Public Administration Education in Estonia

by

Dr. Tiina Randma
University of Tartu

September 1999

---

1 The author is grateful to Mr. Siim Läänelaid for gathering data in 1998, and to Ms. Leno Saarniit for updating data in 1999.
1. Historical Background

A. The Estonian civil service

In Estonia, it is not possible to talk about deep historical traditions of the state and the gradual emergence of modern forms of government. The historical development of the Estonian civil service has meant for centuries the dominance of the civil services of the states occupying Estonia. The exceptions are the two periods of independent statehood, 1918-40 and 1991 to the present.

From the beginning of the 13th century, political power in Estonia belonged to the German crusaders and the King of Denmark. In the wars of the 16th century, Estonian territory was divided between Denmark, Sweden, Russia and Poland. In the 17th century, the King of Sweden ruled Estonia and, in 1710, Estonia was incorporated into the Russian Empire. Civil servants of that time were elected according to their loyalty to the ruling power. However, the privileged position that the German nobles had occupied since the 13th century was also recognised by the Russian state and, thus, further solidified. Until 1918, power at local level in Estonia was implemented by the German nobility. The administrative and judicial power in self-government was also exercised by the German oligarchy. Despite a ‘period of national awakening’, from 1860 to 1885, the official language for government offices was German until the 1880s, and Russian from the 1880s until the rise of the Republic of Estonia in 1918. Consequently, there was no justification for speaking about Estonian public servants as a self-identified social and professional group.

The independent Republic of Estonia was proclaimed by the Estonian Representative Assembly in 1918. According to the Constitution adopted in 1920, Estonia was a democratic parliamentary republic. All German or Russian legal acts which were not changed by new laws remained in force. Some continuity was ensured in the civil service as well. The development of the civil service during the first Republic was dominated by a highly legalistic approach, which was understandable since the civil service had to be established for a new state. Civil servants enjoyed public support which expected lawfulness, social guarantees, competitive salaries and promotional opportunities. Although a number of career principles were involved, the civil service system was open. It was possible for anybody aged over twenty with primary education to enter the civil service, even at the top ranks.

The Republic of Estonia was occupied by and annexed to the Soviet Union in 1940. The state institutions that had been established by the first Republic of Estonia were replaced by new ones compatible with Communist ideology and Soviet bureaucracy. During the Soviet period, the civil service was not ‘professional’ in that it did not depend on specialised training and competence, and did not operate in accordance with high ethical standards. The professional ethics of bureaucrats was equated with commitment to the Communist ideology and the main form of in-service training was party-political training. The civil service under the Communist regime was composed of people who entered at an early age at relatively low levels in the hierarchy and spent their working lives in the civil service. Open competitions and competitive examinations were completely unknown. Formal education of basically any field of a university, technical or pedagogical institute enabled graduates to enter the civil service at higher ranks, which was a crucially important advantage because promotion opportunities were limited and depended largely on seniority. However, a number of officials with only elementary or secondary education also managed to work their way up to the top.
through civil service ranks.

In general, job security was very strong under the Soviet system: people had no fear of losing their jobs and becoming unemployed. Communist ideology also did not encourage mobility between jobs and employers, it was usual for people to have lifetime employment with just one employer. It was almost impossible to fire an official because of poor performance. Performance appraisal was merely symbolic and was based mainly on the assessment of ideological matters. Altogether, there were no incentives for in-service training and self-education, as professional qualifications did not often matter in promotion, salary allocations etc. The civil service system offered a clear example of a patronage system with no regard for merit principles. Merit principles were absent from the civil service until the beginning of the 1990s. All these factors of Soviet bureaucracy and administrative culture have caused many of the problems that the Estonian civil service is facing at present.

On 20 August 1991, Estonia declared her independence from the Soviet Union, marking the end of 50 years of Soviet occupation. It was necessary to build up the state, its legal, political and economic structures virtually from scratch. There was (and still is) the need for restructuring and downsizing the old structures on the one hand, and for creating the new structures required by an independent state. In this respect, the development was different from that in Central and Eastern European countries which already possessed the attributes of independent statehood. In addition to the fundamental reshaping of political and economic institutions, the new government had to reform the administrative apparatus itself. However, while facilitating reforms in other sectors, the Estonian civil service itself has remained systemically unreformed. By the end of the 1990s, it is evident that the development of the civil service is far behind the economic reforms initiated, and it may act as a brake on continuing economic reforms, further stabilisation and joining the European Union.

Tremendous changes have occurred not only in the laws and structures governing the Estonian civil service but also in its personnel. Estonia had 24,000 civil servants in 1997, and the number has steadily increased despite the intentions of the government to reduce it. Officials have left the service, and new staff have been recruited during the reorganisation of ministries, and due to political changes. Labour turnover in the civil service was high especially in 1992-93. According to State Chancellery, labour turnover has been 10-20% a year in 1997-99. At the same time, the number of young officials has grown rapidly. Titma et al. (1998, p. 126) claim that less than half of those employed by the government in 1992 remained in the same occupation in 1997. However, neither the remaining civil servants from the Soviet past nor the incoming officials have been able to develop professionalism and the other qualifications required from a contemporary civil service. The Soviet civil service experience turned out to be of no use whatsoever, and conflicted with the needs of a contemporary civil service. Tallo (1995, p. 127) argues that, for incoming top civil servants, trust was more important than competence, and most of the higher civil service appointments were made not according to a scale of competence but on the basis of party loyalty.

When the Public Service Act came into force on 1 January 1996, everybody employed by central and local government agencies automatically received the status of civil servants, without passing any examinations or assessment. Consequently, Public Service Act has more impact on newcomers to the civil service than existing civil servants. However, Public Service Act is a significant landmark in the history of the Estonian civil service, despite its shortcomings. It determines the abolition of the patronage system and the introduction of recruitment and promotion on merit, competitive examinations, salary scales, regular
appraisal and common grading throughout the civil service. The civil service is based on the principles of a position system with a few elements drawn from a career system. The Public Service Act leaves recruitment open for all posts in the civil service, the senior civil service included. Serving officials are not given an advantage in competition for vacancies, but they are welcome to apply. Open competitions for senior positions are mandatorily announced in Riigi Teataja (a collection of legal acts which are openly available), and often in daily newspapers.

Personnel management in the civil service is, to a large degree, decentralised in Estonia. However, senior civil servants are appointed, evaluated and promoted centrally through the Competition and Evaluation Committee of Higher Public Servants at the State Chancellery. Other than that, every ministry and executive agency is responsible for the recruitment, promotion, training, performance appraisal and work organisation of their officials. Civil servants are recruited on a permanent basis as a rule; fixed-term contracts are used for temporary staff only. Job security is high, dismissal is very unusual and puts enormous financial pressure on ministries. However, the civil service commands low prestige, and the level of remuneration of professionals is not competitive with salaries in the private sector. Therefore, it is difficult to fill vacancies with highly qualified staff.

B. Education in Public Administration

History of education in Public Administration (PA) is related to broader developmental issues of Estonian universities. Throughout this paper, the following institutions of higher education are examined:

- University of Tartu
- Tallinn Technical University
- Tallinn University of Educational Sciences
- Estonian Business School

The previous list includes all institutions which provide PA education at least on Bachelor’s level. In addition, Public Administration is taught at a diploma level in Tallinn Baccalaureate School and at the Academy of Internal Defence. Besides that, there are more than 200 training institutes which provide in-service training courses in PA.

The history of PA education is based on the history of the University of Tartu, the only classical universitas in Estonia. The University of Tartu was founded by the decree of the will of the Swedish King Gustav Adolf in 1632, then under the name of Dorpat. It was his wish, pointed out by the Governor of Swedish Estonia, to create a university “where students would be prepared seriously and solidly to that they could be useful for God and Man”. This included educating of professional civil servants, and so they were until 1710 when, on the impact of the Great Northern War, the University was closed down. She was reopened in 1802 under the rule of the Russian emperor Alexander I. The Czar expressed his will to create a university where civil servants for the needs of all regions of Russia would be educated. The high time for Dorpat was the middle of the 19th century, when such well-known scholars in Public Administration fields as Wilhelm Stieda, Karl Bücher, Wilhelm Lexis and Adolph Wagner worked for this university.

A new beginning was made with the establishment of the Estonian Republic in 1918. Almost all civil servants of Estonia from 1918 until 1940 graduated from the University of
Tartu - there was the general idea that a state had to be led by professionals. In the late 1930s, the Institute of State Officials was founded by professor of Administrative Law A. T. Kliimann, but this institution was again closed down in 1940 due to the Russian occupation. During the period of occupation, all social sciences were severely underdeveloped and PA education did not exist in Estonia. Civil servants, by large, had higher education of various fields from veterinary to physics.

The question of educating civil servants came up again in 1992. Then it was very soon realised by academics ‘where the shoe pinches’ - that a well-functioning state needs competent civil servants. Thus a special programme for educating civil servants was established step by step at the University of Tartu, first within an interdisciplinary School of Social Sciences, which was mostly composed by Western and qualified Estonian academics from abroad. The Chair of Public Administration was refounded in 1995 and the first group of BA students graduated in 1996.

Although the predecessor of Tallinn Technical University (then called Technical Special Unit) was already founded in 1918, and Tallinn University of Educational Sciences (then called Tallinn Training College) in 1919, these institutions did not demonstrate interest in educating civil servants until 1994. Influenced by the change of rule in Estonia, the Faculty of Humanities was opened in 1991 at Tallinn Technical University. A few years later, Faculty of Social Sciences was founded at Tallinn University of Educational Sciences. A joint PA programme of Tallinn Technical University and Tallinn University of Educational Sciences was established in 1994, when these two universities signed a contract of co-operation. This was the first time in the history of Estonian higher education, when two universities launched a joint programme with extensive student and faculty exchange and fully transferable credits and grades.

It must be admitted that the Estonian Ministry of Education did not initiate any of the PA programmes, as the field as such was unknown to the public and even to officials of education. PA as a field of study was included into the Ministry’s list only in 1995, after programmes in three public universities had already been established and first students admitted. This is unusual as the logic procedure of ‘government allotted spaces’ by the Ministry should start the other way round. From 1995 to 1999, Ministry of Education has been passive but relatively supportive towards the universities’ initiative in the development of PA programmes, as all three universities have admitted as many students as they are able to teach taking account the limited human resources in faculties.

The aforementioned universities are all large public institutions with considerable traditions in teaching and research, which existed already many years before Estonia regained independence. The first Estonian private higher educational institution, Estonian Business School was founded in 1988 by Estonian and North American professors as a centre for management education. The School has paid lots of attention to the development of business studies until the end of the 1990s. In 1996, the School was licensed by the Ministry of Education as the university-level institution. In 1998, Estonian Business School expanded its activities by introducing program in Public Administration, by that being the first, and so far the only private institution teaching Public Administration on a BA level. As the PA programme in Estonian Business School is only 1-year old, it was difficult to obtain data of their activities, which is why the further analysis of the Estonian Business School is incomplete.
The main rationale for the establishment of public administration programmes in Estonia was very clear one - the re-establishment of the Estonian Republic and the end of the Russian occupation in Estonia. For fifty years there had not been a single civil servant educated professionally in Estonia. All PA programmes have been established with the aim of better organising and functioning of the state on all levels: in both local authorities and central government. As already mentioned before, labour turnover in the Estonian civil service has been very high in the 1990s. In order to staff public offices with qualified people, the demand for highly educated young professionals has been enormous. Even in the end of the 1990s, the four universities cannot meet demands of central and local governments and there is still remarkable shortage of well qualified civil servants. Besides that, the establishment of PA programmes was also influenced by the development of PA education and research in Western countries. For example, the West-educated faculty in Tartu contributed greatly to the development of a new independent field at the time when the term ‘public administration’ had not yet been translated into Estonian language. Curriculum development in different Estonian institutions has been influenced by PA education in various Western universities.

Broadly there has been an evolution from a social science and economics base with strong emphasis on interdisciplinarity. The programmes are new but there have already been a few changes in all curricula, whereas the broader objectives of PA programmes have remained almost unchanged. The reason could be that there has not been enough feedback yet from the graduates, as the first ones have just entered the civil service. However, a few changes have been made according to proposals of practising civil servants (e.g. introduction of a course on Office Management in Tartu). The number of EU courses has increased over the years as Estonia was selected into the first wave of EU enlargement. The number of students has substantially increased in all universities, graduate and postgraduate programmes have been established gradually. As in the beginning of the 1990s the main emphasis was on the development of undergraduate courses, currently more attention is paid to the improvement of graduate curricula. A large number of new courses on PA have been developed and new research projects launched. Changes have also been in faculties with many young well-educated people joining the academia. However, there are still a limited number of faculty members in all universities and preparation of new scholars is a high priority for all institutions. Faculties have become known in Estonia and abroad, they have become involved in international projects and networks. Faculties have been increasingly asked to consult on Estonian PA reform and to provide in-service training for civil servants.

2. Institutional setting

PA programmes in Estonian universities can be easily identified and separated from other disciplines. Although their titles in Estonian language vary (avalik haldus, haldusjuhtimine, halduskorraldus), they are all called ‘Public Administration’ in English.

In former communist countries, reestablishing public trust and public participation presents a formidable challenge. Training and developing an educated citizenry takes trained individuals at all levels of society. The goal of awareness building is dissemination of knowledge about the public sector by (either directly or indirectly) educating different groups and professions in society. Therefore, in universities, participation in PA courses has to be open to all students no matter what their major field of study is. Estonian universities can be characterised by a large degree of openness. In most cases, students have a choice of many classes across faculties and departments. As PA classes have proved to be popular, they accommodate many
students of different subject fields who either take PA as a minor or visit individual classes. In this way, PA is taught in combination with a wide range of other disciplines.

All programmes provide ‘major’ in PA. Besides that, programmes at the University of Tartu and Tallinn University of Educational Sciences also offer a ‘minor’ programme, so that students of other disciplines can also obtain systematic knowledge of PA (currently there 55 ‘minor’ students in Tartu and 25 ‘minor’ students in Tallinn University of Educational Sciences). Tallinn Technical University and Estonian Business School do not provide PA as a minor field of study.

The student body consists of students in ‘government allotted spaces’ (i.e. those who do not pay for their studies) and of those who pay for their studies. Over the recent years, the ratio of paying students has increased in all universities. Estonian Business School admits paying students only. Tuition fees in different institutions differ to a little extent. The following table illustrates the PA programmes of different levels in Estonian universities.

Table 1. Number of PA (‘major’) students in Estonian universities as of September 1999

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution / degree</th>
<th>BA (4 years)</th>
<th>MA/MPA (2 years)</th>
<th>PhD (4 years)</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of Tartu</td>
<td>132*</td>
<td>25*</td>
<td>7*</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tallinn Technical University</td>
<td>133**</td>
<td>61***</td>
<td>9***</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tallinn University of Educational Sciences</td>
<td>224*</td>
<td>28***</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonian Business School</td>
<td>90***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>579</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>709</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* - fully accredited programmes for seven years  
** - conditionally accredited programmes for two years  
*** - programmes did not apply for accreditation

Accreditation of PA programmes was held in May 1999 and was carried out by an international accreditation board invited by the Estonian Ministry of Education. A few programmes were not accredited since they were too new so that it was not possible to carry out their comprehensive evaluation.

Students are allowed to take classes from other universities besides their home university. The most popular co-operation takes place between Tallinn Technical University and Tallinn University of Educational Sciences, which have an integrated PA programme. Besides that, students can take one fourth of their classes in other (Estonian or foreign) accredited universities for their credits and grades to be wholly transferred.

Estonian universities provide mainly traditional full-time programmes. In addition, all four universities have an Open University, where practising civil servants and other people interested in PA can study either individual PA courses or pass the whole programme. However, this form of study has not become very popular yet, as the Open University accommodates only a few students of PA.

The short description of institutions providing PA education is as follows:
University of Tartu

The University of Tartu is a public legal body, which follows the Estonian Constitution, the Law of University of Tartu, the Law of Universities and its statue. In the highest position to control in the University of Tartu is the university council. Formally, the leader of the University is the rector. The trusteeship and the government of the University are responsible to the rector. The University of Tartu has 2861 employees, including 1082 academic staff and 119 full professors. There are altogether about 9686 students, including 933 Master’s and 565 PhD students. The administration of the university is decentralised to a high degree, with many functions (recruitment, financial management, matters of research and teaching, awarding grades and degrees) delegated on the faculty and departmental level. There are more than 1000 students in the Faculty of Social Sciences. The Faculty of Social Sciences is one of 10 faculties in the University of Tartu, and it includes 7 departments and 12 chairs. The PA programme is taught in the Department of Public Administration and Social Policy, which consists of the Chair of PA and the Chair of Social Policy.

Tallinn Technical University

Tallinn Technical University is a public legal body, which follows the Estonian Constitution, the Law of Universities and its statue. The University is divided into 3 fields: an academic, supportive and administrative structure. The 9 faculties of the University are a part of the academic structure and contain 117 chairs, the Chair of Public Administration being one of them. Tallinn Technical University has more than 8500 students, including 660 Master’s and 189 PhD students. Tallinn Technical University employs 1400 employees of which 780 are the academic staff, including 102 professors. The PA programme is taught in the Faculty of Humanities, which contains the Department of Humanities and Social Sciences. The Department consists of 4 chairs, of which one is called Chair of PA.

Tallinn University of Educational Sciences

Tallinn University of Educational Sciences is a public legal body, which follows the Estonian Constitution, the Law of Universities and its statue. The university consists of 6 faculties, 20 departments and 2 centres. The PA programme is taught in the Faculty of Social Sciences, the Department of Government and the Chair of State Sciences. There are altogether 6185 BA/diploma students, 476 Master’s students and 53 Ph.D students at the Tallinn University of Educational Sciences.

Estonian Business School

Estonian Business School is a private legal body, which has staff of 90 people (including academics and support staff). There are altogether 1700 students. The Estonian Business School is divided into institutes and chairs. Public Administration programme is taught by the Chair of Law and Public Administration.

3. Positioning academic programmes in relation to other disciplines

All countries have problems in matching the output of the education system with the manpower needs of the economy. Selecting and targeting a particular occupation is becoming
increasingly difficult, as a number of occupations are emerging and current jobs are changing rapidly. This affects small states, such as Estonia with its population of 1,458,000, to an even greater extent because their labour pools are smaller and, thus, it should be more difficult to match people with jobs. Bacchus and Brock (1987, p. 9) claim in their study of educational development of the Commonwealth states that a curriculum which is based on specific knowledge and skills may be desirable in large countries to produce specialists in various fields. In a small concentrated economy, however, it is not appropriate to focus the curriculum on one or two areas of professional activity. Small systems tend to be open and flexible and, therefore, according to Bacchus and Brock (1987, p. 9), a broadly based curriculum is desirable and the direct application of specific skills is problematic in the long term.

Civil services in small states are directly influenced by the limits of small labour markets. Small states need most of the basic types of specialist personnel required in large states, but they need them in smaller numbers. The small scale of a system requires multiple roles and duties on the part of its administrators. Civil servants are expected to cope with multigrade and multi-disciplinary duties. Certainly a degree of multi-functionalism is also required of officials in medium-sized and large civil services. However, according to Bray (1991a, p. 513), multi-functionalism becomes more important as the scale diminishes.

PA undergraduate programmes can be broadly divided into two groups on the basis of their disciplinary backgrounds:

The first undergraduate programmes were established on an interdisciplinary basis with a curriculum heavily focused on the social sciences (University of Tartu, Tallinn University of Educational Sciences). Both PA programmes make an integral part of faculties of general social sciences by strongly emphasizing interdisciplinarity.

University of Tartu

The Public Administration programme at the University of Tartu was developed on the basis of analysis of how the PA undergraduate curriculum at this point of time in Estonia should look like. It also followed the experience of foreign universities teaching PA. The best courses necessary to the PA curriculum, fitting local needs, were designed by consulting programmes from Germany, England, Finland, the USA and Holland. The curriculum is one of the most interdisciplinary ones in the university and other departments of social sciences have taken it as a model to develop their programmes. The dominant discipline is Public Administration itself integrated with other disciplines such as law, state philosophy, economics, political science, sociology, psychology and European Union are compulsory courses in the curriculum. PA programme at the University of Tartu co-operates closely with the departments of Law and Economics of the same university.

Tallinn University of Educational Sciences

PA programme is clearly based on general social sciences with sociology, psychology and political science being mandatory courses.

Languages form also part of a compulsory curriculum. The joint programme between Tallinn University of Educational Sciences and Tallinn Technical University took curricula of British universities as a model. There was an agreement from the very beginning that Tallinn
University of Educational Sciences covers the fields of social sciences and more specific PA courses in the curriculum. Law and Economics play smaller role in curriculum than in Tartu, as there are no relevant departments in Tallinn University of Educational Sciences. The dominant disciplines of the curriculum are based on social sciences.

A different trend in PA education in Estonia bases PA curricula on Economics and Business studies (Tallinn Technical University, Estonian Business School). The foundations of such curricula can be found in existing competencies of these universities, which are skillfully used in the development of PA curricula.

Tallinn Technical University

Originally the PA programme of Tallinn Technical University was aimed to be interdisciplinary, however, in the current curriculum the relative weight of courses of Economics, Business and Management is remarkable and the PA programme itself strongly relies on co-operation with the Faculty of Economics. In the division of labour with Tallinn University of Educational Sciences, Tallinn Technical University provides courses on Economics, Mathematics and IT. However, as the PA programme is a part of the Faculty of Humanities, several other disciplines of humanities and social sciences are also included into curriculum.

Estonian Business School

It is too early to make broader generalizations about the PA curriculum in the Estonian Business School, as it was introduced only in 1998. The aim of the PA programme is quite ambitious, as the intention is to develop a broad interdisciplinary university-like curriculum including courses on Law, Social Sciences, Philosophy and European Union. However, the in-house competence of the Estonian Business School lies on the disciplines of Economics, Business and Management, which are likely to predominate in the nearest future.

As PA programmes in all universities are new, dominant disciplines which affected their establishment are still the same. It could be very difficult to achieve a major change of dominant disciplines, as this requires new (and currently non-existing) competencies, which depend on the development of future faculty members taking years if not decades. All PA curricula involve issues of governance with an orientation towards professional practice from the viewpoint of other disciplines. It has been difficult to hire instructors of Economics and Law who could analyse PA matters from their disciplinary perspectives. However, gradually courses of other disciplines (e.g. Economics, Law, Statistics, European Union, Informatics, Demography, Regional Development) have integrated specific PA matters, although the situation varies to a large degree in different universities. In several cases, PA programmes have preferred to recruit their own Law or Economics instructors instead of contracting these courses out to different departments or universities.

There have been enormous developments in PA programmes in 1994-99. PA programme at the University of Tartu has developed 73 new PA courses, whereas the respective figure for Tallinn Technical University and Tallinn University of Educational Sciences is 25. PA curricula have been examined regularly, by which several new courses have been included to the curricula, while a few courses have been replaced by others. This is common to all universities, although it must be emphasised that the general design of curricula has remained the same. There have not been radical changes in any of the curricula. It should be mentioned,
however, that the substance of similarly called courses may differ to a great extent which makes it difficult to carry out content analysis of PA curricula. Curricula of all universities are generally similar as almost the same subjects are taught in all programmes, although their emphasis and the contents of particular courses may differ. As PA programmes are very new and fast developing, the substance of particular courses has not been agreed upon among the four universities. Accordingly, the same subject may be taught as a part of different courses, and course syllabi may radically differ from each other. Faculty members in all universities have freedom to build up their own courses and they often use different sources for preparation of courses deriving from their own disciplinary backgrounds and professional experience. Therefore, the quantitative analysis of curricula does not demonstrate well the real similarities and differences in the substance of curricula.

Positioning of academic PA programmes in relation to other disciplines does not depend on the contents of PA curricula only, but is strongly influenced by the degree of academic freedom of students. The academic freedom can be illustrated by the ratio between compulsory and elective courses provided in Table 2.

Table 2. Ratio between compulsory and elective courses in Estonian PA programmes (Bachelor’s level, 1 credit point = 16 hours of lectures + 24 hours of independent work)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Compulsory courses</th>
<th>Elective courses</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of Tartu</td>
<td>72 CP</td>
<td>88 CP</td>
<td>160 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tallinn Technical University</td>
<td>122 CP</td>
<td>38 CP</td>
<td>160 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tallinn University of Educational Sciences</td>
<td>107 CP</td>
<td>53 CP</td>
<td>160 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonian Business School</td>
<td>152 CP</td>
<td>8 CP</td>
<td>160 CP</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The number of available elective courses on PA differs very much in four universities. Basically, two different approaches are used. Tallinn Technical University, Tallinn University of Educational Sciences and Estonian Business School engage different disciplines to their core curricula with leaving smaller number of courses to be chosen by students. The reason for that may be that a technological bias of Tallinn Technical University, limited Social Science base in Tallinn University of Educational Sciences and a high degree of specialization in Business studies in Estonian Business School leave little room for broader curriculum development by involving different disciplines as modules or minor fields of study.

University of Tartu offers a strong core of fundamental PA courses, while several PA sub-fields and other disciplines can be studied in detail through the selection of elective courses and minor fields of study by individual students. Such a difference between approaches to elective courses is caused by the greater number of disciplinary choices that students of the University of Tartu have. The large number of PA elective courses provides students with opportunity to specialise on different sub-fields of public administration. In addition, many disciplines provided by a classical university can be related to PA through their administrative sides. Academic freedom enables students to develop individual tailor-made curricula for cross-disciplinary fields such as Public Finance, Public Law, Health Management, Education Management, Labour Policy and Administration, European Union, Environmental
Management, Sports Management, etc. Accordingly, dominant disciplines besides PA can be developed on individual basis taking account of interests of students.

As far as the contents of elective courses is concerned, three different approaches can be identified. Two universities and have developed a remarkable number of PA elective courses in 1994-99: PA programme at University of Tartu offers altogether 52 PA elective courses, for Tallinn University of Educational Sciences the respective figure is 26. The generalisation could be that the recommended elective courses back up the major courses at the University of Tartu and Tallinn University of Educational Sciences. Tallinn Technical University offers only a modest number, 13 PA elective courses. Estonian Business School has been busy with building up a compulsory curriculum, and development of elective courses has been of secondary concern at the current stage of development.

All in all, the dominant approach to the development and delivery of PA programmes in Estonia is interdisciplinary. Although all institutions which teach PA emphasise the integrated approach to PA, in the actual delivery of courses the degree of interdisciplinarity varies from one university to another. However, the aim of all PA programmes is clearly towards larger integration of PA studies and other disciplines.

4. Comparative analyses of the contents of public administration programmes

A. Names of PA degrees and years of study

Table 3 provides overview of different PA degrees provided by Estonian universities.

Table 3. Names of the degrees provided by Estonian universities (PA programmes)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution / degree</th>
<th>BA (4 years)</th>
<th>Master’s (2 years)</th>
<th>PhD (4 years)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of Tartu</td>
<td>Bachelor of Arts in PA Baccalaureus Artium (BA) avalik haldus</td>
<td>1) MPA, Master of Public Administration (professional degree) (MPA) avalik haldus 2) MA, Master of Arts in PA and Social Policy (scientific degree) Magister Artium (MA) avalik haldus ja sotsiaalpoliitika</td>
<td>PhD, Doctor of Philosophy in Public Administration and Social Policy Philosophiae Doctor (PhD) avalik haldus ja sotsiaalpoliitika</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tallinn Technical University</td>
<td>BPA, Bachelor of Arts in PA Baccalaureus Artium (BPA) haldusjuhtimise bakalaureus</td>
<td>1) MPA, Master of Applied Science in Public Administration (professional degree) (MPA) haldusjuhtimise magister 2) MA, Master of Arts (scientific degree) (MA) haldusjuhtimise magister</td>
<td>PhD, Doctor of Philosophy in Public Administration Philosophiae Doctor filosoofiadoktor (haldusjuhtimine)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tallinn University of Educational Sciences</td>
<td>BA, Bachelor of Arts in Public Administration</td>
<td>MA, Master of Arts in Public Administration (MA) haldusjuhtimine</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The number of years by which different degrees are obtained, is standardised in Estonia. The nominal study period is 4 years for a Bachelor’s degree (160 CP), 2 years for a Master’s degree (80 CP) and 4 years for a PhD (160 CP). These standards are set by the Estonian Ministry of Education. On the one hand, it is possible to graduate with less time than described above, although these cases are rare. On the other hand, it is allowed to prolong the study time by a few years (in most cases up to two years), which is done in several cases, particularly in graduate programmes. After that it is still possible to graduate through the Open University schemes or through individual study schemes during very long or unlimited time.

B. Entry requirements

Entry to Estonian universities is competitive based on government allotted places. PA programmes have had an increasing number of applicants each year. Table 4 illustrates the entry to the PA undergraduate programmes in 1997-99.

Table 4. Government allotted places for PA undergraduate programmes and numbers of candidates in 1997-99.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>No. of government allotted spaces per year</th>
<th>No. of candidates / applications per space</th>
<th>1997</th>
<th>1998</th>
<th>1999</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of Tartu</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>252 / 12.6</td>
<td>267</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tallinn Technical University</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>165 / 5.5</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>138  / 4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tallinn University of Educational Sciences</td>
<td>13 in 1998</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>22.9</td>
<td>378  / 25.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15 in 1999</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There is no doubt that, according to applications per space, PA belongs to the top-three most popular fields of study in Estonia. PA programmes have tried to analyse reasons of so high application rates by examining the feedback from students and student candidates. The main reasons of popularity are as follows:

- broad interdisciplinary curricula with large choice for further specialisation
- modern curricula with many elective courses and academic freedom
- many courses taught by foreign and visiting professors
- increasing attention paid to PA reform by politicians and mass media
- shortage of career opportunities in the private sector
- the field of PA itself is becoming more interesting due to EU integration

All candidates who want to enter undergraduate programmes of Estonian universities have to be graduates of secondary school, gymnasium, vocational high school or their equivalents. A
great majority of universities and programmes base their entrance exams on state exams, which are conducted centrally by the Ministry of Education during the final year of secondary school. A Bachelor’s degree is required for entering the Master’s programme, and a Master’s degree for applying to the PhD programme.

Entrance to universities is decentralised to a large degree. Therefore, entry requirements differ from one university to another, and from one faculty / department to another. Entry requirements are proposed by each programme / department, then approved by the Faculty Board, and finally confirmed by the Council of University and Ministry of Education. Individual programmes can largely determine their entrance requirements and also make decisions about the entrance results.

Entrance exams are compulsory for students applying for government allotted spaces. As a rule, candidates who are willing to become “paying students” have to follow the same procedure of entrance exams.

University of Tartu

Entrance to the BA programme. A precondition of applying to the Faculty of Social Sciences is a positive result in two state exams: essay in Estonian language and exam in foreign language (English, German or French). All candidates have to pass a broad aptitude test which is based on multiple choice and consists of questions from various fields from art history to mathematical logic to Estonian government. The test is free of charge. Candidates who pass the aptitude test (usually 30-40% of all candidates) have to submit their curricula vitae and an essay in English on the topic “Why do I want to study PA in Tartu?” These form the basis of the following interview. Interviews are carried out partly in English as all PA students have to be able to follow texts and courses in English. The results of an aptitude test and an interview have the same weight in forming total results, on which basis the candidates will be ranked. Graduates of foreign universities have to follow the same procedure.

Entrance to the Master’s programme. As PA was not taught in Estonia until 1994, graduates of any other field are welcome. Candidates must submit an application, a curriculum vitae, a BA thesis, outline of the Master’s thesis and publications. These form a basis of an interview, fully in English, conducted by the members of senior faculty. Entrants to the MPA programme are strongly advised to have practical experience in public service. While MA programme is predominantly meant for a full-time study, the MPA programme is designed for practicing civil servants or those with a strong practical bias. A final list of Master’s students is approved by the Board of the Department of PA and Social Policy.

Entrance to the PhD programme. Selection procedure is similar to the Master’s programme. All candidates are expected who have a Master’s degree, not necessarily in Public Administration. A final list of PhD students is approved by the Board of the Department of PA and Social Policy.

Tallinn Technical University

Entrance to the Bachelor’s programme. Tallinn Technical University enrolls students according to the results of three state exams: Mathematics, Native Language (Estonian, Russian) and Foreign Language (English, German or French). Results of the exam in Mathematics have the same weight as the other two exams together in forming final results.
Candidates are ranked purely according to the results of state exams.

Entrance to the Masters’ programme. Applicants can be either graduates of the Bachelor’s programme or those having a diploma certifying a completion of higher education programme or those who have passed a 5-year “diploma programme” at Tallinn Technical University and gathered at least 140 credits. The average grade of undergraduate studies has to be at least 4.0 (on a 5-point scale) for those who apply to the Master’s programme immediately after finishing their BA studies. Candidates are expected to provide two letters of recommendation, including one from a potential supervisor. The selection board makes a decision on the basis of results of earlier studies, recommendation letters and the results of an oral exam with a candidate.

Entrance to the PhD programme. Candidates need to have a M(P)A or equivalent academic degree. Candidates who have demonstrated excellent results in their Master’s studies may be enrolled before defending their Master’s theses. Candidates are expected to provide two letters of recommendation, including one from a potential supervisor. In addition, candidates are asked to submit outlines of their PhD theses. The board decides according to the documents submitted, the earlier field of study of the candidate and the result of an oral exam. The average grade of preceding studies is also taken into consideration.

Tallinn University of Educational Sciences

Entrance to the Bachelor’s programme. Candidates have to pass two state exams: History and Foreign language (English, German or French). In addition, all candidates have to pass professional suitability test, which consists of competency test and group-work.

Entrance to the Master’s programme. Candidates have to pass an exam in foreign language and a test of professional suitability.

Estonian Business School

Students are admitted on the basis of state exams and an interview.

C. Curricula of PA programmes of Estonian universities.

PA curricula of University of Tartu, Tallinn Technical University, Tallinn University of Educational Sciences and Estonian Business School are provided in Annex 1.

5. The European and comparative dimension

As Estonia is still on the initial phase of the development of its public sector, it is very difficult and not always sensible to limit the object of teaching and/or research with the public sector of a country. The goal of teaching can also be the opposite - for the understanding of the development of public sectors in different environments, a comparative approach is used. Consequently, as Estonian PA is being built from a scratch, PA academics and practitioners are eager to look at different PA models in the world. As the development of Estonian public sector is still in transition, PA students are taught not only to implement policies but also to design public administration of the country. Therefore, almost every course has some
comparative dimension, and many seminar works and theses deal with comparative research.

One characteristic of a small country is that it engages relatively few people in its activities. People produce ideas and, if the number of individuals involved is limited, then the generation of ideas may also be limited. Therefore, small countries are less likely than large states to develop in-depth theories in different fields because of the shortage of qualified people and necessary resources. In such circumstances, there is a strong temptation to rely on borrowed ideas from larger systems, on the assumption that ideas analysed and tested in that context will be applicable to the conditions of the small system.

The comparative European public administration dimension has become more important in PA curricula as well as in everyday-life over the last years. Due to the Estonian integration to the European Union a comparative approach to the public administration is becoming crucial for preparing future civil servants. All Estonian universities which teach PA have recognised a growing demand for new courses related to the European Union. However, faculties in all four universities admit that although they already provide different courses in EU, they are still unable to meet expectations of students who have demonstrated their willingness to learn EU and comparative issues in-depth.

All universities are actively involved in students’ and faculty exchange with other European universities. Students are encouraged to attend courses abroad to get first-hand experience of different systems of PA and broaden their horizon, and many students have actually done so. As English is widely spoken by Estonian students, and there is great interest in studying other languages as well, language skills support students’ will to study in different countries. From 1998/99 academic year, Estonian universities are involved in Socrates/Erasmus network, which widens opportunities of student exchange. Students are allowed to collect up to 25% of their credit points from foreign universities approved by the university/department.

EU and comparative studies form an integral part of PA curricula in Estonian universities. Usually EU and comparative matters are integrated into a number of courses this way promoting an interesting teaching culture where comparative analysis is perceived as a standard part of a course. Therefore, the following table cannot cover all comparative perspectives of courses, but table 5 provides an overview of the European and comparative dimension in PA programmes, taking into account courses listed in the curricula and courses that are taught in 1999/2000 academic year.

Table 5. The European and comparative dimension in Estonian PA programmes (Bachelor’s level, 1 credit point = 16 hours of lectures + 24 hours of independent work)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Compulsory courses on EU</th>
<th>Elective courses on EU</th>
<th>Compulsory Comparative courses</th>
<th>Elective comparative courses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of Tartu</td>
<td>1) European Union 2 CP</td>
<td>1) Regional Policies, 1 CP 2) EU Projects, 1 CP 3) EU Public Policies, 2 CP 4) EU Finance, 2 CP 5) EU Competition Law, 3 CP</td>
<td>1) Comparative Administrative Systems, 3 CP 2) Management of Public Organizations, 3 CP</td>
<td>1) Administrative Reforms, 1 CP 2) Comparative Public Policy, 2 CP 3) Comparative Social Policy, 3 CP 4) Civil Service Systems and Personnel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tallinn Technical University</td>
<td>1) European Integration, 2.5 CP</td>
<td>6) EU Social and Economic Policies, 1.5 CP</td>
<td>Management, 3 CP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7) EU Law, 2 CP</td>
<td>7) EU Law, 2 CP</td>
<td>5) Politics and Administration of Small States, 2 CP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8) EU Environmental Law, 1 CP</td>
<td>8) Comparative Economic Policy, 2 CP</td>
<td>6) Comparative Economic Policy, 2 CP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9) Comparative Educational Administration, 2 CP</td>
<td>7) Comparative Educational Administration, 2 CP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10) German Society and Politics, 2 CP</td>
<td>8) German Society and Politics, 2 CP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11) French PA, 1 CP</td>
<td>9) French PA, 1 CP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10) American PA, 1 CP</td>
<td>10) American PA, 1 CP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11) Public Service in Great Britain, 1 CP</td>
<td>11) Public Service in Great Britain, 1 CP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tallinn University of Educational Sciences</td>
<td>1) Basics of European Integration, 3 CP</td>
<td>1) European History, 1 CP</td>
<td>1) Civil Service Systems, 3 CP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1) Local Government and Regional Policies of EU, 2.5 CP</td>
<td>2) EU Law, 2 CP</td>
<td>2) Politics and Government in the US, 2 CP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3) Analysis of EU Economics, 2 CP</td>
<td>3) Russian Political System and Society, 2 CP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4) EU Public Policy, 2 CP</td>
<td>4) Politics and Government in the UK, 2 CP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5) EU Finance, 1.5 CP</td>
<td>5) Government and Politics in Scandinavia, 2 CP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6) Research Seminar on EU Subjects, 2 CP</td>
<td>6) German Political System and Society, 2 CP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7) Special Courses in EU, 1.5 CP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonian Business School</td>
<td>1) EU Law, 2 CP</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2) European Integration I, 2 CP</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3) European Integration II, 2 CP</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4) European Integration III, 2 CP</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

University of Tartu
A course on European Union became a compulsory part of the PA curriculum in 1997. Since then, the PA programme has regularly introduced new EU related elective courses with the future aim of the development a whole EU module. The compulsory EU course is provided every year, whereas different elective courses are offered once in two years. PA programme also benefits from other faculties of the University of Tartu, such as Law or Economics, which also specific EU courses open to PA students.

In 1993, faculties of PA, Political Science, Economics and Law of University of Tartu became involved in Eurofaculty, which was introduced in all three Baltic States. Several new EU courses have been developed with the support of Eurofaculty since then. Another aim of the Eurofaculty has been the development of future faculty by supporting Master’s programmes. In 1998, College of Europe was founded on the basis of Eurofaculty. College of Europe draws together the EU competence of different faculties by that avoiding duplicating of EU courses and raising the professional level of EU courses as well as EU research. It is too early to draw broader generalisations of the College, since it offers its first classes in 1999 and will introduce a whole EU programme only in 2000. However, it is an important development for the PA programme, as this allows PA students to study a different array of EU courses in future.

PA programme in Tartu has good opportunities for the development of comparative PA, since all full faculty members have obtained their academic degrees in different foreign countries. Different educational and practical experiences allow the faculty to introduce very different perspectives to PA, and to compare these perspectives on the basis of Estonian PA.

In 1998, Tartu PA programme was invited to participate in EMPA/PAN-EUROPA network. This enables either faculty members or Master’s students to spend 1-2 semesters in any of the partner universities: Leuven, Liverpool, Vaasa, Speyer, Sciences Po in Paris, Budapest University of Economic Sciences. Bachelor students are welcome to apply for Socrates/Erasmus exchange programmes with universities of Helsinki and Maastricht.

Tallinn Technical University

A compulsory course on European Integration has been in the PA curriculum since its establishment, and offered annually. Other EU courses will belong to the elective curriculum. EU courses have a high priority in the development of PA programme in Tallinn Technical University. New EU courses are developed regularly, the aim is to introduce at least one new EU course a year. In 1999/2000 academic year, the following courses are being prepared: Estonia and EU, Members and Cultures of EU, Getting Information on EU, EU Projects, EU Law, EU Institutions and Administration, History of European Ideas, Local Government and Regional Policies of EU. It is expected that in future, a few of the current elective courses should belong to the compulsory PA curriculum.

Tallinn University of Educational Sciences

Basics of European Integration is a compulsory course in the PA curriculum. In addition, a number of EU and comparative classes are offered in the block of elective courses. In 1997, Tallinn University of Educational Sciences introduced a module in EU studies compiling of 15 credit points, which can be taken as a minor field of study by students. The current aim is to expand this programme up to 30 credit points. The same EU module is also offered to practicing civil servants.
Estonian Business School

Altogether four EU courses belong to the compulsory PA curriculum, however, elective EU and comparative courses are not offered. Estonian Business School has entered into student and researcher exchange with universities in different European countries.

6. Research

PA education can only be of high quality if it is related to the relevant research. It must be admitted, however, that teaching of PA has developed faster than the research. Nevertheless, research initiatives of universities are growing. Estonian researchers are increasingly involved in international research projects and networks, and they draw more funding from Estonian and foreign sources. In addition, the Estonian government is gradually becoming interested in supporting PA reform initiatives by relevant research through involving universities and individual scholars into think-thanks and government committees by that encouraging the development of applied research.

The European and comparative dimension in PA research is extremely important to the whole state, as the field of public administration is new not only for academia but also for the state. The research projects on comparative PA are valuable source of information in the situation where the conscious development of Estonian own administrative system is still at an early stage. In order to develop the administrative system that best meets local needs, different models and alternatives are worth in-depth examination. This involves studying public administration development in different countries through analysing experience and risks that other countries have passed in conducting their administrative reforms in different reform sub-fields. In the comparative analysis, European countries prevail over the US. Both Scandinavian and Continental European countries are paid lots of attention by Estonian PA scholars.

University of Tartu

The priorities of the research at the University of Tartu could be divided into three larger groups:

1. Public administration in Estonia. Both practical and comparative dimensions are being developed. Since 1999, University of Tartu serves as a strategic partner to the Estonian government in designing PA reform in the country. The main topics of research include implementation of administrative reform, civil service development, constitutional and administrative law, human resource management, application of New Public Management in Estonia, culture and ethics of Estonian civil servants, state information systems and relationships between Estonian public and nonprofit sectors.

2. Public administration as a scientific field of study. This division is about the discipline itself and the topics are related to history and theory of PA.

3. Public administration theory on international level. This involves a theoretical approach to PA and is the most outstanding as well, resulting in several international publications every year. The following topics are being researched: comparative civil service systems, comparative PA reforms, administration of small states, New Public Management and its critique, civil service ethics, separation of powers, government and information,
information and communication technology and industrial policy, municipal self-administration in Europe, academic administration, civil service careers, nonprofit organisations in Central and Eastern Europe.

Tallinn Technical University

The main PA research topic in Tallinn Technical University is comparative local government, where the administration of Estonian local governments is compared with local governments in EU member states (including political, legislative, economic and organisational aspects). The other research topics include regional policy, nonprofit sector, education policy, motivation of civil servants

Tallinn University of Educational Sciences

The research priorities of Tallinn University of Educational Sciences are developed in the following topics: PA reforms, evolution of the Estonian civil service, government institutions, transition in Central and Eastern Europe, organisational analysis, political and administrative culture, public policy, welfare policy and economic policy.

Other institutions and centres

There are no other PA research centres in the university setting in Estonia. As the discipline of PA is new and there is a limited number of PA experts, all competence has been concentrated in relevant departments in universities. However, a few other departments and faculties carry out research which is sometimes closely related to PA subfields, for example, faculties of Law and Economics and department of Political Science in Tartu, and Faculty of Economics in Tallinn Technical University can be mentioned.

A separate Public Policy Institute will be established in 2000 on the basis of Open Estonia Foundation (Soros network). This Institute will be dealing with policy analysis and evaluation in different public policy fields.

7. Relations with the profession

Relations with the profession are best characterised through three different types of relationships between universities and the civil service:

1. internships

All PA curricula contain the requirement of compulsory internship. Internships vary from their length and organisation, however, it should be mentioned that PA programmes introduced internships as a practical method of studies to Estonian public organisations in the middle of the 1990s. By 1999, internships are widely known and accepted by both universities and different public sector organisations. Table 6 illustrates the role of internships in different PA curricula.

Table 6. Internships in PA undergraduate curricula (out of total 160 CP)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Internships</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of Tartu</td>
<td>10 CP / compulsory</td>
<td>10 weeks of practical experience is required, including at least 4 weeks in central government and 4 weeks in local government.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tallinn Technical University</td>
<td>3 CP / compulsory</td>
<td>Practical training in both central and local governments is required.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tallinn University of Educational Sciences</td>
<td>5 CP / compulsory</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonian Business School</td>
<td>5 CP / compulsory</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All internships are jointly supervised by a university and an organisation. Valuable feedback has been obtained through evaluation forms that are filled for every intern by their immediate supervisors. In great majority of cases, the feedback about students’ theoretical and practical preparation has been very positive. In addition, different public organisations are asked to make proposals to curricula, which are always considered with great interest. In several cases, long-term institutional projects have grown from internships, and many graduates have been recruited by their former places of internship. A few students have been able to carry out their internships abroad, which is strongly recommended by PA programmes.

2. Employment of PA graduates

As the PA programmes are very new, the number of graduates does not provide sufficient basis for broader generalisations, however, it offers an overview of trends and employment practices in 1996-99. Table 7 provides information about the employment of PA alumni of different universities.

Table 7. Available figures on Employment of PA alumni 1996-99 (undergraduate programmes only)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution / employment</th>
<th>Public sector (incl. local governm.)</th>
<th>Private sector</th>
<th>Full-time MA/PhD students</th>
<th>Unemployed or searching for a job</th>
<th>Data missing</th>
<th>Total number of BA alumni</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of Tartu</td>
<td>43 (7) (68%)</td>
<td>9 (14%)</td>
<td>8 (13%)</td>
<td>1 (2%)</td>
<td>2 (3%)</td>
<td>63 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tallinn Technical University</td>
<td>34 (6) (89%)</td>
<td>4 (11%)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>38 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Several PA graduates have already made very fast careers by reaching the positions of department heads, policy advisers to ministers, heads of government commissions and so on. Others have been successful in getting admitted to Western Master’s and PhD programmes. PA graduates are highly appreciated in the Estonian labour market because of following reasons:

- labour turnover in the civil service was very high in the beginning of the 1990s and is still
quite remarkable (10-15%)

- there is a shortage of highly qualified civil servants, and universities have proved to offer graduates with sound professional knowledge and skills
- the open civil service system enables graduates to apply for mid-level and even senior civil service positions
- neither entrance exams to the civil service nor pre-service training is needed for entry to the civil service
- public organisations have an idea of what they can expect from PA graduates due to internships
- public organizations are not perceived as attractive as private sector companies, which is why the competition to the public service is not high

All in all, there are currently fewer highly qualified PA graduates than needed in the labour market. In the end of each academic year, several public organisations try to recruit directly from universities, although it is common practice that last-year undergraduates start receiving attractive job offers before actual graduation and start working part-time during their studies already, often following their internships. Alumni listed under ‘unemployed or searching for a job’ are all in the process of moving from one job to another, which basically means that the growing unemployment in Estonia has not yet affected PA graduates.

Employment in central government is remarkably more popular that working for local government. In some cases, employment in local governments has been considered as a starting platform for getting a job in central government. There can be several reasons why central government has been preferred by graduates:

- students who find a job during their studies are likely to remain in the same city, which is in many cases Tallinn where most of PA students study and where majority of central government institutions are located
- the role of local governments is still to be specified in Estonia
- central government organisations offer more interesting jobs and challenges to PA graduates, EU matters included
- central government organisations tend to be more open to young graduates, they also do more direct recruitment from universities
- central government organisations are bigger and offer better career opportunities

It should be emphasised that a relatively small number of the total number of PA graduates have chosen to work for the public sector. It is highly appreciated as salaries in the public sector have remained lower than those in the private sector, provided that qualifications needed from two positions in different sectors are similar. In addition, the prestige of public sector is also low. Those PA graduates who have chosen to work for the private sector, have also been successful in their jobs and made fast career in their respective organisations. A few PA graduates have been able to get professional appointments abroad, e.g. Finland, the UK and international organisations.

Universities have been involved in the design of public administration legislation in Estonia, however, universities have not tried to substantially modify recruitment practices. Estonian universities have always supported the open civil service system (a job system), which allows their graduates to get better placements, and thus, to staff Estonian public organisations with highly educated and motivated people, which hopefully will bring the change in administrative culture in the long-run.
3. Consulting and advice by universities for the government of Estonia

Individual faculty members of University of Tartu, Tallinn Technical University and Tallinn University of Educational Sciences have been actively involved in various think-tanks and committees that design and evaluate different aspects of PA reform and consult on law-drafting. This has been done on individual basis according to expertise in particular subfields of PA reform. Since 1999, University of Tartu serves as a strategic partner to the Estonian government in designing the PA reform in the country.

In addition, relationships with PA professionals are further developed by inviting senior civil servants to teach individual classes and to participate in different boards that evaluate practical knowledge and skills of students (such as Master’s students professional exam at University of Tartu where practicing senior civil servants have to form more than a half of the Board). All universities involve practitioners in their teaching process, although in most cases practical civil service experience is also required from full-time faculty members.

8. In-service training and staff development

The organisation of in-service training in Estonian public organisations is decentralised to a large degree. There is no institutionalised pre-service training, although civil servants usually pass several training courses during their probation period of up to 6 months. All training is provided in the form of in-service training. Law of Adult Education settles that 3% of organisation’s payroll has to be spent on in-service training. According to data obtained from State Chancellery, there were more than 200 training institutions which offered individual courses to civil servants in 1998. The biggest centre of in-service training is Estonian Institute of Public Administration which focuses on in-service training of state and local officials on all levels of Estonian PA.

Although universities have the greatest expertise in PA, their share of in-service training is not that great. This is because universities have been busy with development of their undergraduate and graduate programmes and educating future faculty. However, the role of universities as providers of in-service training has gradually increased. A problem for all universities is that their full-time faculty members teach also in private training institutions to earn extra income. This is the reason why universities have decided to provide their own in-service training programmes through open university schemes.

As the greatest number of civil servants work in Tallinn, Tallinn Technical University and Tallinn University of Educational Sciences offer most of in-service training courses. Tallinn University of Educational Sciences offers a wide array of in-service courses. In addition, they provide the EU training to practicing civil servants in the framework of their EU module. Tallinn Technical University is co-operating with the Estonian Institute of Public Administration with whom they share a building. Faculty members of Tallinn Technical University teach individual courses under the umbrella of Estonian Institute of Public Administration, covering fields of local government, management psychology and regional policy. In addition, both Tallinn universities have organised short courses in particular themes, which are tailor-made to specific target groups of civil servants. University of Tartu has not been so active in providing courses for practicing civil servants, although faculty members have taught individual courses on public ethics, small state administration, information politics, public policy analysis, organisation theory, provision of public services,
etc. for public servants of different regions of Estonia. Most of the courses provided involve comparative dimension, as involvement of comparative analysis makes a part of broader teaching culture in Estonia.

9. Conclusions

Four Estonian universities offer degree programmes in PA: The University of Tartu, Tallinn Technical University, Tallinn University of Educational Sciences and Estonian Business School. The programmes were established in 1994-1998 and the first group of students graduated in 1996. Consequently, all programmes are still very new and their development has been very fast. However, it is still too early to make broader generalisations of their success in educating civil servants and conducting PA research.

All PA programmes are based on interdisciplinary approach to PA by involving disciplines of Political Science, Economics and Law, and emphasising a broad liberal arts education. However, none of these disciplines dominates, although a slight Economics-bias in two universities can be noted. All programmes aim to develop PA education in a balanced way by offering different minor fields of study and elective courses in addition to their core PA curricula.

The European and comparative dimension makes an important part of all PA curricula. The role of EU courses has substantially increased over the past years, and currently two universities are in the process of institutionalising their EU programmes in order to offer them as a minority field of study for PA (and other) students. The European and comparative dimension is also a part of research projects undertaken by PA scholars of different universities.

All in all, PA programmes in Estonia are perceived successful despite their short existence. Their success is illustrated by top application rates compared to other fields of study and 100% employment of their graduates. It is obvious in September 1999 that although some stabilisation has been achieved, all programmes are still in the process of development and continuous improvement.

References


Annex 1. Curricula

1. University of Tartu

Faculty of Social Sciences
Department of Public Administration and Social Policy

1.1 Bachelor (BA) of Public Administration

Curriculum

The Bachelor's program lasts four years, during which time a candidate for the B.A. degree has to obtain 160 credits. The credits are divided in the following way:

- 94 credits for courses in Public Administration
- 35 - 50 credits in minor
- 16 - 31 credits for elective courses

Lower level (20 credits)

Compulsory general courses
Compulsory Public Administration courses

Intermediate level (25 credits)

Compulsory Public Administration courses
Elective Public Administration courses from the list 3.3. (6 credits)

Upper level (94 credits)

Compulsory general courses
Compulsory Public Administration courses
Upper level Public Administration elective courses from the following blocks:

- Theory of Public Administration
- Management and Economics
- Social and Regional Policy
- International Public Administration
- Others
- Minor course(s) (35-50 credits)
- Elective courses (16-31 credits)

Denomination of Bachelor degree:
Baccalaureus artium (BA) (Public Administration)

---

2 A full list of courses can be found on the NISPAcee web-site (http://www.nispa.sk/)
1.2 Master of Public Administration (MPA)

Curriculum

The MPA degree in Public Administration is a professional degree. The Master's program lasts two years, during which time a candidate for MPA degree has to obtain 80 credits. Credits are divided in the following way:

60 credits for Master's studies, including 20 credits for internship, and 20 credits for Master's thesis or project.

Master's studies (60 credits)

Courses and seminars (30 credits)

- Special Course in Public Administration 4 credits
- Estonian Public Administration 4 credits
- Organization and Economics 2 credits
- International Public Administration 4 credits
- Master's Seminar 16 credits

Internship (20 credits)

A candidate for the MPA degree must have practical experience of at least 12 months in civil service or international organizations. In case of having some other kind of administrative work experience, the duration of the internship will be longer. Practical experience acquired more than 5 years before applying for the MPA degree is not considered.

Professional Examination (10 credits)

Master's thesis or project (20 credits)

Defense of the Master's thesis or project

Denomination of the MPA degree:

Master of Public Administration (MPA)

1.3 Master of Arts in Public Administration and Social Policy - MA

Curriculum

The M.A. degree in Public Administration and Social Policy is an academic degree. The Master's program lasts two years, during which time a candidate for the M.A degree has to obtain 80 credits.

Credits are divided in the following way:

40 credits for Master's studies, and
40 credits for Master's thesis

*Master's studies (40 credits)*

- Courses and seminars (20 credits)
  - Special Course of Public Administration 4 credits
  - Master's Seminar 16 credits

*Internship (10 credits)*

As a rule a candidate for the M.A. degree must have at least of 3 months practical experience in civil service or international organizations. Having other kind of administrative work experience, the duration of the internship will be longer. Practical experience acquired more than 5 years before applying for the MA degree is not considered.

*Professional Examination (10 credits)*

*Master's thesis (40 credits)*

*Defense of the Master's thesis in the form of academic discussion.*

*Denomination of the M.A. degree:*

Magister artium (MA) (Public Administration and Social Policy)
Master of Arts (MA) in Public Administration and Social Policy

**1.4 Doctor of Philosophy in Public Administration and Social Policy**

*Curriculum*

The Ph.D. in Public Administration and Social Policy is an academic degree. The Doctoral program lasts four years, during which time a candidate for the Ph.D. degree has to get 160 credits. Credits are divided in the following way:

- 40 credits for doctoral studies, and
- 120 credits for doctor's dissertation.

*Doctoral studies (40 credits)*

*Lecture courses and seminars*

Compulsory courses (14 credits)

- Doctoral Seminar 6 credits
- Theory and History of Public Administration 4 credits
- Theory of Social Policy 4 credits

Elective subjects of Public Administration
Special Seminar in Public Administration for Ph.D. Students 4 credits
Special Seminar in Social Policy 4 credits
Special Seminar in Comparative Administrative Systems 4 credits
Foundations of Scientific Work 2 credits
Foreign Language 2 credits
Other elective subjects

*Classes taught or co-taught 10 credits*

**Doctoral dissertation** 120 credits

*Defense of the doctoral dissertation in the form of academic discussion.*

**Denomination of the Ph.D. degree:**

Philosophiae Doctor(Ph.D.) (Public Administration and Social Policy)
Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D.) in Public Administration and Social Policy
Abridgments Dr.rer.publ. or DPA may also be used.
2. Tallinn Technical University

2.1. Bachelor’s Degree Programme
Curriculum In Public Administration

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain related studies</th>
<th>80,0 CP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General courses</td>
<td>28,0 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introductory courses</td>
<td>52,0 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speciality related studies</td>
<td>55,0 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chief courses</td>
<td>26,0 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific courses</td>
<td>29,0 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practical training</td>
<td>3,0 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electives</td>
<td>7,0 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thesis</td>
<td>15,0 CP</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conditions of receiving a bachelor's degree
students must

- complete theoretical courses with the minimum volume of 145,0 CP
- pass an extra-curricular foreign language examination
- pass the official language examination, (Estonian) - this applies to students who did not start their studies in Tallinn Technical University in the Estonian language
- not receive more than three grades of 1 (insufficient) during the whole period of studies
- undergo practical training both at a central and local government institution (see Practical training regulation)
- successfully defend a thesis

2.2 Master's Degree Programme
Curriculum in Public Administration

Curriculum structure

Masters of Applied Science (MPA)/Masters of Science (MA)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General courses</th>
<th>min 7,0 CP</th>
<th>General courses</th>
<th>min 7,0 CP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intro courses</td>
<td>min 7,0 CP</td>
<td>Intro courses</td>
<td>min 7,0 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chief courses</td>
<td>min 10,0 CP</td>
<td>Chief courses</td>
<td>min 8,0 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific courses</td>
<td>min 26,0 CP</td>
<td>Specific courses</td>
<td>min 18,0 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thesis (exam)</td>
<td>30,0 CP</td>
<td>Thesis (exam)</td>
<td>40,0 CP</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total no less than 80,0 CP Total no less than 80,0 CP
Electives (min 4,0 CP) to be chosen from among the disciplines taught at the corresponding level to Public Administration students at the institute or in the department. At least one examination to be passed.

Special courses to be studied individually (min 4,0 CP) according to supervisor's recommendations. At least one examination to be passed.

Participation in scientific seminars and preparation of presentations and reports - up to 4,0 CP.

Practical training the form of which is suggested by the supervisor must include at least 50 hours of lecturing per academic year. The calculated volume of practical training is 3,0 CP. The applicants for MPA and MA programmes should have at least 12 months' work experience in public institutions or international organisations.

Master's dissertation

Master's dissertation must present a fresh approach to a speciality related issue in a manner which is superior in content and volume to graduate thesis written at the end of 5 years of studies at Tallinn Technical University.

Total volume of master's dissertation in MPA programme is 30,0 CP; in MA programme it is 40,0 CP.

Conditions of receiving a master's degree

students must

- complete master studies of prescribed volume
- undergo practical training in teaching
- defend his/her dissertation (it takes place in the form of a master's examination monitored by an examination board)
- pass a master's examination (defend his/her dissertation)

2.3 Doctoral Degree Programme

Curriculum in Public Administration

Doctor of Applied Science/Doctor of Science

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>min</th>
<th>15,0 CP</th>
<th>10,0 CP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intro and Chief courses</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialised courses</td>
<td>min</td>
<td>25,0 CP</td>
<td>24,0 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctoral thesis</td>
<td></td>
<td>120,0 CP</td>
<td>126,0 CP</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total 160,0 CP

Individual specialised courses chosen according to supervisor's suggestion. At least 2 examinations to be taken.

Participation in seminars, preparing presentations and reports.

Writing books, course books and articles on topic of one's doctoral thesis.

At least 50 hours of teaching practice in an academic year.
Conditions of completing doctoral studies

The total volume of studies for doctors at least 40,0 CP and for doctors of science at least 34,0 CP.
Submitting one's doctoral thesis and passing a doctoral examination according to the requirements established in Tallinn Technical University.

3. Tallinn University of Educational Sciences

Bachelor’s Degree curriculum in Public Administration

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Structure of the curriculum:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General subjects</td>
<td>20 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courses of major: lower, intermediate and higher level</td>
<td>95 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor Degree Thesis</td>
<td>10 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additional speciality</td>
<td>30 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electives</td>
<td>5 CP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Credit Points</td>
<td>160 CP</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Annex 2: list of researchers in PA

List of researchers:

Tartu University

Wolfgang Drechsler, PhD (Marburg), Professor and Chair of PA
Tiina Randma, PhD (Loughborough), Lecturer in PA, Head of the Department of Public Administration and Social Policy
Charles Kroncke, PhD (Auburn), Docent extraordinary in PA
Ivar Tallo, ABD (McGill), Docent extraordinary in PA
Rainer Kattel, MA (Tartu), Research Fellow in PA
Toomas Gross, MA (Cambridge), Research Fellow (extraordinary) in PA
Taavi Annus, LLM (Marburg), Lecturer in PA
Tammo Esta, MA (Tartu), Lecturer in PA

All above-mentioned researchers can be contacted at:
  address: Ülikooli 18, Tartu Estonia 50090
  tel: +372-7-375 583
  fax: +372-7-375 582
  e-mail: ingrid.palgi@ut.ee

Tallinn Technical University

Sulev Mäeltsemees, PhD (Tartu), Professor and Chair of PA
Ilmo Saulepp, PhD (Leningrad), Docent in PA
Tiiu Kamdron, MA (Tallinn)
Leo Aadel, MA (Tallinn)
Agu Uudelepp, MBA (Tallinn)

All researchers can be contacted at:
  address: Ehitajate tee 5 Tallinn Estonia 19086
  tel: +372-6-202 660
  fax: +372-6-202 020
  e-mail: piret@edu.ttu.ee

Tallinn University of Educational Sciences

Georg Sootla, PhD, Professor of PA
Annika Anton, MPA, Assistant in PA, Head of the Department of State Sciences
Anu Toots, PhD, Docent in Political Science
Ivi Proos, PhD, Docent in Economic Policy
Heigo Kadakmaa, Cand. Sc., Research Fellow in PA