competition, on the other hand – cutting down regulation in the area of telecommunication services, e-commerce and business.

(c) Investing in ICT. ICT development is an expensive process, hence it is reasonable to follow the policy of maximum attraction in the form of direct investment (for establishment of joint ventures, branch establishments and foreign enterprises), portfolio investments, long-term loans and grants. In this respect, ensuring favorable economic climate within separate areas can be very successful through establishing techno-parks and FEA (like the Silicon Valley in the USA) or small industrial areas in technological business-incubators. Convenient engineering and communication infrastructure, specific tax privileges, set of consulting and marketing services allow to create favorable conditions for activity of companies in the area of ICT as well as to attract foreign investors and advanced information technologies. Beneficial geo-political location of Uzbekistan in its turn will allow to make this business export-oriented, which an additional advantage.

(d) Investing scientific research and innovation. Given the fact that the Government strategic objective is creation and development of nation ICT industry it becomes inevitable to formulate strategic concept paper and long-term programme of organizational and financial support to scientific research and experimental activities in the area of software and IT development for domestic and foreign users.

(e) Increasing computer literacy and ICT professionals training. The international experience shows that availability of skilled ICT professional determines strategic capacity of a society. Based on report of EITO experts, in 2003 Europe suffered deficit of 1.7 million ICT professional, and nearly 2.2 million e-commerce professional. In this regard e-education and e-training became priority driven objective for Europe.

It is necessary to emphasize that the key aspect of successful e-government implementation are pilot projects that would ensure to demonstrate e-government advantages based on national experience.

Among pilot projects stimulating introduction of e-government elements in the country the following are at implementation stage:

- Unified automatic information system of the State Customs Committee of the Republic of Uzbekistan;
- National Information system of the State Tax Committee.

Launch of national information system of tax service integrating all sub-divisions across the country would ensure the users provision of required information, normative-legal base and special service rendering. In particular citizens will have access to the full list of documents related to taxation, information on current tax payment as well as on-line services to be utilized by population.

The system launch will allow the following:
- to ensure access to e-forms of tax accounts;
- opportunity to fill e-forms on-line;
- considerably simplify provision of tax accounts;
- to ensure timely receiving of information on amendments in taxation and tax accounts.

The pilot project of Unified automation information system of the State Customs Committee of the Republic of Uzbekistan is currently at implementation stage. The project is

Box 3. Considering this approach we can study the experience of creating Unified electronic information system of foreign trade transactions stipulated by the Decree of the Cabinet of Ministers # 295 of August 20, 2002. the State Customs Committee, the State Tax Committee in association with the Ministry of Finance, the Ministry of Foreign Economic Relations (currently Agency for Foreign Economic Relations), commercial banks and other interested ministries and departments were authorized create Unified electronic information system of foreign trade transactions.

The system was launched in October 2003. its introduction among the State Customs Committee, the Central Bank and the State Tax Committee, Agency for Foreign Economic Relations and authorized banks of the Republic of Uzbekistan substantially simplified procedures related to control over goods passing, contract performance by entrepreneur entities.

This decision initiated creating single interaction system among various government institutions.
aimed at automation of customs agencies through application of advanced information technologies. Launch of this system in pilot regime promotes the process of optimization of internal organizational interaction within the framework of the SCC, improves customs service performance and efficiency of the decisions taken, timely receiving of information, etc. Customs service information system joins all structures, allows to increase efficiency during provision of information on declared goods, filling customs declarations, operational receipt of information to the database of the central government authorities, efficiency of managerial decisions taken by high officials.

One of the projects may be implemented in the nearest future and be really useful is an initiative of e-government implementation in Syrdarya region, resulting from cooperation of UNDP DDI Programme and Khokimiyat of Syrdarya region. The following interrelated objectives are to be achieved within the framework of project implementation: a) launch of the portal of the regional khokimiyat; b) introduction of e-document circulation within the structure of the regional and district khokimiyats. Successful project implementation would allow to reveal critical problems, to define the ways, mechanisms and instruments for creating integrated Internet-portals and optimum introduction of e-document circulation in public administration bodies nationwide.

Considering limited budget funds the main efforts in the area of e-government implementation in Uzbekistan should be focused on the following directions, which even in mid-term perspective will ensure positive effect within interaction of the Government and business.

1. Current projects in the area of e-forms introduction in activity are implemented at the State Customs and Tax Committees. Legal entities have to spend lots of time and resources for interaction with these bodies. Broad introduction of filling and submitting electronic tax declarations would allow to ensure substantial resource saving as well as to reduce man-hours of tax services. Similar effect can be achieved through introduction of electronic customs declarations.

Unified electronic information system of foreign trade transactions launched in October 2003 allowed considerable simplification of interaction among various government institutions involved into regulating foreign trade transactions. Further improvement of this system introducing mechanisms of filling, submitting e-forms of customs declarations and registration of export-import contracts will allow substantial reduction of costs carried out by legal entities. The legislative ground has been already established by adopting the law on electronic digital signature and creating the Republican testing center.

2. Introduction of e-forms of accountability and provision of statistic information within the system of the State Statistics Committee and other relative agencies. Launch and development of web-sites focused on provision of official statistics information will ensure more operative receiving of statistics and other data necessary for legal entities to elaborate and promote business projects. Moreover, currently legal entities have to submit more than 30 forms of statistical reports. Development and introduction of e-forms of statistical reports would allow to reduce costs of both entrepreneurs and government bodies considerably.

2.4. Main stages of e-government implementation in Uzbekistan and approaches to assessment of economic efficiency

Under conditions of tough budget restrictions for ICT and e-government initiatives of the Government there appears strong urgency for assessment of efficiency of certain steps undertaken within the programme.

In this regard it is reasonable to undertake those measures that on the one hand ensure visible results in short-term perspective, and on the other hand are amenable to quantitative assessment. Conducting quantitative assessment is complicated by impossibility to measure all e-government undertakings in quantitative indicators, at the same time unavailability of
indicators to be measured it is impossible to understand the level of efficiency of certain programmes and projects as well as provision of certain public services on-line.

The term “public service” in most cases is defined too broadly and is not fully appropriate for assessment of governmental programmes efficiency. In order to solve this problem on February 12, 2000 the working group coordinating implementation of “e-Europe” programme defined the list of 20 basic services of e-government and two indicators of programme implementation efficiency:

- Index of basic public services (according to the list approved), rendered by the Government through Internet;
- The share citizens and enterprises applying e-government for receiving public services.

**List of basic public services**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Services for population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Income taxes: income statement, submission of tax declarations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Search for job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Social protection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Unemployment benefits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Family allowances</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Medical insurance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Student grants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Passport and driving license registration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Registration of transport means (new, secondhand and imported cars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Submitting documents for construction authorization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Submitting police statement (in case larceny)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Public libraries (including catalogues, reference and search systems)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Registration of birth and marriage certificates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Submitting documents to higher education institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Notification on changing the address of residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Healthcare services (certificates, poles and other medical documents registration, information on available healthcare services in certain medical facilities, registration of patients to reception of a doctor)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Services for business</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Set of social services for employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Tax payments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. VAT payment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Registration of new legal entities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Submission of information to statistics agencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Filling customs declarations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Arranging various authorization documents and licensees for certain types of activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. The state purchases of goods and services</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For more proper control over the process of introduction of e-government services each service has additional characteristics besides the description of the service rendered, particularly the extent of service provision in the Internet. Potentially there are 4 conditions of a service:

**Informational.** In Internet web-sites of respective government agencies there is only information on the service, i.e. no feedback, no forms of requests, only general description of procedures (how to register license, obtain passport, certificate). Contact information can be also represented including the person to be addressed, phone numbers, postal address, operating schedule. By convention it is considered that only 25% of the total volume of activities on service introduction is ensured upon implementation of this information stage.

**Presentational.** At this stage the user has an opportunity to download required forms of e-documents or order paper documents on-line. However there is no personified work with a user, though the search for necessary documents is more simple, constituting 50 % of the total service provision.

**Interactive.** This stage assumes authentication of a user and personified work with
individuals and legal entities. Filling e-forms is carried out in on-line regime, i.e. the process of submitting required documents to obtain authorization/certificate/license and other services is automatized, ensuring 75 % of service provision.

Transaction. This stage assumes more close contact with users, since appearance of financial relations, i.e. using the system the user has an opportunity to pay services (for instance, registration fee) and obtaining subsidies. Therefore at this stage the whole cycle of service provision is automatized (100%) due to integration of e-services of payment systems.

The aforementioned stages are implemented not for all types of services, however each service can be measured by per cent scale from 0 % (the service is not rendered) to 100 % (completion of transaction stage). In case the service does not assume financial transactions, then the scale is respectively normalized. Accordingly we can determine total index of e-government as a ratio of the amount of the point assembled by all services (considering the current introduction stage) to the maximum possible amount. Further this index can be used for assessment of the dynamics of e-government institutions introduction.

### E-government index in European states in 2002.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RATING</th>
<th>SERVICES FOR POPULATION</th>
<th>SERVICES FOR BUSINESS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Income taxes</td>
<td>Search for job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great Britain</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iceland</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Netherlands</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Using this methodology we can assess the level of e-government implementation in transition countries, particularly in Uzbekistan.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RATING</th>
<th>SERVICES FOR POPULATION</th>
<th>SERVICES FOR BUSINESS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Income taxes</td>
<td>Search for job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uzbekistan</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Average e-government index in Uzbekistan is 2.9. The extremely low index testifies...
availability of capacity for increasing efficiency of G2C and G2B interaction through e-government implementation.

The most savings are achieved as a result of cutting down the number of documents to be printed out on paper carriers and hand or mail them to citizens. Moreover, Internet-portals allow to avoid differences in document interpretation and application of various versions of documents in separate institutions.

The other example of raising efficiency of public administration performance as a result of e-government elements introduction is arrangement of interaction between the government officials and citizens through Internet-portal and integrated governmental data-bases. Based on assessment of national experts, each adult in Uzbekistan participates in 5-10 relatively common one- or two-stage transactions (communication cycles with an aim to obtain licenses, certificates, allowances, etc.) with public administration bodies and in 1-3 complicated (3-10 stages with cycles and involvement of government authority). Hence the most prudent assessment of time spent by able-bodied population for interaction with public administration bodies constitutes 160-500 million man-hours per year.\(^\text{13}\)

The time spent by citizens for communication with government institutions as well as the time spent by government officials for information servicing can be reduced by using Internet portals (Figure 1). Accordingly, current labour arrangement would allow to transfer hundreds of thousands of civil servants engaged in ineffective process of information servicing to more useful positions.

---

\(^\text{13}\) The calculations of the national experts are based on the methodology of e-government assessment developed by Transition Economy Institution (RF).
Using Internet-portal citizen will spend about 20 minutes; civil servants will not spend more than 15-20 minutes either.

The portals allow to save time of both citizens and civil servants as effective arrangement of their interaction allows to reduce the number of individual visits to government institutions for solving certain issues, the time spent decreases from 4 hours to 15-20 minutes.

In order to ground general profit and costs balance from using Internet-portal as the key element of e-government the following components should be taken into account:

**Total Cost of Ownership, TCO:**
- Distributed within relative period (3-4 years as a usual) cost of equipment and software licenses as well as activities related to launching technological solution and initial training of authorized staff members;
- Cost of equipment and software servicing including necessary repair, preventive measures, tuning for optimization and regular updating of old versions and means to strengthen system security.

**Reduction of operational costs,** including:
- Cutting down time spent for carrying out standard operations (for civil servants involved in receiving visitors can achieve 75% of working time):
  - information search;
  - preparing certificates, reports, reviews;
  - drafting decisions (including broad justification);
  - telephone talks;
  - reception of visitors;
  - correcting mistakes and analysis of conflicts;
- reduction of costs for office premises, account materials, telephone talks and posting.

**Reduction of budget expenditures for arranging various events:**
- official notifications;
- obligatory dissemination of normative materials;
- re-registration, revised forms of documents to be prepared;
- explanatory and other PR-events aimed at civil support of decisions taken and attitudes of government authorities;
- occasional events on reorganization, movement, shifting the area of competence of an institution.

**Direct economic effect from more favorable conditions for conducting purchases for the state needs and competition –based resource allocation** (cutting down the cost of the resources purchased in separate cases allows to reduce respective costs 1.5-4 times);

**Direct economic effect form raising efficiency of institution performance** (can be measured by increased number of requests processed, taxes collected, better protection of the

---

state interests in certain economic disputes, etc.);

**Indirect economic effect resulted from reduction of time costs of individuals and legal entities** (considering nationwide situation, time costs of individuals and legal entities for communication with government authorities by convention can be compared with the losses of a whole region, when it is excluded from normal business activity and to some extent from social life);

**Indirect economic effect from promoting business development and increasing investment attractiveness of a region.**

Implementation of e-government in Uzbekistan requires definition of certain phases, thus allowing to ensure consistency of events conducted and proper resource provision.

The following stages are proposed as the main stages of e-government introduction:

**Phase 1** – public administration bodies should provide information, search engines within databases and response service to work with requests by e-mail. The problems of a legal status of electronic documents should be solved at this stage. Government bodies proceed to apply local networks, corporative networks and Internet for information receipt and exchange.

*The following objective should be achieved within the framework of Phase 1:*


2. Elaboration of norms and standards of the state e-purchases, conducting e-tenders, standards on unification of databases and information exchange among government authorities, standards on unified system of electronic digital signatures within public administration performance.

3. Definition of an interaction order among government institutions, with legal entities and population under conditions of introducing single e-document circulation system.

4. Development and application of effective system of training and retraining of civil servants based on distance learning.

5. Creation and launch of local information and calculating networks of government agencies.

6. Development of a pilot project aimed at launching corporate network on the basis of one of the local public administration bodies.

7. Development and maintenance of information search databases of government institutions.

8. Establishing systems of e-record keeping and e-document circulation, development and implementation of a pilot project aimed at ensuring e-document circulation between the Cabinet of Ministers and one of the central government bodies.


Costs for achievement of the aforementioned objectives constitute approximately 54.2 billion Uzbek soums, including 22.5 million Uzbek soums for preparation of normative-legal acts to ensure legal ground for ICT introduction in Uzbekistan. The rest funds should be allocated for raising technological readiness.

**Phase 2** – implementation of technical and programme solutions ensuring provision of financial and legal services. Important role should be played by easy-to-use interfaces to

---

15 Расчеты сделаны на основе показателей Программы внедрения электронных технологий в государственное управление на период до 2010 года. Приложение №2.
information systems of public administration bodies, support to opportunities of individual self-
servicing and allocated infrastructures and secure operation. This requires raising security of e-
government infrastructure to be achieved by broader application of such technologies and e-
signatures and smart-cards.

The following objectives should be achieved within the framework of the Phase 2:
1. Introduction of sectoral and departmental standards on development of e-register systems of real estate, transport, goods exchange, population, legal entities, etc.
2. Introduction of e-technologies into election process.
4. Launch of an integrated corporate network of public administration bodies.
5. Introduction of e-document circulation at government institutions assuming application of e-signatures and considering requirements to information security.
7. Connection of the central (republican) public administration bodies (organizations, establishments) to the integrated information network.
8. Shift to e-document circulation while submitting tax accounts by legal entities.

Costs of implementation of Phase 2 constitute approximately 105 billion Uzbek soums.  

Phase 3 – arrangement of interactive interaction of the Government with citizens and business, introduction of various on-line services providing opportunity for citizens to visit governmental portals and fill forms of documents, shift to new technologies and applications ensuring use of interdepartmental information and new services.

The following objectives should be achieved within the framework of the Phase 3:
1. Equipment and re-equipment by advanced hardware devices of public administration bodies.
2. Connection of subdivisions of public administration bodies, local governments, organizations, enterprises and establishments located in regional centers to the integrated information network.
3. Connection of organizations, enterprises and establishments located in various districts to the integrated information network.
4. Preparation of the state register of legal entities based on application of ICT means.
5. Establishment of specialized equipped centers under public administration bodies with access to information systems.

Costs for implementation of Phase 3 constitute approximately 6.1 billion Uzbek soums.

The main negative aspect of e-government implementation in Uzbekistan lies in the fact that all the initiatives are financed by the Government. There are no mechanisms of attracting investments of private sector and foreign companies to implementation of separate directions of this programme. Private sector can invest commercial training centers for civil servants, Internet centers, etc.

UzACI suggests allocating of approximately 725 million Uzbek soums for development and launch of training and retraining system based on distance learning for civil servants and ICT professionals employed by public administration bodies. 332 million Uzbek soums are suggested to be allocated for establishment of properly equipped access centers under government bodies with connection to information systems. Raising incentives for private investors in the aforementioned and other areas would allow to reduce government expenditures within the framework of the state programme on ICT introduction and e-government.

16 Расчеты сделаны на основы показателей Программы внедрения электронных технологий в государственное управление на период до 2010 года. Приложение №2.
17 Расчеты сделаны на основы показателей Программы внедрения электронных технологий в государственное управление на период до 2010 года. Приложение №2.
Moreover implementation of this programme will require, first of all, development of a comprehensive assessment system (indicators) which is currently lacking. The indicator system will provide basis for effective monitoring over spending the budget funds for ICT introduction at public administration bodies.
Conclusion

Under conditions of globalization the government faces necessity to revise its relations with business and citizens. Requirements to efficiency of G2B and G2C interaction are among the most priority driven ones.

ICT is the most advanced and, as proved by the international experience, powerful instrument for raising efficiency of the government.

The main problems within the process of forming e-government in Uzbekistan are currently the following:

1. Lack of informational openness of public administration bodies for society, lack of legislative grounds ensuring large-scale informational interaction among the government, business and citizens.
2. Underdeveloped technical and telecommunication infrastructure for ICT development and e-government implementation.
3. Imperfect mechanism of financing ICT introduction into public administration performance.
4. Incomplete process of elaborating legislative-normative ground for ICT development in the country.

Main recommendations of the report:

1. It is necessary to elaborate legislative basis regulating public administration performance aimed at ensuring transparency, establishing e-mechanisms of G2B and G2C interaction. In this regard it seems reasonable to:
   - Formulate Concept Paper and Strategy of E-Government Development in Uzbekistan;
   - Introduce amendments to the Law “On Requests of Citizens”;
   - Adopt the Decree of the Government “On Information Registries Compulsory for Placement at Web-resources of Public Administration Bodies”;
   - Critical improvement of the governmental portal (www.gov.uz) operation and development of an integrated multifunctional interactive tool of information interaction between the Government, citizens and business based on the current official portal of the Government;
   - Elaboration and introduction of electronic official and administrative regulations based on comprehensive functional analysis of public administration bodies within the framework of administrative reform.

2. It is necessary to revise the mechanisms of financing ICT introduction process into public administration performance. Introduction of a separate expenditure item to the state budget, not less than 1% of total state budget for ICT development, elaboration of a mechanism of coordination and monitoring of costs with an aim to reduce unjustified overspending or non-targeted spending of budget funds by this expense item.

3. Further ICT infrastructure development in the country would require:
   - Amendments and addenda introduced to the Programme on Computerization and Information-Communication Technologies Development for the period of 2002-2010 годы;
   - Ensuring adequate financing for activities within this Programme;
   - Revision of certain target indices of the Programme, in particular: the quantity of ports of data transmission networks, Internet users, coverage of settlements on the part of Internet centers;
   - Reduction of restricting procedures for activity carried out by business structures in the area of telecommunication services provision: licensing, authorization, certification;

4. It is necessary to introduce amendments into current legislation regulating ICT application in various aspects of political, economic life of the country (e-government, e-commerce and e-education). This would require the following:
   - Introducing amendments into normative regulation of a legal status of information as
separate object of civil rights, information resources and information systems – as independent objects under regulation;
• Eliminating unjustified normative barriers for activity of citizens and legal entities in the area of development and application of information technologies, information service provision;
• Bringing sectoral legislation in line with realities of application of advanced technologies of information exchange including e-purchases of goods (services) for the state needs;
• Clarification of normative rules related to information protection;
• Adoption of the Law “On Software Crimes”.

Under current conditions in Uzbekistan e-government, first of all, means improvement of public administration system performance and optimization of interaction mechanism between the Government and business with an aim to reduce pressure on entrepreneurship and cut down transaction costs for business activity, expanding access for entrepreneurs to information and documents of government institutions necessary for business development. In particular, e-government implementation will allow to solve the following problems of public administration system that currently hinder effective promotion of SME development.

First, formulate and improve normative-legal grounds to ensure information openness of public administration bodies through ICT means, thus increasing opportunities of business on the part of timely receipt of information from government agencies (for instance, statistics data, e-forms of tax and statistics accounting, e-forms of customs documents, etc.).

Second, ICT application at public administration bodies will allow maximum reduction of administrative procedures focused on the work with paper data carriers that raises costs both of citizens and legal entities while interacting with government bodies.

Given limited budget resources the main efforts in the area of e-government implementation in Uzbekistan is reasonable to focus of the following directions that in mid-term perspectives would ensure positive results within G2B interaction.

1. Currently implemented projects aimed at introduction of e-forms into the Tax and the Customs Committees’ performance. Legal entities have to spend lots of time and resources for interaction with these bodies. Launch of e-mechanisms of filling and submitting tax declarations will ensure substantial saving of business resources as well as to cut down man-hours of the tax services. The same results can be achieved upon introduction of e-forms of customs declarations.

Unified electronic information system of foreign trade transactions launched in 2003 ensured substantial simplification of interaction between various government agencies involved into the process of foreign transactions regulation. Further improvement of this system through introduction of mechanism of filling and submitting e-forms of customs declarations and registration of export-import contracts would allow to reduce costs of legal entities. Moreover the legislative ground has been already established by adopting the law on electronic digital signature and creating the Republican testing center.

2. Introduction of e-forms of accounting and submitting statistics data within the system of the State Statistics Committee and other respective agencies. In particular, launch and further development of websites focused on provision of statistics data would ensure more adequate receipt of relevant information necessary for elaboration and development of business projects. For the moment legal entities have to submit more than 30 forms of statistical reports. Development and launch of e-forms of statistical reports would ensure substantial reduction of costs both for entrepreneurs and government agencies.

Implementation of administrative reform in Uzbekistan and introduction of e-government elements are interrelated. E-government is a process of transforming traditional government, where e-technologies serve as a tool for this transformation. Experience of other countries shows that e-government implementation is very complicated and expensive undertaking. In case e-government is not a component of a larger programme aimed at transforming government performance in the area of information management, increasing the level of service provision to citizens and private sector, than the time and funds spent will not bring the benefits expected.

In Uzbekistan, at the current stage only the Government can act as initiator of e-government implementation, it should be noted that efficiency of e-government programmes and projects will remain low even under conditions of proper financial and technical provision due to lack of critical measures undertaken within the framework of administrative reform.
Best practices of e-government implementation

Canada

Development and implementation of e-government in Canada has been initiated in 1998. The Project entitled “Government on-line” was supposed to be completed in 2004. The governmental portal was launched by the Secretariat of the Treasury Council and cooperated with 28 other government institutions with an aim to implement the process of transfer to “digital century” by the citizens of Canada.

This initiative is a long-term project aimed at ensuring opportunity for citizens to interact with the Government, receive information, participate in various programmes, use public services and make business by applying information technologies while communicating with government bodies of Canada. For the moment the information on governmental programmes and public services as well as possibility to contact all government institutions of Canada is available through the portal http://www.canada.gc.ca.

By the end of 2004 it is planned to provide all public services on-line. The citizens will have an opportunity to work with applications and fulfill financial transactions safely and in real-time operation mode (on-line). The project is financed by separate phases and for the moment approximately 160 million Canadian dollars have already been allocated for its implementation. This initiative is a component of a broader strategy entitled “Joining Canadians” (initiated in 1998); within its frameworks the legislation and governmental policy were revised with an aim to develop public Internet centers as well as ensuring broadband Internet access for local and rural communities of Canada.

Germany

The project on transfer to e-government in Germany was entitled “Internet for Everyone”. The Project is based on assurance that transition to e-society is successful only if all the citizens will obtain access to advanced information technologies. “Internet for Everyone” Project is one of the main priorities of the Federal Government.

The Project is focused on 10 specific measures, in particular:
1. Computer literacy will become a component of general education;
2. Financing equipping of schools with personal computers;
3. Obtaining driving license through Internet for the unemployed;
4. Strengthened local competition;
5. Tax exemption for private Internet use;
6. E-government development - BundOnline 2005 Initiative. The Initiative is aimed at provision of services of the federal administration through Internet by 2005. BundOnline 2005 Initiative will be implemented under close cooperation with the Ministry of Internal Affairs and other ministries;
7. E-commerce promotion;
8. Raising information security;
9. Self-regulation;
10. Outreach campaign on electronic renewal of Germany.

New Programme entitled “New Education Mode” was launched aimed at software development, application, broad dissemination, high-quality teaching and study.

The Programme was successful, initially 400 million marks were allocated for programme implementation, more than 600 million marks have been spent for the period of 2000-2004.

Another programme is entitled Initiative Germany 21, which is the largest Public Private Partnership in Germany. This economic initiative joins 300 representatives of business, politics and society. The Objective of the Programme is to promote transition of Germany to e-society.

South Korea

The process of country informatization through transfer to e-government has been started in 1987. The National Computarization Programme was developed for the period of 1987-1996. By 1999 the Government adopted Cyber Korea 21 Programme (1999-2002). The Act on E-Government was developed and adopted in 2001.

At the first stage of transition to e-government it was envisaged to ensure keeping governmental
documents in digital format. At the second stage – to ensure application of information technologies at
government institutions. At the third – to integrate the main governmental processes into single service
(“one window” principle). 11 key initiatives on gradual transition to e-government provide ground for
implementation of e-government.

The most critical achievement is adopting “one window” principle – rendering public services through the governmental portal www.egov.go.kr. This portal ensures information support of 4000 types of
public services and provides 393 types of on-line services.

Based on assessments of experts by providing 30% of public services on-line during 5 years, the
Government will save 1.8 trillion wons (1.44 billion USD).

USA

Under term “e-government” Americans assume governmental computer systems assigned for
interaction with population and establishments beyond the structure of the federal government. These
establishments include business, civil society institutions, regional, municipal governments, etc.

In late 1990-s US administration states on the beginning of the process of development of e-society
building programme. In February 1997 the administration raised an initiative on Improvement of
Government Performance based on new technologies. The initiative included set of programmes, in
particular open access to the governmental information.

As a whole the programme covered several directions, each of them assumed synergy and partner
efforts of ministries, departments, universities, private companies and public institutions. As it was initially
planned the programme should result in creation of key elements of new infrastructure by October 2001,
and by October 2003 – launch of e-government (transfer of the main functions of government institutions
to Internet). Most of these objectives have been achieved.

In order to ensure formulation of scientific grounds and long-term information policy development
in 1998 US National Science Academy announced call for proposals on “E-government” aimed at
promoting fundamental and applied research in the area of new information technologies application
within public administration performance. The role of research in defining optimum approaches and stages
of achieving long-term objective of transition to new information economy is emphasized in the
Programme “Open Access to the Governmental Information. Improvement through ICT Application”.

USA gained substantial success in launching governmental Internet-portals, which transform
traditional interaction of citizens and government agencies optimizing the request procedure and promoting
better transparency of government institutions. FirstGov Project (www.firstgov.gov) is a single
governmental Internet-portal was launched in September 2000 having marked to beginning of
implementation of the national programme on transition of US government institutions to new information
technologies.

Broad launch of such portals is aimed at promoting efficiency of public administration performance
based on provision of public services to individuals and private companies “at right time, at right place
through relevant device”.

According to the Law on E-Government there will be established a new E-Government Office
under the office of Management and Budget. The head of a new Office will be appointed directly by the
President.

The blueprint also ensures financing for updating the federal Internet-portal Firstgov.gov, compulsory placement of
information on the work of federal courts at their web-sites, opens access to public information on expenditures of the
federal funds allocated for scientific research and provides better quality of protection of confidential information placed at
governmental networks.

Estonia

Among post-soviet republics most rapid development of
e-government is implemented in Estonia.

The basis of information policy of Estonia is development of priority driven projects aimed at e-citizen and

Box 4.
The Australian Taxation Office (ATO) introduced e-form of tax declarations in 1990, for the moment 75% of all declarations on income are submitted on-line through the portal of the Taxation Office. The portal proposes various facilities, in particular calculator, “smart” forms, feedback, reports of the Taxation Office, etc.

In the nearest future ATO will initiate free distribution of certificates to Australian companies. The programme of electronic accounting provided to companies on CDs considers needs of small enterprises and aimed at assisting them in financial managements and business-planning thus simplifying transition to new tax system.
provision of e-services as well as integration of decisions into unified information systems operating through Internet.

Government bodies place special attention to ICT infrastructure development and services on participation in national e-commerce programmes. The following projects are currently at the stage of elaboration and development: ID-card, digital signature, electronic citizen, TOM Programme (Täna Otsustan Mina – Today I’m taking decisions), electronic tax administration connection of public libraries to Internet, etc.

Within the framework of e-government concept implementation in June 2001 the Government of Estonia created and launched Internet-portal “Today I’m taking decisions”, by using the portal any citizen can participate in decision-taking process, to express his opinion on situation in the country, offer amendments to draft laws, etc. During the last several years an integrated computer database is operating in the country ensuring more effective interaction between public administration bodies and population if Estonia.

Large-scale complex of measures was initiated within the frameworks of implementation of the Laws “On the Governmental Information” and “On Digital Signatures” which ensured launch of document circulation management programme at government agencies.

Moreover the databases of the public sector are currently at the stage of modernization, further on they will be joined into one integrated search system based on Internet technologies. The project aims at speeding up and simplifying data application taken from numerous databases for those who have access right and really need them (X-road Project).

**Russian Federation**

“Electronic Russia” Programme was adopted in Russia for the period of 2002-2010; the coordinating agency is the Ministry of Communications of Russian Federation.

Programme implementation will ensure access to modern information resources to total population of the country and during the nearest 10 years Russia will be able to shift its position on the world high-tech market. The Programme will provide basis for development of Russian society in various aspects. “Electronic Russia” Programme is a document covering the phase of basis (legal, human resource, regulating, technological, etc.) establishment necessary for further activities in the area of shaping new electronic economy and information society.

In the context of e-government “Electronic Russia” Programme defines two main objectives: raising efficiency of public administration performance and movement towards civil society. Raising efficiency of public administration performance should be ensured by the laws elaborated and adopted, high technologies introduced into real sector, personnel training, Internet access and modernization of the government structure as e-government development requires transparency of government bodies and ICT application in mass media.

**Box 5.** Russia is currently implementing preparation of the updated State automatized system “Elections”. The State automatized system of Russian Federation “Elections” is multilevel hierarchic system including complex of automatization means of the Central Election Committee, election committees of regions of Russian Federation, district and territorial election commissions.

For the moment considering the lessons learned the System is under modernization with an aim to expand its operating mode, improve user-friendly interface, increase reliability, simplify automatization facilities administration.
### ICT Indicators in the Republic of Uzbekistan (as of April 1, 2004)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Tashkent city</th>
<th>Tashkent region</th>
<th>Khorezm region</th>
<th>Karakalpakstan</th>
<th>Fergana region</th>
<th>Buhara region</th>
<th>Samarkand region</th>
<th>Sughd region</th>
<th>Namangan region</th>
<th>Navoiy region</th>
<th>Andijan region</th>
<th>Kashkadarya region</th>
<th>Jizzakh region</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Web-site</strong></td>
<td>22/25</td>
<td>0/29</td>
<td>0/10</td>
<td>0/11</td>
<td>3/9</td>
<td>1/10</td>
<td>2/10</td>
<td>1/17</td>
<td>0/10</td>
<td>1/22</td>
<td>3/6</td>
<td>0/12</td>
<td>1/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ICT Programme</strong></td>
<td>17/25</td>
<td>9/29</td>
<td>1/10</td>
<td>3/11</td>
<td>3/9</td>
<td>2/10</td>
<td>1/10</td>
<td>7/17</td>
<td>1/10</td>
<td>7/22</td>
<td>5/6</td>
<td>3/12</td>
<td>1/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Staff number</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administration</td>
<td>3620</td>
<td>253</td>
<td>493</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>490</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>348</td>
<td>786</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>575</td>
<td>1303</td>
<td>451</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total in organization</td>
<td>249930</td>
<td>2568</td>
<td>6893</td>
<td>5725</td>
<td>43700</td>
<td>473</td>
<td>382</td>
<td>12625</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>3823</td>
<td>60195</td>
<td>4514</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Number of PCs</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administration</td>
<td>2893</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>158</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>536</td>
<td>234</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total in organization</td>
<td>13734</td>
<td>1674</td>
<td>377</td>
<td>321</td>
<td>516</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>254</td>
<td>1638</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>780</td>
<td>1459</td>
<td>736</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Number of Internet connected PCs</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administration</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total in organization</td>
<td>842</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>274</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT Unit in organization</td>
<td>16/25</td>
<td>2/29</td>
<td>1/10</td>
<td>3/11</td>
<td>6/9</td>
<td>1/10</td>
<td>3/10</td>
<td>4/17</td>
<td>3/10</td>
<td>5/22</td>
<td>4/6</td>
<td>4/12</td>
<td>0/4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT unit staff number</td>
<td>462</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LAN</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total in organization</td>
<td>15/25</td>
<td>2/29</td>
<td>1/10</td>
<td>2/11</td>
<td>4/9</td>
<td>0/10</td>
<td>4/10</td>
<td>7/17</td>
<td>2/10</td>
<td>6/22</td>
<td>1/6</td>
<td>2/12</td>
<td>2/4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

33
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Administration</th>
<th>MS Word</th>
<th>87</th>
<th>166</th>
<th>104</th>
<th>377</th>
<th>36</th>
<th>170</th>
<th>396</th>
<th>155</th>
<th>326</th>
<th>533</th>
<th>252</th>
<th>48</th>
<th>161</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MS Excel</td>
<td>1451</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>342</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>384</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>322</td>
<td>533</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outlook Exp.</td>
<td>1301</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet</td>
<td>412</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total in</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>organization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MS Word</td>
<td>17381</td>
<td>264</td>
<td>469</td>
<td>386</td>
<td>624</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>284</td>
<td>2708</td>
<td>724</td>
<td>1125</td>
<td>1386</td>
<td>1079</td>
<td></td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MS Excel</td>
<td>13271</td>
<td>206</td>
<td>438</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>569</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>274</td>
<td>1860</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>1066</td>
<td>1380</td>
<td>1052</td>
<td></td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outlook Exp.</td>
<td>9958</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>506</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>136</td>
<td></td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet</td>
<td>1356</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>341</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>474</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>145</td>
<td></td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Current classification of expense items of the state budget for ICT introduction and development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>НН</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>JJ</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Определение</th>
<th>Перечень расходов</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>00</td>
<td>Telephone, telecommunication and information services</td>
<td>Costs for transferring messages by telephone, fax, e-mail, etc., as well as to device installation. Costs for telecommunication services (Reuter, Internet, e-mail, Kamalak TV)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>00</td>
<td>Current repair</td>
<td>Expenditures for current repair of office devices, equipment (including equipment with computer device inside). Expenditures for current repair of all types of computer equipment.</td>
<td>- current repair of office equipment, purchase of spare and component parts; - purchase of materials and devices for current repair of office equipment (including equipment with computer device inside); - current repair of computer equipment (system processor, monitor); - purchase of materials and devices for current repair of all types of computer equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>00</td>
<td>Maintenance, exploitation and other services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>- teaching computer literacy by non-regular staff members</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Maintenance, rent, exploitation and other services</td>
<td>Expenditures for maintenance and technical servicing of office equipment and inventory. All expenditures related to maintenance and technical servicing of computer equipment.</td>
<td>- Expenditures for maintenance of office equipment and inventory; - Expenditures for technical servicing of office equipment and inventory; - Expenditures related to maintenance of computer equipment; - Expenditures for technical servicing of computer equipment; - Expenditures for information-calculation services rendered for educational and scientific objectives; - Payment of services on accounting automatization.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>00</td>
<td>Purchase of equipment, devices and components for current needs, foodstuff</td>
<td>Expenditures for purchase of scientific, training, medical, laboratory, physical training equipment and inventory, the cost of which does not exceed 15 minimum monthly wages. Purchase of equipment, devices, inventory and furniture the cost of which does not exceed 15 minimum monthly wages, and office furniture are</td>
<td>- expenditures for purchasing software, updated versions and introducing modifications; - payment for using databases and services on information processing; - materials and components for copying machines and typewriters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Purchase of equipment, devices, inventory and materials. Purchase of stationerries.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>00</td>
<td>Capital outlays</td>
<td>reflected in 04.1 sub-class as capital outlays</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 04  | 1  | 00 | Purchase of the main capital assets | Purchase of capital assets:
|     |    |    | Purchase of computer and other office equipment, software. Purchase of communication equipment. Purchase of specialized equipment. | Purchase of furniture and inventory the cost of which does not exceed 15 minimum monthly wages. Costs for purchase of computer and other office equipment and software. Costs for purchase of communication equipment. Purchase of specialized equipment.
|     |    |    | Purchase of furniture and inventory the cost of which does not exceed 15 minimum monthly wages. Costs for purchase of computer and other office equipment and software. Costs for purchase of communication equipment. Purchase of specialized equipment. | - purchase of computer equipment (processor, monitor, mouse, keyboard);
|     |    |    |                                    | - purchase of scanners;
|     |    |    |                                    | - purchase of printers;
|     |    |    |                                    | - purchase of LAN cards;
|     |    |    |                                    | - purchase of active LAN equipment;
|     |    |    |                                    | - purchase of passive LAN equipment;
|     |    |    |                                    | - miscellaneous costs for purchase of computer and other office equipment and software;
|     |    |    |                                    | - purchase of communication equipment;
|     |    |    |                                    | - purchase of specialized equipment and instruments |
ANNEX on the draft item of economic classification of ICT expenditures and Instruction on application of certain categories and sub-categories of economic classification of the State budget expenditures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of expenditures</th>
<th>Object</th>
<th>Sub-object</th>
<th>Expenditures</th>
<th>Expenditure group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01</td>
<td>00</td>
<td></td>
<td>Expenditures for information-communication technologies</td>
<td>IV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td>Expenditures for purchase of computer and other equipment and software</td>
<td>IV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td>Expenditures for information services</td>
<td>IV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
<td>Expenditures for repair</td>
<td>IV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
<td>Exploitation expenditures and payment of other services</td>
<td>IV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50</td>
<td></td>
<td>Expenditures for education</td>
<td>IV</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HH</th>
<th>I</th>
<th>JJ</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Expenditures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01</td>
<td>00</td>
<td></td>
<td>Expenditures for information-communication technologies</td>
<td>Expenditures for purchase of computer and other office equipment, and software. Expenditures for purchase of communication equipment. Purchase of specialized equipment.</td>
<td>- purchase of computer equipment (processor, monitor, mouse, keyboard); - purchase of scanners; - purchase of printers; - purchase of LAN cards; - purchase of active LAN equipment; - purchase of passive LAN equipment; - miscellaneous costs for purchase of computer and other office equipment and software; - purchase of communication equipment; - purchase of specialized equipment and instruments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td>Expenditures for purchase of computer and other office equipment, and software</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td>Expenditures for information services</td>
<td>Expenditures for Internet, e-mail and installation, development of information resources.</td>
<td>- costs for Internets and e-mail including their installation; - costs for development of web-sites and information resources, bases and databases; - payment for using databases and services on information processing;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Code</td>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Subcategories</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Expenditures for repair</td>
<td>Expenditures for repair of computer and other office equipment.</td>
<td>- expenditures for repair of office equipment, LAN equipment, purchase of spare parts and components;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Expenditures for repair of all types of hardware.</td>
<td>- purchase of materials and devices for repair of computer networks;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- repair of computer equipment (repair of system processor, monitor, etc.);</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- purchase of materials and devices for repair of all types of computer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>equipment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Exploitation expenditures and payment of</td>
<td>Expenditures for maintenance and technical servicing of office equipment.</td>
<td>- costs for maintenance of office equipment and LAN equipment;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>other services</td>
<td></td>
<td>- costs for technical servicing of office equipment, LAN equipment and</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>computer networks;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- costs related to maintenance of hardware;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- costs for technical servicing of hardware</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65</td>
<td>Expenditures for education</td>
<td>Expenditure for teaching computer literacy.</td>
<td>- teaching computer literacy and office applications;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Expenditures for education. Training and retraining how to work with office applications</td>
<td>- teaching Internet and e-mail;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>and software products.</td>
<td>- training how to work with new software products.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives of administrative reform</td>
<td>e-government initiatives</td>
<td>Expected outputs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decentralization of the current administration system **</td>
<td>Development of governmental e-databases with remote access (Internet).</td>
<td>Optimization of information exchange among various public administration bodies and levels. Facilitating access of various levels of public administration bodies to the governmental information. Improvement of government performance through the launch of integrated systems of information collecting and assembling and abolition of useless ones. Facilitating public service provision to individuals and business, reduction of costs on fulfilling these procedures. Optimization of budget expenditures for management and reduction of operation costs including cutting down time costs for performing standard operations related to information search, preparation of references, reports, reviews and decision-taking (including detailed justification).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increasing the level of competence, efficiency and responsibility of public administration bodies (both central and local).</td>
<td>Introduction of e-document circulation systems.</td>
<td>Increase of the quality of document preparation, strengthening executive discipline, establishing order in record keeping, speeding up information exchange among institutions, reduction of mistakes and abuse when working with individuals and enterprises. Direct economic effect from increasing efficiency of institution performance can be reflected in increased number of requests processed, better tax collection, etc. other costs will be reduced as well, in particular expenditures for telephone talks and facsimile services, office premises, account materials and posting. Time for visitors receipt can be reduced as well. Indirect economic effect from reduction of time costs spent by civil servants.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Launch of the system of governmental e-purchase of goods and services.</td>
<td>Direct economic effect from more beneficial conditions for conducting purchases for the state needs and competition based resource allocation. Cutting down cost of resources purchased and reduction of budget expenditures. Fewer opportunities for corruption and other abuse.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discussion of draft governmental decisions and programmes on Internet-forums.</td>
<td>Increased capacity of the government to respond properly to requests and needs of the society through involvement of citizens into governance process. Reduction o costs for explanatory and other PR-events aimed at support of decisions and attitude of the government bodies by citizens.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Smart-card introduction.</td>
<td>Opportunity to conduct elections and polls through Internet or other networks. Development of new mechanisms of public opinion analysis. E-commerce development, fostering development of baking services.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduction of government interference into activity carried out by legal entities.</td>
<td>Filling of e-forms, requests, submitting reports, payment of public services, etc. in on-line regime.</td>
<td>Improvement of government performance through launch of integrated systems of information collecting and assembling and abolition of useless ones. Facilitating public service provision to citizens and business, reduction of costs related to fulfilling these procedures.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensuring more transparency of administrative system at all levels.</td>
<td>Arrangement of requests receipt, appeals and claims of citizens via e-mail, launch of e-services of document delivery.</td>
<td>More operative response to requests and needs of society. Reduction of opportunities for corruption and other abuse. Cutting down budget expenditures for official notifications and obligatory dissemination of normative materials.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of integrated governmental portals. Placement of maximum public information on governmental web-sites for individuals and business, including updated normative-legal base; lessons learned – passing of certain administrative procedures by individuals and business; contact information of high government officials and government institutions, etc.</td>
<td>Integration of resources of public administration bodies into single portal allows the following: More clear and objective information on the volume of services rendered, to involve citizens and organizations under condition of interactivity into active work on support to the course, initiatives and programmes of the Government; to ensure transparent, permanent and operative interaction of a government body with legal entities, possible substantial saving of time and funds both by legal entities and government bodies. The portal allows practical implementation of a “single window” concept for solution of wide range of issues in the area of regulating economic activity (registration, taxes, licensing, subsidies, etc.); ensures optimization of interaction among government bodies when solving both everyday and complicated operative issues. Creating conditions for facilitating access to governmental information for individuals and business, reduction of time costs of individuals, legal entities and civil servants. Overcoming interdepartmental barriers.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* the Matrix reflects only the main positive outputs that may be achieved within the framework of administrative reform through using e-government applications and tools. It is also rather difficult to distinguish objectives of administrative reform and e-government tools that may promote their achievement, as the same e-government tools can make positive effect on several directions of administrative reform at the same time.

** - decentralization of the current administration system requires political decision on ensuring more authorities to lower levels of governance. E-government by itself cannot ensure decentralization of the system.
Comparative table (synopsis) to the draft Law

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Current edition</th>
<th>Proposed edition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>I. The Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan On Requests of Citizens</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 4. Forms of Requests of citizens</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens submit requests in verbal or written form. Verbal and written requests are equipollent.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Requests of citizens can be individual and collective.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 4. Forms of Requests of citizens</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens submit requests in verbal or written form. Verbal and written requests are equipollent. Requests submitted in the form of electronic document confirmed by electronic digital signature equate with written requests.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Requests of citizens can be individual and collective.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>II. The Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan on Joint Stock Companies and Protection of the Rights of Stakeholders</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 35. Distribution (sale) of shares</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distribution (sale) of private shares is fulfilled according to the order defined by the legislation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upon transforming the state enterprise into joint stock company initial and further distribution of shares owned by the state is fulfilled by the relevant body authorized to manage the state property.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The body authorized to manage the state property publishes information on the sale of shares owned by the state in mass media.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 35. Distribution (sale) of shares</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distribution (sale) of private shares is fulfilled according to the order defined by the legislation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upon transforming the state enterprise into joint stock company initial and further distribution of shares owned by the state is fulfilled by the relevant body authorized to manage the state property.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The body authorized to manage the state property publishes information on the sale of shares owned by the state in mass media and (or) electronic information-reference systems including Internet.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 108. Obligatory publication of information by joint stock company</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public company on annual bases must publish the following information in mass media:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>annual report, balance sheet, profit and loss account;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>prospect of share emission;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>information on conducting general meeting of stakeholders according to the order defined by current legislation;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lists of affiliated persons of the company reflecting the quantity and types of shares owned by them;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>other information defined by the authorized government body.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The company including private limited companies in case of public issue of bonds or securities must publish the information according to the volume and order defined by the authorized government body.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unjustified rejection to publish the aforementioned data defined by current legislation by mass media is not admitted.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 108. Obligatory publication of information by joint stock company</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public company on annual bases must publish the following information in mass media and (or) electronic information-reference systems including Internet:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>annual report, balance sheet, profit and loss account;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>prospect of share emission;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>information on conducting general meeting of stakeholders according to the order defined by current legislation;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lists of affiliated persons of the company reflecting the quantity and types of shares owned by them;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>other information defined by the authorized government body.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The company including private limited companies in case of public issue of bonds or securities must publish the information according to the volume and order defined by the authorized government body.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unjustified rejection to publish the aforementioned data defined by current legislation by mass media is not admitted.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>III. The Civil Code of the Republic of Uzbekistan</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 44. The state registration of legal entities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A legal entity is a subject to the state registration according to</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A legal entity is a subject to the state registration according to the order defined by legislation. The data of the state registration are included into single state register of legal entities open for public use.

Violation of the order of establishing legal entities defined by the law or discrepancy of constituent documents result in denial of the registration of a legal entity. Denial of registration based on inexpediency of establishment of a legal entity is not admissible.

Denial of the state registration and breach of registration timeframe are subjects to appeal in the court.

Legal entity is considered established from the moment of the state registration.

Legal entity is a subject to re-registration only in cases defined by the legislation.

---


**Article 7. provision of access to information**

Government bodies, self-government bodies of citizens, public associations, enterprises, establishments, organizations and government officials must provide opportunity for everyone to familiarize with legislative acts as well as documents, decisions and other materials in the area of one’s rights and legal interests. Access to information is provided through publishing and disseminating legislative acts and relevant materials.

Information on activity of Oliy Majlis of the Republic of Uzbekistan and its chambers, of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan, of the Cabinet of Ministers, of judicial bodies, of the prosecutors’ offices, of public and economic administration bodies, of government authorities is a subject to obligatory publication and dissemination according to the order defined correspondingly by Oliy Majlis of the Republic of Uzbekistan on the part of its performance, activity of its chambers and judicial bodies, by the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan – on the part of activity carried out by the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan, activity carried out by the Cabinet of Ministers and prosecutors’ offices, by the Cabinet of Ministers – on the part of public and economic administration bodies, local governments.

---


**Article 16. Submitting draft for reference**

A draft can be submitted by the body responsible for its development for reference of interested government bodies and public associations as well as scientific establishments and education institutions to provide their comments and proposals.

The proposals and comments provided during the preliminary discussion or stated in references are considered and summarized during the further work on the draft.
the preliminary discussion or stated in references are considered and summarized during the further work on the draft.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VI. The Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan of December 14, 2000 On normative-legal acts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Article 16. Study of the practice of normative-legal act application and public opinion during drafting a normative-legal act</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| During the drafting a normative-legal act the responsible body:  
| studies and considers the practice of respective legislation application, reveals public necessity in legal regulation, reasons and conditions affecting legislation efficiency;  
| summarizes and utilizes proposals of government bodies, self-government bodies of citizens, enterprises, establishments, organizations and public associations as well as individuals, materials published in mass media, recommendations of scientific establishments, scientists and experts, data provided by other means of public opinion detection;  
| considers best practices of legal regulation in other states.  
| Draft laws can be submitted for public discussion according to the order defined by the legislation. Drafts of other normative-legal acts can be submitted for public or professional discussion. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Article 14. Publication of draft laws for public discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Draft laws for public discussion are published in the newspapers “Halk Suzi”, “Narodnoe slovo” not later than 10 days after taking the decision on submitting the draft for public discussion. Drafts can be also published in specialized publications, other mass media and Internet.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annex 7.
Draft

The Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan

On introducing amendments and addenda to separate legislative acts of the Republic of Uzbekistan

Oliy Majlis of the Republic of Uzbekistan enacts:

To introduce amendments and addenda into the following legislative acts of the Republic of Uzbekistan:

I. Article 4, part one of the Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan of May 6, 1994 On Requests of Citizens in new edition of December 13, 2002 to supplement with the following sentence:
Requests submitted in electronic form and confirmed by electronic digital signature are equal to requests submitted in written form.

II. To the Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan of April 26, 1996 On Joint Stock Companies and Protection of the Rights of Stakeholders:

1. Article 35, part three after word “information” to supplement with words “and (or) in electronic information-reference systems including Internet”.

2. Article 108, part one, paragraph one to state in the following edition:
Public company on annual bases must publish the following information in mass media and (or) electronic information-reference systems including Internet:

III. Article 44, part one of the Civil Code of the Republic of Uzbekistan, approved by the Laws of the Republic of Uzbekistan of December 21, 1995 and August 29, 1996 to supplement with the following sentence:
Information on registration of legal entities is subject to publication in mass media and (or) electronic information-reference systems including Internet.

IV. Article 7 of the Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan of April 24, 1997 On Guarantees and Freedom of Access to Information to supplement with the following:
Information on activity of Oliy Majlis of the Republic of Uzbekistan and its chambers, of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan, of the Cabinet of Ministers, of judicial bodies, of the prosecutors’ offices, of public and economic administration bodies, of government authorities is a subject to obligatory publication and dissemination according to the order defined correspondingly by Oliy Majlis of the Republic of Uzbekistan on the part of its performance, activity of its chambers and judicial bodies, by the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan – on the part of activity carried out by the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan, activity carried out by the Cabinet of Ministers and prosecutors’ offices, by the Cabinet of Ministers – on the part of public and economic administration bodies, local governments.

V. Article 16m part one of the Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan of August 30, 1997 On Development of legislative acts of the Republic of Uzbekistan to supplement with the following sentence:
Reference to the draft can be also received through its publication by the body responsible for draft development in open to public use Internet resources.

VI. To the Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan of December 14, 2000 *On Normative-Legal Acts*:

1. **Article 16, part two** to supplement with the following sentence: Drafts of normative-legal acts submitted for public discussion are subjects to placement in Internet.

2. **Article 24, part four** after word “systems” to add words “and Internet”.

VII. Article 14 of the Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan of December 14, 2000 *On Public Discussion of Draft Laws* to add words “and Internet”.
Decree of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan

«___» ___________ 2004 #___

ON ENSURING ACCESS TO INFORMATION ON ACTIVITY OF PUBLIC AND ECONOMIC ADMINISTRATION BODIES OF THE REPUBLIC OF UZBEKISTAN

In accordance with the Laws of the Republic of Uzbekistan “On Guarantees and Freedom of Access to Information” and “On Informatization”, as well as with an aim to ensure observance of rights of citizens and organizations for access to information on activity carried out by the Government of the Republic of Uzbekistan, public and economic administration bodies the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan enacts the following:

1. To approve the volume of information on activity of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan, public and economic administration bodies obligatory for placement in public information resource in compliance with the Annex.

2. Public and economic administration bodies of the Republic of Uzbekistan are to:
   - ensure access for individuals and organizations to information on performance of public and economic administration bodies excluding information defined as information with limited access through launching information resources in accordance with the list approved by the current Decree;
   - timely and regularly place the defined information at public information resources including Internet;
   - ensure regular dissemination of information among citizens and organizations on performance of public and economic administration bodies by other means determined by legislation of the Republic of Uzbekistan.

3. The Steering Committee on computerization and information-communication technologies development in association with the Office of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan, Uzbek Agency for Communications and Informatization, Uzbek Agency of Press and Information, other interested ministries and agencies:
   - to develop and approve plan of activities on ensuring access to information on performance of the Cabinet of Ministers and public and economic administration bodies if the Republic of Uzbekistan within a week term in compliance with points 1 and 2 of the current Decree;
   - within two-month term to submit for consideration of information on activity carried out by local public administration bodies obligatory for placement at public information resources.

4. To determine that financing of activities defined by the current Decree is provided by the state budget funds allocated for current maintenance of public and economic administration bodies and other funds not prohibited by the legislation.

5. To define Uzbek Agency for Communications and Informatization and Uzbek Agency of Press and Information as responsible bodies for generation and utilization of the state information resources.

6. To recommend self-governance bodies of citizens to undertake measures towards ensuring access for individuals and organizations to information on their activity considering the current Decree.
7. To entrust A.N. Aripov, Deputy Prime-Minister of the Republic of Uzbekistan, with control over fulfillment of the current Decree.

Chairman of the Cabinet of Ministers
Information of performance of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan, public and economic administration bodies of the Republic of Uzbekistan obligatory for placement at public information resources, including Internet

I. Information on performance of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan

1. Legislative acts, decrees of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan and other normative-legal acts providing legal basis for performance of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan, including the following:
   - Regulations of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan;
   - Decree on the Office of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan.
2. Normative-legal or other acts of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan, including the following:
   - on introducing amendments and addenda into normative-legal acts of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan;
   - on admission of invalid normative-legal acts of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan.
3. Information on decisions of courts on admission of invalidity of acts of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan.
4. Information on composition, objectives and performance of the steering and advisory bodies established by the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan.
5. General information on targeted programmes adopted by the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan (title, overall goal, main objectives, contractors, leading executors, volume of financing, timeframe, expected outputs).
6. Information law-making activity of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan:
   - plans of law-making initiatives of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan and information on their fulfillment;
   - draft laws submitted by the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan to Oliy Majlis of the Republic of Uzbekistan;
   - conclusions of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan on draft laws;
   - official references of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan to draft laws considered by Oliy Majlis of the Republic of Uzbekistan;
   - amendments to draft laws;
   - texts of draft laws considered by the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan and submitted for public discussion.
8. Information on official visits and working trips of the Prime Minister of the Republic of Uzbekistan and members of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan as well as governmental delegations.
9. Information on activities fulfilled within the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan (meetings, press-conferences, sessions, seminars, briefings, “round tables”) and other information on every-day activity of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan.
10. Texts of official statements and speeches of the Prime Minister of the Republic of Uzbekistan and members of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan.
11. Agenda of the meeting of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan and information on materials relative to the meeting of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan and its results.

12. Information on decisions taken during the meeting of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan and their fulfillment.

13. Information on interaction of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan with other public administration bodies of the Republic of Uzbekistan, public associations, political parties, professional associations and other organizations including international ones.

14. Lists and texts of international treaties and agreements of the Republic of Uzbekistan signed by the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan.

15. Information on the main indicators of socio-economic development of the Republic of Uzbekistan and performance of the state budget.

16. Reviews of requests submitted by individuals and organizations to the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan, summary on results of consideration of the requests submitted and on measures undertaken.

17. Information on the Prime Minister and members of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan, heads of public and economic administration bodies, heads of structural departments of the Office of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan as well as heads of organizations and bodies established under the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan (names, last names, middle names, and upon approval of the aforementioned persons – personal history).

18. Information on objectives and functions of structural departments of the Office of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan, organizations and bodies established under the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan.

19. Telephone numbers and address (postal address, e-mail, etc.) of departments of the Office of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan working with requests of citizens, information on the procedures, telephone numbers of the reference service.

II. Information on performance of public and economic administration bodies

20. Legislative acts, decrees of the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan, acts of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan and other normative-legal acts regulating activity of a public and economic administration body and defining objectives, functions, rights, duties and responsibilities of a public and economic administration body and its territorial subdivisions.

21. Acts (decrees, orders, instructions, regulations, etc.) of public and economic administration bodies, including the following:
   on introducing amendments and addenda into acts of a public and economic administration body;
   on admission of invalidity of acts adopted a public and economic administration body.

22. Information on the decisions of the courts on admission on invalidity of the acts of a public and economic administration body.

23. Information on the state registration by the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Uzbekistan the normative-legal acts of a public and economic administration body in cases determined by the legislation of the Republic of Uzbekistan.

24. Information – subject to publication in accordance with the legislation (data of registers, etc.).

25. Procedures of a public and economic administration body, its territorial subdivisions and dependent organizations on ensuring observance of the rights, freedoms and legal interests of the citizens determined by the legislation of the Republic of Uzbekistan.

26. Information on implementation of targeted programmes, where a public and economic administration body acts as a contractor or executor.
27. Information on official visits and working trips of the heads and official delegations of public and economic administration bodies.

28. Information on official events conducted by a public and economic administration body and its territorial subdivisions (meetings, briefings, seminars, “round tables”, etc.).

29. Texts of official speeches and statements made by the heads and deputy heads of a public and economic administration body and its territorial subdivisions.

30. Lists and substantial terms of treaties of civil-legal character signed by a public and economic administration body with organizations.

31. Information on international treaties and agreements which implementation assumes participation of a public and economic administration body.

32. Information on draft laws and other normative-legal acts, targeted programmes and concepts elaborated by a public and economic administration body. Texts of the aforementioned drafts in case they have been submitted for public discussion for comments and references.

33. Analytical reports and information reviews on performance of a public and economic administration body.

34. Information on interaction of a public and economic administration body, its territorial subdivisions and dependent organizations with other government institutions of the Republic of Uzbekistan, public associations, political parties, professional associations and other organizations, including international ones.

35. Reviews of requests submitted by individuals and organizations to a public and economic administration body, summary on results of consideration of the requests submitted and on measures undertaken.

36. Information on the main indicators reflecting situation under the jurisdiction of a public and economic administration body, and development dynamics.

37. Forecasts prepared by a public and economic administration body, its territorial subdivisions and dependent organizations in accordance with their competence.

38. Official statistics collected and processed by a public and economic administration body and its territorial subdivisions.

39. Information on open competitions, auctions, tenders, expertise and other events arranged by a public and economic administration body, its territorial subdivisions and dependent organizations, including:
   - terms and conditions;
   - procedures of participation of individuals and legal entities;
   - composition of competition commissions established by a public and economic administration body, its territorial subdivisions and dependent organizations for conducting tenders for goods delivery (services provision, work fulfillment) for the state needs;
   - the minutes of the meetings of competition commissions;
   - the procedure of appeal of decisions taken by a public and economic administration body, its territorial subdivisions and dependent organizations.

40. Forms of requests accepted by a public and economic administration body, its territorial subdivision for consideration in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Uzbekistan, including with normative-legal acts of a public and economic administration body.

41. List of public information resources and databases under the jurisdiction of a public and economic administration body, its territorial subdivisions and dependent organizations as well as lists of information resources and services provided to individuals and organizations.

42. Information on performance of the state budget by a public and economic administration body.

43. Information on allocation of foreign technical aid provided within the frameworks of separate projects, implemented with participation of a public and economic administration body.

44. Information on the results of inspections fulfilled by public and economic administration bodies, territorial subdivisions and dependent organizations under their jurisdiction and inspections conducted within these bodies and organizations.
45. Information on situation in the area of protection of population and territories from emergencies and on measures undertaken with an aim to ensure their security, on forecasted and occurred emergency situations, on the ways and methods of population protection, and other information – subject to dissemination among individuals and organizations by a public and economic administration body in accordance with the laws.

46. Information on the heads of a public and economic administration body, its structural subdivisions, foreign representatives, territorial bodies and dependent organizations (last names, names, middle names, and upon approval of the aforementioned persons – personal history).

47. The structure of a public and economic administration body, objectives and functions of its structural subdivisions, telephone numbers of reference service and address (postal address, e-mail, etc.) of a federal executive body, its structural subdivisions and dependent organizations.

48. Information on dependent organizations of a public and economic administration body (list of organizations, postal and legal addresses, telephone numbers, information on establishment, reorganization and liquidation, the main indicators of their performances).

49. Telephone numbers and address (postal address, e-mail, etc.) of departments of a public and economic administration body, its territorial subdivisions and dependent organizations working with requests of citizens, information on their procedures.

50. List of foreign representative offices of a public and economic administration body, telephone numbers and address (postal address, e-mail, etc.).

51. Information on participation of a public and economic administration body in implementation of international treaties of the Republic of Uzbekistan, interdepartmental international agreements and international cooperation programmes.

52. List of international organizations attracting a public and economic administration body during implementation of its programmes and projects.

Note. Normative-legal acts assumed by the current list are placed at public information resources in accordance with the requirements of the Regulations on the procedure of dissemination of normative-legal acts approved be the Decree of the Cabinet of Ministers of August 5, 2000, #304.