

Terminal Report

Support to Devolution Reform in Balochistan - The Participatory Information System

List of Acronyms

Term	Description
ACS	Additional Chief Secretary
ADPB	Area Development Programme Balochistan
BLGC	Balochistan Local Government Commission
BLRMIS	Balochistan Land Record Management Information System
BRSP	Balochistan Rural Support Programme
BTDMP	Balochistan Trail District Management Project
CCB	Citizen Community Board
CM	Chief Minister
CPI	Community Physical Infrastructure
CSO	Civil Services Organization
DCO	District Coordination Officer
DDO	Deputy District Officer
DG	Director General
DMIC	District Management Information Center
DMU	District Management Unit
DPA	District Project Adviser
DSP	Decentralization Support Programme
DTCE	Devolution Trust For Community Empowerment
EAD	Economic Affairs Division
EDO	Executive District Officer
ESRI	Environmental System Research Institute
FCC	Female Community Council
GAD	Gender and Development
GDA	Gawadar Development Authority
GIS	Geographical Information System
GoB	Government of Balochistan
GRAP	Gender Reform Action Plan
HRD	Human Resource Development
HRM	Human Resource Management
ICT	Information & Communication Technologies
IDSP	Institute for Development Studies and Practices
IT	Information Technology
IUCN	International Union for Conservation of Nature
JSC	Joint Starring Committee
LAFAM	Light of Awareness for Fair advancement of Mankind
LG	Local Government
LG&RD	Local Government and Rural Development
LGC	Local Government Commission
LGCB	Local Government Commission Balochistan
LGO	Local Government Ordinance
LGS	Local Government System
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MCC	Male Community Council
MGS	Management Information system /Geographical Information System Specialist
MIS	Management Information system
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MS	Micro Soft
NARIMS	National Reconstruction Information Management System
NGO	Non Governmental Organization
NPA	National Plan of Action

NPD	National Project Director
NRB	National Reconstruction Bureau
P&D	Planning and Development
P&F	Planning and Finance
PC	Project Coordinator
PC-1	Planning Commission – Proforma 1
PD	Project Director
PIDE	Pakistan Institute of Development Economics
PIS	Participatory Information System
PMU	Project Management Unit
PPSO	Provincial Programme Support Office
PSDM	Public Service Delivery Mechanism
PSDP	Public Sector Development Programme
RDA	Rural Development Academy
SDRB	Support to Devolution Reforms in Balochistan
SPDC	Social Policy Development Center
SQL	Structured Query Language /Standard Query Language
Sr. DRR	Senior Deputy Resident Representative
SWD	Social Welfare Department
TF	Taraqee Foundation
TBA	Traditional Birth Attended
TDMP	Trail District Management Project
TMO	Tehsil Municipal Officer
TMU	Tehsil Municipal Unit
ToP	Term of Partnership
ToTs	Training of Trainers
TPR	Tri-Partite Review
TVO	Trust for Volunteer Organization
UC	Union Council
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNDP-CO	United Nations Development Programme Country Office
UNDP-RR	United Nations Development Programme Resident Representative
UNICEF	United Nations Children Fund
VC	Village Council
WESS	Water, Environmental and Sanitation Society

List of Contents

- List of Acronyms	01
- List of Contents	03
- Project Terminal Report	04
Part-1	
- Numerical Rating	05
- Basis of Rating	07
- Executive Summary	09
Part-II (Textual Assessment)	
1. What are the major achievements of the Programme or Project vis-à-vis the expected results?	16
2. What major issues and problems are affecting the achievements of Project results?	37
3. How should this issues/problems be resolved? Please explain in details The action recommended. Specify who should be responsible for such action. Indicate or tentative time frame and resources required?	37
4. What new developments (if any) are likely to affect the achievement of project result? What do you recommend to respond these development?	38
5. What are the views of the target groups with regard to the programme or project? Please note any significant gender-based differences in those views.	38
6. To date what lessons (both positive and negative) can be drawn by the experience of the project.	40
7. If the project has been evaluated, what is the implementation status of the recommendations made by the evaluators?	41
8. Do you propose any substantive revision to the project documents? If yes, what are they? State justification.	42
9. Provide any other information that may further support or clarify your assessment of the project. You may include annexes, as you deem necessary	42
10. Important Visits	42
<u>Part-III</u>	
Financial Summary	44

Part I. Numerical Rating

Rate the relevance and performance of the programme or project using the following scale:

1. Highly satisfactory
2. Satisfactory
3. Unsatisfactory, with some positive elements
4. Unsatisfactory
- X. Not applicable

Substantive Focus	Target Group(s)	Project Manager, SDRB	Government	UNDP
A. Relevance				
1. How relevant is the project to the development priorities of the country?	1	1	1	
2. How relevant is the project to the promotion of sustainable human development?				
a. Poverty Eradication and Sustainable livelihoods.	2	2	2	
b. Protection and regeneration of the environment.	5	5	5	
c. Gender in development	1	1	1	
d. Promoting an enabling Environment for SHD, including Governance.	1	1	1	
3. To what extent are appropriate Beneficiary groups being targeted by the project, based on the following considerations?				
a. Gender	1	1	1	
b. Socio-economic factors	1	1	1	
c. Geographic location	1	1	1	
4. Given the Objectives of the Programme or Project, are the appropriate institutions being assisted?				

Substantive Focus	Target Group(s)	Project Manager, SDRB	Government	UNDP
B. Performance				
Substantive Focus	Target Group(s)	Project Manager, SDRB	Government	UNDP
1. Using the following indicators, rate the contribution of the outputs to the achievement of the immediate objectives.				
<p>Objective-1. <i>Establishing a policy framework that enables local government institutions, line agencies and local communities to undertake effective delivery of public sector services in a gender sensitive, sustainable, decentralized, participatory and efficient manner</i></p> <p>Indicator: Gender Sensitive Policy framework developed for improved public service delivery mechanism and Policy recommendations to the GoB.</p>	1	1	1	
<p>Objective-2. <i>Institutional Capacity Building: An improved linkage between existing public sector and local government institutions and beneficiary communities is established and the capacity of local government and line agencies at the district and union council levels is strengthened for the management of local development activities.</i></p> <p>Indicator: Capacity of public sector institutions developed through imparting training and study tours in the areas of planning, management, community development, project design, ICTs, budget preparation, financial control, ToTs, GAD, HRM, public policy, performance evaluations and governance.</p>	1	1	1	
<p>Objective-3. <i>Community Participation: In order to have</i></p>	1	1	1	

<i>better monitoring of public sector services, planning & implementation of village level infrastructures and local resource mobilization</i>				
Indicator: Village Councils (Male/female), Citizen Community Boards established and mechanisms created for effective linkage of these institutions with private and public sector institutions. Working of these councils in accordance with the signed ToP.	1	1	1	
2. Rate the production of target outputs	2	2	2	
3. Are the management arrangements of the project appropriate?	1	1	1	
4. Are project resources (financial, physical manpower) adequate in terms of: a. Quantity? b. Quality?	1 1	1 1	1 1	
5. Are project resources being used efficiently to produce planned results?	1	1	1	
6. Is the project cost-effective compared to similar interventions?	1	1	1	
7. Based on its work plan, how would you rate timeliness of the project in terms of : a. Production of outputs and initial results? b. Inputs delivered?	2 2	2 2	2 2	
Overall Rating of the Project.	1	1	1	

Basis of Rating

SDRB (Ext. TDMPB) corresponds with the priorities of provincial government 9th Five Year Plan that clearly states under the priority of decentralization (pg.36), "The Government will implement a modest form of decentralization transferring functions from the central, provincial government to institutions at lower level through a shift of part of the work load and of some of the decision making authority.....It will take

the results of the TDMP serious and will implement those features that have proved to work in the trial districts in the other districts as well.....Under the Trial District Management Programme investigations will be done, starting in two Districts with regard to the functioning of district administration, especially as far as delivery of services are concerned. The programme will indeed start district based information systems, maintained by staff at District level and below and linked to the Bureau of Statistics. The programme will test the feasibility of channeling development funds through District bodies, especially the District Council. The programme will run throughout a large part of the 9th Five Year Plan period. The programme will be closely followed. Successful activities will be repeated in other Districts”.

The project objectives are compatible with LGO-2001 and support the District Governments to ensure community participation, socio-economic research, preparation of development plans, catering needs of various areas in accordance with the demand of people. Compatibility of the project is very close to different sections of LGO-2001 and has been narrated as follows:

- *Chapter-3, Sections 28, 29 (District Coordination Officer, Functions and powers of District Executive Officer);*
- *Chapter-4, Section 39, Chapter-5, Section 57 (Function and powers of Zila Council, Functions and powers of Tehsil Municipal Administration);*
- *Chapter-6, Section 67 (Functions and Powers of Tehsil Council);*
- *Chapter-7, Section 76 (Functions of the Union Administration);*
- *Chapter-8, Section 88 (Functions of Union Council);*
- *Chapter-9, 10 (Village and Neighborhood Councils, Citizen Community Boards);*
- *Balochistan District Government Rules of Business 2002.*

Furthermore, availability of information system for addressing spatial and gender disparities in planning, monitoring and implementation of development activities has lead to strengthening of district governments.

The rating of the project activities is also based on the observations of the external evaluation mission **2004**, TPR decisions July 2nd 2004 (**Annex-1**), informal stakeholders consultations. The project is actually now operating in five districts after the inclusion of District Ziarat on the demand of District Government Ziarat and the directives of UNDP-RR. Replication of PIS in the District Ziarat proved to be the most successful intervention in terms of its cost effectiveness, time-efficiency, ownership and increased stakeholder’s involvement. A positive response was received from the Social Welfare Department on the institutionalization of the project’s gender strategy. A formal collaboration meeting of social welfare department with IT, P&D and LG&RD Departments was held for the continuity of the policy reform initiatives of the project. The IT Department GoB has agreed to takeover the DMICs established by the project and a PC-1 was prepared for the allocation of resources to District IT Departments for the operation and maintenance of these DMICs.

Executive Summary

The 2nd phase (Jul 2002 – Jun 2004) of SDRB (Ext. BTDMP) was aimed at:

- Supporting the local governments and other decentralized institutions created as a result of implementation of LGO 2001;
- Replication of the successful models of decentralized service delivery developed and tested in phase-I (11 UCs only) for complete coverage in the selected districts.

Initially the Project was to cover two districts (Loralai and Kacchi) but due to delimitations of district boundaries the project area was extended to four districts created as a result of splitting the Loralai into three districts (Loralai, Barkhan and MusaKhail) and Kacchi into two districts (Bolan and Jhall Magsi). Later on the Project also had to replicate the PIS model into an additional district Ziarat on the directives of UNDP-RR and strong demand raised by the District Government Ziarat.

The objectives of SDRB remained the same in the 2nd Phase as “Improving public service delivery mechanism through:

- Policy Reforms
- Institutional Capacity Building and
- Community Participation.

The major focus of SDRB remained on the enhancement of PIS model and its replication in the five Project Districts. The Project established two full-fledged DMICs in the Offices of DCO Loralai and Bolan and a mini-DMIC in District Nazim’s Secretariat Ziarat. As per signed ToPs, the District Governments deputed three suitable government officials in each DMIC that were trained by the Project staff and attached in the DMIC throughout the Project duration. The PIS was replicated in 61 (out of 68) UCs of five selected Project districts. The Project adapted a different and more efficient and cost effective modality for replication of PIS in District Ziarat with increased involvement of the District Government. The detailed demographic, socio-economic and public services related data was gathered through councilors with the validation through UC Nazims and UC Secretaries. The PIS and DMICs have been extensively used by the District Governments, CSOs/NGOs and elected representatives in planning & monitoring of public services. The role of PIS and DMICs was recognized by the concerned DGs and provincial government and PIS was declared as a standard model for replication in other districts of Balochistan.

The Project undertook a few innovative research studies and models development and as a result, useful policy recommendations were forwarded to GoB for incorporation in the government policies. These included:

a. Research Studies

- *Study of reasons of women reluctance in public sector to work in periphery and its recommendation to GoB;*
- *Study on Issues of girls primary schools and its recommendations to GoB;*
- *Gender mainstreaming strategy for improving grass-roots women access to public services;*
- *Gender based Human Resource Management Strategy for Provincial Government;*

b. Policy Recommendations

- *Rules for Local Government Commission framed by SDRB and notified by GoB;*
- *Gender analysis of Balochistan District Government Rules of Business;*
- *Gender mainstreaming recommendations for LGO 2001;*
- *Gender mainstreaming recommendations for Budget Rules 2003;*
- *Technical support to Local Government Commission;*
- *Support in Advocacy on LGO 2001.*
- *Support in District Core Group formation for implementation of National Plan of Action;*
- *Recommendations for incorporating sector specific gender guidelines in PC-I proformas;*
- *Preparation of District Development Profiles of Loralai and Bolan.*
- *Strategy recommended for collaboration between IT Department and SDRB for sustainability of District Management Information Centers.*

The Project developed a useful model for land record computerization in Balochistan with the name “Balochistan Land Record Management Information System” and tested successfully its viability for implementation in one “Mauza” (smallest revenue administrative state) of Loralai district. The BLRMIS is GIS based model developed through comprehensive process re-engineering and utilizing the latest tools (digital surveying tools) and techniques. The results were shared with large number of stakeholders that appreciated the model and recommended its replication but also highlighted the need for comprehensive policy reforms in this regard.

The gender strategy for the project focusing all three components relating to Institutional Policy Reforms, Capacity building and Community Participation was developed and implemented. The gender component of the project also focused the development of indicators for sex-disaggregated data incorporated in the Participatory Information System developed by the project. Gender strategy of the project focused the details of all measures relating to the project with the focus on improved public service delivery mechanism. The gender strategy served as a broad framework for the planning of project activities during the entire second phase.

The Project undertook the following initiatives that contributed positively in the strengthening of BLGC:

- Drafting the rule of business for LGC;
- Establishment of computer cell for the BLGC;
- Development of Web-Portal (both in Urdu and English languages) to enable the LGC in monitoring and regulating the LGS effectively;
- Attachment of M&E Consultant with LGC for undertaking the capacity building of LGC, providing technical support and advisory services;
- Conducted radio programme on LG related issues in four languages.

Capacity building of male and female government officials, elected representatives and community activists remained one of the major and most consistent components of the Project. The Project prepared 39 training modules and trained a total of 8902 persons including 7839 male and 1063 females. The creation of this large cadre of

trained people will greatly contribute in the capacity building of these institutions in each category and providing an enabling environment for improvement in public services delivery. The capacity building activities included ToTs, on-job-training, facilitation of sectoral trainings, study visits, foreign trainings and trainings at specialized institutes at national level. These capacity building activities are grouped in the following four categories:

The summary of the capacity building interventions is given below:

Category/Description	Number of Types of Training	Total Number of Events	Participants Benefited		
			Male	Female	Total
Capacity building of line department's staff in development planning, management and control.	10	62	748	34	782
Capacity building of concerned government officials, elected representatives and community activists on use of PIS in planning & monitoring of public services	10	49	256	22	278
Capacity building of elected representatives in preparation of development plans, monitoring, financial control and participatory development with gender approach as cross cutting theme.	7	94	1510	394	1904
Capacity building of grass roots institutions i.e., Village Councils and Citizen Community Boards for undertaking the local level development endeavors	8	184	5325	613	5938
Total	35	389	7839	1063	8902

About 39 training modules developed out of which 11 training modules were specifically for the gender component that included:

- Governance and Decision making for female councilors
- Gender and Development for male councilors and line department staff
- Local government plan 2001
- Linkage development (monitoring mechanism in the district government)
- Gender Planning and Budgeting
- Participatory Monitoring and management for FCCs
- Participatory Planning Process for FCCs
- Leadership Training for female VC members

- Improved public service delivery mechanisms for female councilors
- Gender session for PIS utilization workshop
- Strengthening of female CCBs

The Project effectively undertook the community mobilization activities in the 2nd phase of the Project in selected communities to ensure the active participation in order to have better monitoring of public sector services, planning & implementation of village level infrastructures and local resource mobilization. The community participation strategy developed and tested in the 1st phase of Project was dovetailed in accordance with the new LG System after the implementation of LGO 2001. The MCCs were converted into interim Village Councils and CCBs were formed in the project area. The Project prepared an extensive capacity building plan for the capacity building of these community based organizations/institutions formed by the Project in four districts (Loralai, Bolan, Jhall Magsi and Barkhan). The Project organized 184 training events to impart training to these VCs, FCCs and CCBs on 8 different themes to build their capacity for undertaking the local level development interventions, participatory monitoring of public services and ensure effective participation in planning and implementation of public services and local resource mobilization. The Project also arranged several study tours for the community activists to give them exposure of some of the good practices by other organizations/projects in Pakistan in the field of community development and share their experiences with them. The summary of the community participation interventions of the Project is given below:

Process	Loralai	Kacchi	Total
Information Sharing Reflection	201	167	368
New Village Councils (VCs) Formed	101	98	199
Male Community Councils Converted to Village Councils.	40	49	89
Female Community Councils (FCCs) Formed	59	54	113
Participatory Monitoring Management	143	95	238
Participatory Planning & Implementation	241	158	399
Community Development Plans (CDP)	89	64	153
Citizen Community Boards	63	46	109

The Project facilitates the VCs in the formulation of their community development plans with the extensive use of PIS data to highlight and prioritize their needs. These community based organization (VCs/CCBs/FCCs etc.) were effectively linked with funding agencies, CSOs/NGOs and local governments for catering their development needs. The summary of achievements under linkage development component is given below:

Activities	District Loralai	District Kacchi	Total
Schemes catered in Khushal Pakistan Program	13	4	17
Trust for Voluntary Organization	5	0	5
Water & Environmental Sanitation Society (H/Pumps)	35	0	35
Taraquee Trust (H/pumps)	5	0	5
Khushali Bank (Micro-credit)	12 VCs	0	12 VCs
Action Aid (Edn.,Health, Sports.)	8 VCs	0	8 VCs
SAA/USAID (Dev. Schemes)	3	0	3
BRSP (Dev. Schemes)	01	0	1
Physical Infrastructure schemes By Taraquee Foundation (in process)	0	95	95
Schemes by Irrigation Department (Karez rehabilitation)	15	0	15
ADPB (Computer Training)	10	0	10
Livestock vaccination	61651	20471	82122
Tetanus/ Polio Campaigns (Coverage)	100%	100%	100%
Tree Plantation	26100	4050	30150

Management meetings were regularly convened at different levels that included JSC meeting, DMU meetings, TMU meetings and Quarterly Review meetings. These meetings helped to streamline the project activities and support from different line agencies was attained for improving public services. Several coordination meetings were held with different organizations that included P&DD, IT, LG/RDD, SWD, Irrigation, Forest departments and District Governments that led to better understanding of partnership issues and future support. There were several visits from different organizations to SDRB and they were oriented on project philosophy and PIS. Most important visits included the visit of Resident Representative for UN, Sr. DRR UNDP, ACS (Dev.) P&DD GoB and UNDP country office monitoring mission in the reporting Period.

The Project focused the institutionalization and sustainability aspect of the Project interventions throughout the 2nd Phase but limited success could be made in this regard. Efforts were made for the institutionalization of the project gender strategy in the Women Development Department. A concept paper for the institutionalization of gender strategy was developed and shared with the Secretary Social Welfare Department. Meetings were held with IT, Local Government and P&D department for possible strategies for collaboration with Women Development Department and focal persons were nominated by these departments for interaction with the Social Welfare Department. A collaboration strategy and action plan was prepared and endorsed by each of these departments for the adaptation and sustainability of the gender strategy developed by the Project.

The major setback to Project regarding sustainability of the DMICs was the lack of will and commitment on part of the IT Department GoB in taking over of DMICs and

establishment of District IT Offices. Several decisions were made in the JSC and TPR meetings with strong commitment expressed by IT Department GoB in taking over of DMICs but could never be materialized. The Project recently facilitated the IT Department and P&DD GoB in the development of PC-1 for allocation of resources to IT Department GoB for taking over DMICs as District IT Offices. The positions of District IT Offices have been announced for recruitment through the Public Service Commission. As the recruitment process will take some time therefore the P&DD GoB has decided to takeover these DMICs under the setup of EDO P&F office in the three project districts as an adhoc arrangement.

Conclusion:

SDRB has made considerable achievements and positively contributed in supporting the LGs and improving the public service delivery mechanism. The recognition of PIS as standard model and strong recommendations for its replication in the entire province has been expressed on several occasions by the GoB. The recent evaluation mission has also stressed the need for a longer term support to devolution and recommended the focus on following niche areas:

- PIS/DMICs
- BLRMIS
- Institutional strengthening of IT department & SWD at district level
- Operational research
- CCBs strengthening

Part II – Textual Assessment

1- What are the major achievements of the Programme or Project vis-à-vis the expected results?

Intended Output 1.

Establishing a policy framework that enables local government institutions, line agencies and local communities to undertake effective delivery of public sector services in a gender sensitive, sustainable, decentralized, participatory and efficient manner

SDRB positively contributed in the development of gender sensitive policy framework for improving public service delivery mechanism. The Project undertook several innovative research studies and policy level initiatives and results were compiled and forwarded to the Government of Balochistan that included:

c. Research Studies

- *Study of reasons of women reluctance in public sector to work in periphery and its recommendation to GoB;*
- *Study on Issues of girls primary schools and its recommendations to GoB;*
- Gender mainstreaming strategy for improving grass-roots women access to public services;
- Gender based Human Resource Management Strategy for Provincial Government;

d. Policy Recommendations

Local Government Department

- Rules for Local Government Commission framed by SDRB and notified by GoB;
- Gender analysis of Balochistan District Government Rules of Business;
- Gender mainstreaming recommendations for LGO 2001;
- Gender mainstreaming recommendations for Budget Rules 2003;
- Technical support to Local Government Commission;
- Support in Advocacy on LGO 2001.

Social Welfare Department

- Support in District Core Group formation for implementation of National Plan of Action;

Planning & Development Department

- Recommendations for incorporating sector specific gender guidelines in PC-I proformas;
- Updating of District Development Profiles of Loralai and Bolan.

Information Technology Department

- Strategy recommended for collaboration between IT Department and SDRB for sustainability of District Management Information Centers.

The project provided useful support for elaborating gender concerns across selected sectors/areas of concern (for example, LGO 2001, HRM, planning & budgeting and some technical areas). However, these will require further policy dialogue at various levels of the GoB and eventual adoption by the public sector agencies. The Project recommended comprehensive amendments in the Balochistan LGO for mainstreaming of women.

The abolishment of Provincial Institutional Reforms Group (PIRG) in the 2nd Phase of the Project was one of the major reasons of ineffective contribution of the Project under its policy reforms component. The policy recommendations forwarded to the P&DD GoB could not be effectively advocated/followed up by the concerned authorities for adoption in the Government policies.

Output Targets

1.1 Standardized district based MIS/GIS in the project area developed with a clear focus on compilation of sex-disaggregated data in various sectors.

Achievements

The PIS was developed with the aim to provide the decision makers with a tool for planning and monitoring of public services in almost all sectors. The PIS was declared as a standard model by the GoB and various new sectors were incorporated on the recommendations of the Steering Committee. The PIS was re-designed in the 2nd phase through a thorough consultative process with all concerned stakeholders. It was then replicated in four districts (Loralai, Bolan, Jhall Magsi and Barkhan). Later on PIS was replicated in an additional district of Ziarat in much cost effective, efficient and sustainable manner with the increased involvement of District Government. One of the uniqueness of PIS is the incorporation of sex-disaggregated data in all sectors to enable the decision makers in addressing the gender disparities in planning and monitoring of public services and resource allocation.

The capacity of concerned staff of District Governments was sufficiently built on operation, maintenance and utilization of PIS & DMICs. The project could not make significant achievement regarding the institutionalization of PIS and DMICs due to the following factors:

- Lack of will/commitment by the IT Department GoB in establishment of District IT Office and taking over of DMICs for future sustainability.
- Lack of resources with District Governments to sustain the existence and proper utilization of DMICs.
- Lack of culture and enabling environment for the use of data in planning & monitoring process with in the government departments.

The use of PIS is gradually increasing by the public sector. The NGOs/CSOs, funding agencies, communities/community based organizations have been extensively using PIS in planning and monitoring of public services. The PIS was used to facilitate the organized/mobilized communities in formulation of Community Development Plans (CDPs) that were submitted to local governments, provincial line departments, NGOs/CSOs and funding agencies to cater the local level development needs of the communities.

In terms of preliminary impact, it can be claimed that 51 defunct public service facilities including primary schools, basic health units and potable water supply schemes have been made functional as a result of presentation of PIS data to district level authorities, using the GIS interface. Various development schemes have been included in the annual development plan of each district, on the recommendations of the overall Project, based on the MIS-based needs assessment. Recently an NGO started 95 physical infrastructure schemes from the Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund in the project districts based on the needs identified by community and facilitated by PIS. A continuous increase in the use of PIS has been observed especially by the CSOs/NGOs and LGs. The average requests for data received per week in the DMIC Loralai is about 10 besides that the PIS data has also been made available on the internet at www.pis.sdrb.org.pk

The PIS has been declared as standard and has been recommended for replication across the Province. The GoB is committed to utilize PIS and link it with provincial PSDP after integration of all DMICs at the provincial level. The use of PIS at provincial level will become more useful if replicated in all 27 districts of Balochistan. PIS will greatly help in planning and monitoring of public services especially for the formulation of provincial Public Sector Development Programme (PSDP). The establishment of DMICs at District level will facilitate the establishment of District IT Offices as envisaged under LGO 2001 and a proposal (PC-1) is under process in the P&DD GoB for the allocation of resources to IT Department for declaring the DMICs as District IT Offices and operation and maintenance of PIS & DMICs.

The recent independent evaluation mission of SDRB mandated by UNDP has appreciated the role and progress of PIS & DMICs and recommended its larger replication in other districts with increased involvement of the government functionaries.

The PIS was extensively shared with almost all stakeholders and higher government authorities including Governor Balochistan, CM Balochistan, RR UNDP, Sr. DRR UNDP, Country Director ADB, Chairman Provincial Inspection Team Balochistan, ACS (Dev.) P&DD GoB, administrative secretaries Balochistan, Chief Governance Unit UNDP, District Nazims & DCOs in more than 12 districts, representatives of NGOs/CSOs & funding agencies, elected representatives and community activist etc.

PIS was also used extensively by the Project staff and consultants for data analysis and policy research in the preparation of various reports/documents that includes:

- Study Report on grassroots women's access to public services
- Preparation of gender based human resource development strategy for GoB

- Preparation of Human Development Profile of District Loralai (Draft only by SPDC, Karachi)
- Preparation of District Development Profiles of Loralai and Bolan
- Preparation of Gender Statistics of all four project districts
- Preparation of Union Council Profiles

The PIS was installed on all available computers in the district level government offices. The Local Area Networks (LAN) in the DMICs were expanded and all the offices with in the premises of DCO's Office were directly connected to the server machine in the DMICs.

No progress could be made regarding integration of NARIMS in DMICs due to week response from NRB. Several meetings were held with NRB and SDRB offered support in the replication of NARIMS in Balochistan and its integration with PIS in the DMICs. A technical paper in this regard was also prepared and shared with NRB but it could not be materialized during the 2nd phase of the Project.

PIS was completely documented and following documents were prepared:

- i. User manual for PIS database application
- ii. User manual for GIS application
- iii. System manual for PIS database application
- iv. System manual for GIS application
- v. Logical Data Manual of PIS
- vi. Data Dictionary of PIS

The Project has recently started extending technical support to UNICEF in replication of PIS in the UNICEF Focused Districts in Balochistan. Keeping in view the importance and need of PIS, the GoB is also encouraging other partners for the replication of PIS and DMICs in the entire province.

Output Target

1.3. Model for Land Information System (LIS) developed.

Achievements

Land record computerization is gigantic task and sensitive issue in Pakistan. Several attempts have been made by various organization/governments (including UNDP) for the development of a model for land record computerization but so far no significant achievements have been made. Keeping in view the success of the SDRB in the development of GIS based PIS model, the GoB assigned SDRB to develop the model for land record computerization in Balochistan on pilot basis. The scope of works was to study & analyze the existing system of land record management, learn from the past experiences of computerization efforts, explore the possibilities of re-engineering the processes, develop the GIS based computerization model and check its viability by implementing it on trial basis in one Mauza of District Loralai.

The Project undertook the assignment with the close collaboration of P&DD GoB, Revenue Department GoB and IT Department GoB. The existing system of land record management was studied and analyzed in detail. The organizations/departments and professionals having previous experiences on the subject were consulted and their strengths and weakness were analyzed. Extensive process re-engineering was carried out in designing the new system for land record computerization.

A team comprising of MGS, Manager Estate Gawadar Port Authority, Director Land Records, and District Administrative Officer Zhob visited the Tasmania Australia and studied the Land Information System Tasmania, (LIST). The lessons learnt during the study visit greatly helped in the development and implementation of BLRMIS in Balochistan. The team members attended the five days training at LIST, Australia and submitted a comprehensive report with useful and practicable recommendations to the GoB.

A comprehensive model for land record computerization with the name “Balochistan Land Record Management Information System” (BLRMIS) was developed and tested through the following steps:

- Study of existing land record management system
- Study and analysis of the previous work done in Pakistan regarding land record computerization.
- Experience sharing with the Information Land Services Tasmania, Australia.
- Design of new system through process re-engineering for land record management, replacing the centuries old system
- Design of new formats and conversion of old records manually on the new formats for computerization;
- Digital land surveying using Total Station
- Design and development of database, database application and GIS applications using Urdu fonts style with Visual Basic 6 and ESRI Map Object2.
- Data entry of textual records and survey data
- Automated maps development and report generation with the BLRMIS.
- Demonstration of BLRMIS to various groups/departments/forums etc.

The salient features of these applications are:

- i. User friendliness
- ii. URDU language enabled
- iii. Live maps generation through its GIS application developed using Map Objects 2 with Visual Basic.
- iv. Automatic error checking capabilities
- v. Simplified and automated data processing

The implementation of the above-mentioned applications required the physical surveying of land parcels through accurate measurement tools like Total Stations. The assignment of surveying with Total Station was subcontracted to a local firm M/S Unique Associates, which completed the assignment in 8 days with the active involvement of existing staff of revenue department Loralai. The grid coordinates

measured with the total station was then converted into spherical coordinates with the help of custom designed software. All the existing data was initially converted on the new formats by the DMIC staff with the assistance of revenue department Loralai. Both the textual records and survey data was then fed into the databases using the BLRMIS applications by the DMIC's staff and the staff of IT department. It was compiled and reports were generated. The BLRMIS model is now ready and its regular dissemination has been done to all concerned.

BLRMIS was demonstrated to the following:

- TPR members at Islamabad
- Director General Gawadar Development Authority (GDA)
- Director Lands, Gawadar Port Authority (GPA)
- Project Manager, Balochistan Resource Management Project (BRMP-ADB)
- Mission of Asian Development Bank
- Country Director, Asian Development Bank, Islamabad
- Additional Chief Secretary (Dev.), GoB
- Ex-Senior Member Board of Revenue, Balochistan
- Director General Audit, Balochistan
- Secretary IT Department GoB
- Director General Audit Balochistan.
- District Assembly Killasaifullah
- District Government Lasbella
- EDO Revenue Loralai
- External Evaluation Mission, SDRB

Separate brief proposals were developed and submitted to DG Gawadar Development Authority and Director Lands, Gawadar Port Authority for replication of BLRMIS in their areas of jurisdiction. The DG GDA was further facilitated in the formulation of proposal for computerization of land records in Balochistan, which has been submitted to the Government for approval and allocation of resources.

The Balochistan Land Record Management Information System (BLRMIS) was shared with the revenue department GoB and a detailed training was conducted on Surveying for the staff of revenue department at Loralai. About six staff members were trained on theoretical as well as practical aspects of land surveying. They were also trained practically on using Total Station for recording land transactions in the field.

The implementation of BLRMIS is a sensitive issue and will completely replace the centuries old system therefore thorough policy reforms will be required for the proper implementation of the system. There are more than 15 books/manuals related to land revenue and land records management, which needs thorough review and amendments. The external evaluation team has also highlighted the importance of policy reforms for the implementation of BLRMIS. The results of BLRMIS model were shared with the Deputy Chairman Planning Commission, Government of Pakistan by the ACS (Dev.) P&DD GoB. The Deputy Chairman Planning Commission appreciated the efforts of the Project and stressed the need for integrating

the efforts carried out by all partners in Pakistan. He also highlighted the need for through policy review and reforms for the implementation of the model.

Output Target

1.4. Gender mainstreaming strategy at the grass roots for improving access of women to public services.

Study on provincial gender mainstreaming strategy for improving grassroots women's access to public services was undertaken by the GAD Specialist. Major activities relating to the study are based on the following:

- Data collection forms received from DMUs after collection of information.
- Review of 9th Five Year Plan
- Analysis of PSDP developed during the periods corresponding to the 9th five year plan
- Analysis of development Statistics of Balochistan developed during the 9th five year plan period
- Analysis of Councilors profile data
- Details of the key findings in each of the sector
- Development of the gender mainstreaming strategy for the provincial government.
- Study report on provincial gender mainstreaming strategy for improving grassroots women's access to public services was compiled in the end.

The study findings were shared with a wide range of stakeholders in a provincial level seminar at Quetta to seek further inputs and comments. In context of the follow-up of the gender mainstreaming recommendations copies of the recommendations were forwarded for Asian Development Bank review mission for the Balochistan Resource Management Project and Asian Development Bank study on the gender gap in Local Government Ordinance 2001. Several recommendations as amendments in Local Government Ordinance, incorporation of gender guidelines in PC1s, and formation of core groups for NPA implementation have been incorporated in Gender Reform Action Plan Balochistan. Concept paper for the institutionalization of gender strategy was developed and shared with the Secretary Social Welfare Department. (Copy attached as Annex-II). Meetings were held with Secretaries of Information Technology, Local Government and Planning and Development Departments. (Minutes attached as Annex-III). Focal persons were nominated by these Departments for interaction with the Social Welfare Department for the institutionalization of the gender strategy of the Project. Meetings were held under the chairmanship of secretary Social Welfare for the collaboration strategy and action plan was worked out for future. The following decisions were made:

- Social Welfare and Women Development Department shall hold regular meetings and continue the process with the focal persons initially for first six months on monthly basis. Later on the duration for holding meetings shall be defined depending on the nature of activities.

- Local Government, Planning and Development and Information Technology Departments shall be involved in the process of NPA updating and separate groups of these departments shall be constituted in the workshops for maximum inputs.
- Agenda for the next meeting will focus the amendments proposed for gender mainstreaming in Local Government rules and Local Government Department shall prepare working papers for the same.

Output Target

1.5 Strategy for the provincial gender sensitive Human Resource Management developed.

Achievements

The HRD Specialist undertook the assignment of developing the provincial gender sensitive HRM strategy for GoB. The initial ToRs for the study were prepared and shared with UNDP-CO and all concerned. The detailed HRD record of P&DD GoB was obtained and analyzed. All relevant studies, surveys and documents were consulted and a comprehensive draft of HRM strategy was developed and shared with the Project Management. The strategy was not published officially as the P&DD GoB hired a separate HRD Consultant with the assistance of UNDP under the Area Development Programme Balochistan for assessment of training needs and development of HRD Plan for the P&DD GoB. The details of the strategy developed by the Project were shared with the Consultant to build upon it.

Output 1.6

Study on impact of Local Council System on Public Services Delivery Mechanism (PSDM) for male and female population at district level

The study on the impact of Local Government System on Public Services Delivery Mechanism at the district level was carried out by a consultant. The purpose of the study was to assess the social, economic, political and cultural impact of the Local Government System in the project districts which started functioning on August 14, 2001.

The Consultant carried out extensive consultations with all concerned stakeholders at provincial and district level in all four project districts. The PIS and secondary data collected from the Project districts were extensively used for analysis. The Consultant compiled the draft and shared with the Project Management that was later on found suitable for reference only and could not be published officially due to certain weaknesses in the report.

Output 1.7

Development of District Human Development Report on the basis of Poverty Analysis with the help of PIDE and PIS

Keeping in view the depth and usefulness of information incorporated in PIS it was decided by the Project Management to develop the District Human Development Report for District Loralai as the first of its kind in the country that shall provide an in-depth analysis while covering various aspects of human development in the district. The assignment was sub-contracted to SPDC, Karachi under the overall guidance of Dr. Kaisar Bengali. The SPDC team conducted visits in the district and interacted with different stakeholders to obtain first hand knowledge. SPDC analyzed primary data (PIS) as well as secondary data collected by various organizations. The first draft of the report was supposed to be submitted to SDRB in June 2004 but due to certain reasons the time period was extended to October 2004. The SPDC could not complete the assignment within the agreed timeframe; instead, a draft of human development profile was shared with the Project in Mar 2005. The activity was suspended by the Project as SPDC failed to produce the desired outputs as per agreed terms & conditions.

Output 1.8

Establishing a framework that enables local government institutions, line agencies and local communities to undertake effective delivery of Public Services.

In order to provide support to the Local Government Commission Balochistan, the project took a number of proactive steps including drafting of rules for the commission. The drafted rules were submitted to the Local Government Department, which sent it to the Law Department after review for vetting. The rules for the commission were subsequently notified by the Government of Balochistan. The notified rules will facilitate the smooth functioning of the Commission as mandated under LGO 2001.

An M&E Consultant was hired to provide support to the Local Government Commission Balochistan. The M&E Consultant developed various performance concerning monitoring and evaluation mechanism of the LGC and provided useful advice to the commission. The Consultant extensively worked out several problematic LG related issues with LGC and forwarded useful recommendations on each of these issues. The first annual report of LGC Balochistan was developed by the Consultant.

As part of the continued support and strengthening of the Balochistan Local Government Commission, the project has been providing technical and financial support through the development of radio programmes on LGC related issues and institutions. 12 radio programmes in four languages (Urdu, Pushto, Balochi and Brahvi) were recorded and broadcasted on Radio Pakistan from Quetta, Loralai, Zhob, Khuzdar and Turbat radio stations. The programmes have helped in increasing awareness among people on LG related issues.

Study and exposure visits provide an excellent opportunity to witness and improve understanding. During the visit of Chief Governance Unit to Balochistan, the organization of the visit to LGC Sindh and NRB Islamabad was agreed in the Joint Steering Committee meeting. Subsequently, a visit for the Local Government Commission-Balochistan members and the key staff working in the commission was arranged to Local Government Commission Sindh at the request of the Chairman

LGCB i.e. Minister Local Government. The LGCB members were briefed about the functions of LGC Sindh. They also visited mega projects and interacted with the City District Government Karachi and exchanged views. The visit provided an opportunity to witness the functioning of the Local Government Commission Sindh and exchange of views to bring improvements in the functioning of the LGC Balochistan.

The process of setting of district core groups for implementation of National Plan of Action was taken up with the DCOs and notifications were issued by the DCOs in the Project Districts. The process of setting of district core groups for implementation of National Plan of Action was further carried forward and support was extended to Social Welfare Department in the updating of NPA. Focal Sectors included Health, Education and Violence against Women. Copies of notifications district core groups were forwarded to the Secretary for further action.

Development of Web-Portal for Local Government Commission

The development of web-portal is part SDRB's assistance package for strengthening of Local Government Commission Balochistan that will enable the BLGC to effectively monitor the performance of LGs and regulate them as per its mandate under LGO 2001. The web-portal was designed, developed and deployed on the web after through consultations with concerned stakeholders and requirement analysis. The monitoring indicators were developed and formats for data collection were designed and shared with LG&RDD GoB for comments and approval. The portal was deployed on the web temporarily at the URL www.blgc.org.pk.

The computer cell of Balochistan Local Government Commission was established initially in the building located in the Civil Secretariat Quetta but it was then shifted to the RDA building on western by-pass road on the directives of the DG LG&RDD GoB. The Cell has been equipped with 4 latest personal computers, multimedia projector, laser printer, fax machine and photocopier machine with all necessary accessories.

The formats for data collection were circulated to field teams to collect information regarding LG institutions performance in two districts. This data collection assignment was undertaken by SDRB on the request of LG&RDD GoB. The staff of computer cell was trained on data entry, using and maintaining the web-portal. SDRB is providing regular technical assistance to BLGC for the operation and maintenance of web-portal. The web-portal was shared with the Secretary Local Government and Rural Development Department GoB and his team. They appreciated the work done by SDRB and further suggested that the departmental staff should be trained on data collection on prescribed formats in other districts of Balochistan. The project agreed to impart training to all UC Secretaries subject to the logistic arrangements by the department for holding training workshops at Quetta. It was decided that the Decentralization Support Programme (DSP-ADB) would be contacted for bearing the expenses of the logistic arrangement for the above-mentioned training workshops. A proposal was prepared and submitted to the PD PPSO-DSP Balochistan and a meeting was held in his office to discuss the proposal. About six hundred UC secretaries and TMO will be trained during these workshops on data collection and use of BLGC web-portal.

Output 1.9

Development of District Profiles

Achievements

The District Development Profiles of District Loralai and Bolan were developed by the concerned DPAs with the objectives to provide the district governments, elected representatives, provincial line departments, CSO and other concerned stakeholders with a comprehensive reports at district level for planning and monitoring of public services. The District Profile were developed using the data from secondary sources as well as extensive use of PIS. These District Profile were developed as per official format used by P&DD GoB for the development of profiles in 1998.

Output 1.10

Short term support to Planning and Development Department

Achievements

During the visit of UNDP Resident Representative to Balochistan, the Governor Balochistan asked for UNDP's support to strengthen P&DD in certain areas. As a result, terms of reference for the HRD consultant were developed. The consultant had to work for two months duration but in the meanwhile the project phase came to an end in June 2004. During the TPR on July 1, 2004, it was decided that the existing HRD Specialist shall carry out the assignment instead of hiring a consultant. The HRD Specialist collected the training record and functions of each section of Planning and Development Department were gathered and the processes were analyzed. The Draft report was compiled and submitted to the Project Management for review.

Intended Output 2.

Developing improved linkages between existing public sector and local government institutions and beneficiary communities and capacity building of local government and line agencies at district, Tehsil and union council levels for management of local development activities.

Output Target

Capacity of public sector institutions developed through imparting training and study tours in the areas of planning, management, community development, project design, budget preparation, financial control, ToTs, GAD, HRM, public policy, performance evaluations and governance.

Capacity building of male and female government officials, elected representatives and community activists remained one of the major most consistent components of the Project. The Project prepared 39 training modules and trained a total of 8902 persons including 7839 male and 1063 females. The creation of this large cadre of trained people will greatly contribute in the capacity building of these institutions in each category and providing an enabling environment for improvement in public services delivery. The capacity building activities included ToTs, on-job-training, facilitation of sectoral trainings, study visits, foreign trainings and trainings at specialized institutes at national level. These capacity building activities are grouped in the following four categories:

2.1. Capacity of line department's staff developed in development, planning, management and control.

The Project organized 62 training events to impart training to the government officials on 10 different themes to build their capacity in development, planning, management and control. Out of total 62 events 16 training workshops were conducted on Gender and Development and gender planning and budgeting for line department staff including EDOs and DDOs with the total participation of 198. However a visible impact could not be build up due to the frequent transfer of the district line department staff. The project had a very limited collaboration with the Rural Development Academy that did not help in the institutionalization of these capacity building interventions. The details of the capacity building events conducted for the government officials are as under:

S. No.	Description of Events	# of events	# of Participants	
			Male	Female
1	Foreign Training in highly recognized institutes abroad	6	6	0
2	Training at specialized institutes (in-country)	35	138	4
3	Study Tours (regional)	3	20	2
4	Study Tours (in-country)	9	74	15
5	GAD Training	7	161	5
6	Gender Planning & Budgeting	9	187	5

7	Orientation workshops (LGO, SDRB)	17	102	1
8	District Government Budget Rules Training	4	54	0
9	Citizen Community Boards Operationalization	3	6	2
10	Formation of District Core Groups	1	0	1
Total		62	748	34

2.2. Capacity building for use of PIS in planning & monitoring of public services

The SDRB established two full-fledged DMICs in the Office DCO at Loralai & Bolan and a mini DMIC in the District Nazim's Secretariat Ziarat. The District Governments deputed suitable staff in each of these DMICs to work with the Project staff and learn the process for maintenance and operation of DMICs and PIS. The Project staff imparted extensive on-job-training to the staff deputed in DMICs as well as arranged advanced trainings in the specialized institutes in the country to build their capacity and enable them operate and maintain the DMICs and PIS effectively.

The DMIC was also extensively used for imparting the training on basic computer skill to the staff line departments at district level, UC Nazims, community activists and UC secretaries. The Project staff imparted 10 types of IT related trainings in 49 training events as detailed below:

S. No.	Description of Events	# of events	# of Participants	
			Male	Female
1	Office Automation Training	26	147	9
2	PIS data utilization workshops	7	56	0
3	Training on using GIS	2	4	0
4	Trainings on Database Management Systems	2	7	1
5	Training on PIS	3	11	9
6	Training on SQL	1	6	0
7	Training on Data Communication and Networks	1	5	1
8	Training on advanced GIS, Surveying and Remote Sensing	1	4	1
9	Training on MS-Access	2	6	1
10	Training on PIS-Database Application	4	10	0
Total		49	256	22

2.3. Capacity building of elected representatives in preparation of development plans, monitoring, financial control and participatory development with gender approach as cross cutting theme.

The 2nd Phase of SDRB was started in July 2002, the local governments were new and lacking the capacity to perform as per their roles and responsibilities envisaged under the LGO 2001. The Project prepared an extensive capacity building plan for the elected representatives in the Project area. The Project organized 94 training events to impart training to the councilors and nazims on 7 different themes to build their capacity in preparation of development plans, monitoring, financial control and participatory development with gender approach as cross cutting theme. The Project

also arranged several study tours for the elected representatives to give them exposure of some of the good practices by LGs in Pakistan and share their experiences with them. The details of the capacity building events conducted for the elected representatives are as under:

S. No.	Description of Events	# of events	# of Participants	
			Male	Female
1	Male & Female Councilor Training on LG-Plan	13	306	22
2	Gender & Development	19	318	22
3	Study Tour	7	44	12
4	Training on good governance & decision making	10	0	137
5	Orientation workshops for Nazims & councilors	18	434	27
6	Workshop for female councilors on improved PSDM	6	0	111
7	Monitoring Committees Training	33	408	63
Total		94	1510	394

2.4. Capacity of grass roots institutions i.e., Village Councils and Citizen Community Boards developed.

The community participation strategy developed and tested in the 1st phase of Project was dovetailed in accordance with the new LG System after the implementation of LGO 2001. The MCCs were converted into interim Village Councils and CCBs were formed in the project area. The Project prepared an extensive capacity building plan for the capacity building of these community based organizations/institutions formed by the Project in four districts (Loralai, Bolan, Jhall Magsi and Barkhan). The Project organized 184 training events to impart training to these VCs, FCCs and CCBs on 8 different themes to build their capacity for undertaking the local level development interventions, participatory monitoring of public services and ensure effective participation in planning and implementation of public services and local resource mobilization. The Project also arranged several study tours for the community activists to give them exposure of some of the good practices by other organizations/projects in Pakistan in the field of community development and share their experiences with them. The details of the capacity building events conducted for the community based organizations are as under:

S.No.	Description of Events	# of events	# of Participants	
			Male	Female
1	Management Skills training	54	825	76
2	Monitoring and Development Seminars	37	2299	0
3	Study Visits	2	17	0

4	Sector Specific Training (Livestock, Agriculture, Health & Hygiene, TBA, Teachers', etc.)	10	148	104
5	CCB formation Workshops	65	1709	291
6	CCB Strengthening Training	10	187	71
7	Annual Stakeholder Workshop	3	140	25
8	Management Skills training (for female members)	3	0	46
Total		184	5325	613

The HRD Specialist, SDRB carried out an Impact Assessment Study of sectoral trainings conducted by the line department's functionaries with the facilitation of SDRB. The study involved conducting interviews with the participants of the training, the concerned lined department staff and the villagers who had nominated their activists for sector-specific training courses through the project. About fifty percent of the participants could be reached by the field teams due to non availability of trained villagers for one reason or the other. A comprehensive report was compiled and submitted to the Project Management.

Objective 3

Community Participation: In order to have better monitoring of public sector services, planning & implementation of village level infrastructures and local resource mobilization

Objective 3

Community Participation: In order to have better monitoring of public sector services, planning & implementation of village level infrastructures and local resource mobilization

The underlying concept of the project focuses the mobilization and empowerment of beneficiary communities. Involvement of communities in local development has been a cause for, which SDRB has rigorously strived to meet the set objectives. Under the said component, the communities were mobilized to undertake development initiatives in collaboration with line departments, donor agencies and civil society organizations. SDRB immensely contributed in mainstreaming rural females in development processes through a variety of interactive dialogues and training events. Community development plans (CDPs) provided the communities with a new window to reflect upon the existing situation of the village and make comparative analysis of available and potential resources to combat with local issues at their best. These CDPs highly supported the donor agencies and line departments to focus their efforts on prioritized areas identified by the communities through a participatory process. The mobilization also played vital role in enabling the communities to establish their village council/female community councils and citizen community boards to institutionalize the development efforts.

Output 3.1

Establishment of village councils (VCs) in 235 selected settlements of 47 additional UCs and 58 Citizen Community Boards (CCBs) in both districts.

Achievements

In the inception of second phase, almost all male community councils were converted in village councils so as to make unification of efforts and institutionalize the process inline with Local Government Ordinance 2001, however, Government of Balochistan did not support further VCs establishment process in entire province.

Status of Social Mobilization interventions

Process	Loralai	Kacchi	Total
Information Sharing Reflection	201	167	368
New Village Councils (VCs) Formed	101	98	199
Male Community Councils Converted to Village Councils.	40	49	89
Female Community Councils (FCCs) Formed	59	54	113
Participatory Monitoring Management	143	95	238
Participatory Planning & Implementation	241	158	399
Community Development Plans (CDP)	89	64	153
Citizen Community Boards	63	46	109

Looking to the objective conditions of the project districts, SDRB shifted its focus from establishment of VCs to formation of CCBs through district government, which yielded tremendous results. SDRB continued its support in making intense interactions with citizen community boards, village councils and female community councils in all project districts through monthly calendar meetings and capacity building activities.

CCBs formation methodology

As per methodology adopted in 2004, all CCs were formed in light of our core methodology keeping in view the objective conditions and ground realities of the target districts. Our field experience shows that combined CCBs by involving two or three communities cannot sustain their efforts in long run due to tribal differences among various groups and clans. Keeping in view cited condition the CCBs formation methodology were shifted from cluster based approach to individual community level.

Facilitation to CCBs for registration with CDD at district level

The Registration process of CCBs have been main hurdle specially in Barkhan where no such community development staff were deputed to undertake the process while Loralai and Bolan were comparatively conducive for registration. Almost all EDO community development positively responded the entire process as per local government ordinance.

Status of CCBs Formation & registration in District Loralai and Barkhan

S No	Tehsil Name	# of CCBs formed			Status of registration
		Male	Female	Total	
s					
1.	Bori	35	03	38	38
2.	Duki	25	00	25	21
3.	Barkhan	07	00	07	07
	Total	67	03	70	66

Status of CCBs Formation & Registration in District Bolan and Jhal Magsi

S No	Tehsil Name	# of CCBs formed			Status of registration
		Male	Female	Total	
1	Jhal Magsi	13	01	14	12
2	Gandawa	14	01	15	14
3	Bhag	07	05	12	10
4	Dhader	07	05	12	11
5	Mach	03	02	05	04
		44	14	58	51

Capacity building of CCBs

During CCBs formation it was observed that not only formation but capacity building of CCBs also must be considered so as these village based entities may reach to a certain level where they can properly play pivotal role as per envisaged in ordinance 2001.

These two days training was focused on core important contents like the underlying logic of CCBs formation, their role in development process as well. Below mentioned contents were focused.

- ❑ Need and importance of CCB in development.
- ❑ Bylaws of CCBs
- ❑ Registration process of CCBs.
- ❑ Groups work on CCBs registration process.
- ❑ Recap of pervious day.
- ❑ What is proposal? And the importance of proposal in identification of development issues.
- ❑ Steps involved in proposal approval process.
- ❑ Methods of proposal writing process.
- ❑ Group work on proposal writing.
- ❑ Recap of two days training.

Training of EDOs on CCB

A series of one-day training was conducted for EDOs and DDOs in project districts under the title of “the basic concept of CCBs and their supportive role for departments in facilitating development activities”. During training it was revealed that most of EDOs or DDOs were even not familiar with basic information of CCBs while some were equipped with extensive knowledge about the overall concept of CCB. This training was focused on developing understanding of district officials towards the role and key responsibilities of CCBs at district, tehsil and union level. Main contents addressed in training are as under.

Overall status of capacity building events under component –III

S.No	Description of Events	# of events	# of Participants	
			Male	Femal
1	Management Skills training	54	825	76
2	Monitoring and Development Seminars	37	2299	0
3	Study Visits	2	17	0
4	Sector Specific Training (Livestock, Agriculture, Health & Hvgiene, TBA, Teachers', etc.)	10	148	104
5	CCB formation Workshops	65	1709	291
6	CCB Strengthening Training	10	187	71
7	Annual Stakeholder Workshop	3	140	25
8	Management Skills training (for female members)	3	0	46
Total		184	5325	613

The impacts of linkage development in project districts.

Activities	District Loralai	District Kacchi	Total
Schemes by Irrigation Department (Karez rehabilitation)	15	0	15
ADPB (Computer Training)	10	0	10
Livestock vaccination	61651	20471	82122
Tetanus/ Polio Campaigns (Coverage)	100%	100%	100%
Tree Plantation	26100	4050	30150

Exit Conferences

The VCs/CCBs conferences at Tehsil level on exit of the project was also conducted in Loralai and Bolan district. The exit conferences were one of mandatory activity of annual work plan aimed at proper and systematic exit from the districts by involving established/registered CCBs, Village Councils (VCs), NGOs/CBOs and community development department. The captioned conferences are the part of annual work plan

Linkage of CCBs with DTCE

A detailed meeting was held with representatives from DTCE (Mr, Ejaz Ahmad director community and local government relations, manager field operation team and member from administrative section). However, from SDRB side the NPD, PC, HRD specialist and DPA Loralai participated in the meeting. After formal introduction the NPD briefed the participants about the background and objectives of SDRB and explained the overall initiatives of the project with particular emphasis of CCB. They were told that SDRB have formed and trained 110 CCBs in four project districts and all CCBs underwent intense training session particularly focused on registration and proposal writing processes. So under the guide lines decision of tripartite review, DTCE was requested to takeover the cited CCBs in all four project districts.

Mr Ejaz highly extolled the endeavors of SDRB and told that they have already prioritized the districts for operation in which SDRB's districts are not included, however, once the operations have been completed in current districts, SDRB's target districts will be given top priority.

Output 3.2

Mechanism created for effective linkages among VCs and private and public sector institutions of the district.

Achievements:

During second phase of the project, various activities were undertaken for developing cemented and viable partnership among VCs, FCC, and CCBs, development organizations and line departments. Monitoring and development seminars were the most effective means for linkage development of communities with line departments and development agencies. These seminars were revolved around the philosophy to lead the process towards sustainability.

Keeping in view the importance of linkage development of CCBs/VCs/ FCCs with the private and public sector institutions, many activities were carried out in district Loralai and Bolan. Following are details of the activities:

S No	Name of CCB	Sector	Linked with	Project worth
1.	Kanobi Nasaran	Water	SAA	75000
2.	Grasp Murtat	education	SAA	80000
3.	Shabozai eleven	education	SAA	85000
4.	Nana Sahib Ziarat	water	SAA	70000
5.	Barad CCB	water	SAA	80000

Name of CCB	Type of Scheme	Linked With
Kishar Development CCB	Hand Pump	USAID
Roshni Mashkaf(Female)	Embroidery Center	IDSP Sibi
Roshni Mashkaf (Female)	Credit for Machines	Khushali Bank Sibi

Proposals to AASA

AASA consultants is executing a project of USAID that offers short scale projects ranging from Rs: 20000 to 85000 to village based organizations.

In pervious cycle of grants announced by AASA, the CCB of Kanobi Malakhail and Hosary submitted two proposals for USAID small grant for construction of two kacha rooms in community supported health center Hosary and construction and up-gradation of well in Kanobi Malakhail. Both proposals full filled the desired criteria and short listed for the grant and the appraisal of the projects were completed. Second cycle of grant was announced in 28 May and around 05 CCBs across district submitted proposals for different schemes.

Proposals approved

Two proposals were approved submitted to BRSP and AASA by CCB Barnima and Kanobi Nasaran. This is worth mentioning that BRSP only approved two proposals in district Loralai and Barkhan in its second phase.

S No	Name of CCB	Sector	Project worth
1.	Kanobi Nasaran	Water channel	1750000
2.	Barnima	Education	80000

Linkages development initiatives

Linkages with Khushhali Bank:

Many consultative meetings were conducted with area sales managers of Khushhali Bank focusing on new schemes introduced by the bank in Loralai and other project districts specially for citizen community boards and low-income communities. Khushhali Bank has started its operation in district Bolan. A series of meetings were held for the future collaboration and cooperation. As a result, the Bank has decided to open its service center in Dhadar. SDRB has linked its CCBs with the Bank and some CCBs have received loans and small infrastructure projects from the Bank.

Linkage with TVO:

Trust for Volunteer Organization (TVO) is one of the potential development partners of the VCs and CCBs of district. TVO awarded around ten projects to VCs and CCBs in target areas.

Collaboration with Taraqee Foundation (TF)

Formal meetings were held with Taraqee Foundation to collaborate on CPI schemes, channeled through PPAF in district Jhal Magsi and Bolan. TF has picked-up 95 CPI schemes from the CDPs through cost sharing approach and implementation is underway in three union councils.

Linkage with ADPB (UNDP)

Area Development Program is a UNDP & GoB administrated program working in 8 districts of Balochistan including Loralai district. ADPB started working with six Village Councils in UC Cheena Alizai and intends to take 20 more VCs in its regular development program.

Linkage with Action Aid

Action Aid has started its activities with eight VCs of UC Cheena Alizai, Tora Thana and Mekhtar for development and capacity building. These VCs will be benefited with community infrastructure schemes on cost sharing basis.

Calendar meetings with FCC

Calendar meetings occupy significant place in overall mobilization framework of SDRB right from grass root level. Total, around 1200 calendar meetings were conducted in second phase with FCCs and VCs in all four project districts.

2- *What major issues and problems are affecting the achievements of project results?*

- i. Frequent transfer of DCOs, EDOs and other government officials
- ii. Lack of resources with District Governments
- iii. Lack of will/commitment on part of the government to implement the decisions made during the TPR and JSC meetings.
- iv. Lack of commitment from District Governments and IT Department in taking over the DMICs.
- v. Staff Turnover and delays in the recruitment process.
- vi. The lengthy and parallel approval channels of project activities
- vii. Lack of seriousness towards the importance of HRD from the government functionaries/departments.
- viii. The lack of involvement of RDA in the project activities on the directions of the government created a set back to the sustainability of the HRD activities of the project.
- ix. Delays in the approval of work plans and transfer of funds from UNDP-CO
- x. Law & Order Situation in the project districts

3- *How should this issues/problems be resolved? Please explain in details the action recommended. Specify who should be responsible for such action. Indicate or tentative time frame and resources required?*

- In the LGO-2001, it has been envisaged that district government staff shall not be transferred within three years, which has not been followed by the GoB. There is a need to have a strong consideration if strong district governments are expected in future;
- Provincial Finance Commission must consider promptly on district development budgets, otherwise only devolution will not create any visible impact on public services. There is a need to create extra allocations for mobilized communities, and CCBs where they are willing to contribute and take future responsibility for operation and maintenance of any development scheme. The DTCE should be asked to give preference by initiating their activities in the four project districts for sustainability of some of the project interventions especially CCBs.
- The District IT Offices should be established at earliest possible by the GoB and sufficient funds be allocated as per PC-1 prepared and submitted to IT Department for the future operation and maintenance of these DMICs.
- Delayed hiring of the staff could be controlled through well-timed availability of counterparts (EAD/UNDP/GoB) in the interview process;
- The dual approval process should be simplified and further approval for any activity already approved in the Quarterly Work Plan be abolished
- Local Government Commission needs to be further strengthened at earliest possible in the province. It should create support mechanisms for District Governments for their optimum functioning. The Commission should also interact frequently with the District Governments for sharing various concerns related to policy, management and capacity;
- The UNDP-CO should take measures to expedite the funds transfer to the project

- Project management always recommended to the field teams for avoiding security risk areas. If the movement is unavoidable, attachment of levies guards has been made mandatory. Satellite sets have been made available in all project vehicles. But in general there is a need to have high consideration by the GoB on security and law and order concerns;

4- *What new developments (if any) are likely to affect the achievement of project result? What do you recommend to respond these development?*

The UNICEF has expressed interest in the replication of PIS in its four focused district in Balochistan with the technical assistance of SDRB. Various meetings were held for the finalization of proposal and other modalities for the replication of PIS and DMICs. It is expected that an MoU shall be signed between UNICEF, UNDP and GoB by the end of June 2005 in this regard. Since the second phase of the project is ending on 30th June 2005 and the new project document is under consideration by the UNDP and EAD therefore an alternate arrangement in the form of bridge period needs to be made to cope up with the situation and continued support to UNICEF and further sustainability of existing interventions.

Recently a separate proposal was prepared in consultation with UNPD-CO for seeking funds for replication of PIS & DMICs in the entire Balochistan. The retention of Key existing staff will definitely prove useful for replication of PIS and DMIC in the near future.

5- *What are the views of the target groups with regard to the programme or project? Please note any significant gender-based differences in those views.*

LINE DEPARTMENT

- The Chairman Provincial Inspection Team was briefed on PIS and BLRMIS models on the direction of Chief Secretary Balochistan. He has officially communicated highly positive comments to the Chief Secretary Balochistan on these models and recommended their replication in the entire province (Copy attached as annex-IV)
- The establishment of Computer Cell for Balochistan Local Government Commission, development of Web-portal, framing of rules of LGC and data collection on monitoring indicators for LGC were greatly appreciated by the secretary LG&RDD and the DG LGC.
- The ACS Development and District Government Ziarat greatly appreciated the new replication modality of PIS as practiced in District Ziarat because of its cost effectiveness and institutionalization.
- Management structures i.e., DMUs and TMUs provide an enabling environment to improve public services and create meaningful partnerships among public and private sector institutions;
- Role of DMICs was appreciated by the DCO Bolan and District Nazims because it is providing useful information to all stakeholders for transparency and improvement of public services but the DCO Loralai and Deputy Secretary IT Department expressed their concerns about the future sustainability of these interventions;

- The efforts of the project in capacity building and linkage development between the line departments and communities were highly appreciated.
- Secretary Social Welfare has appreciated the efforts of the project in developing and improving coordination on gender issues with other departments.
- EDO (Revenue) Loralai appreciated the efforts of BLRMIS model in the area because this will lead to efficient management of the department in future the DG Gawadar Development Authority appreciated the BLRMIS model and has moved a proposal to the GoB for the replication of the same in GDA.
- TMOs in general appreciated the efforts of SDRB and stressed on providing more support to tehsils in devolution context;
- Training of Union Council Secretaries on budget rules has been appreciated by the councils and has enabled them to undertake the financial management effectively at council level.
- Training of trainers on CCBs was appreciated by the government staff. This led to an improved performance of the department in the understanding of the CCB registration and capacity building process.
- District Government staff acknowledged that there is gender biased approach in planning of public services but regarded the limited availability of the financial resources as a major constraint in undertaking any such initiative.

• **ELECTED REPRESENTATIVES**

- The District Nazim Ziarat has greatly appreciated the participatory Information System model and provided all possible support in the its replication in District Ziarat with a very efficient, cost effective and more institutionalized modality.
- The District Governments in Pishin, Lasbella and Killasaifullah appreciated the models of PIS and BLRMIS and officially communicated their demand for assistance in replication of the same in their respective districts. (copies attached as annex-V)
- The Minister Local Government and elected members of Local Government Commission has appreciated the efforts of SDRB for strengthening of Balochistan Local Government Commission especially the establishment of Computer Cell for Balochistan Local Government Commission, development of Web-portal, framing of rules of LGC and data collection on monitoring indicators for LGC;
- Formation and training of monitoring committees were appreciated by the Union Nazims. This will create effective management of public services in the respective areas;
- The initiative by SDRB regarding formation and strengthening of CCBs was appreciated by the UC Nazims and District Governments but they also expressed their limitation in extending financial support due to lack of funds for the development.
- By awareness raising and capacity building of female elected representatives on their roles and responsibilities, the project is meaningfully contributing towards women empowerment and promoting equality;
- The initiative taken by SDRB regarding formation of Female CCBs was welcomed.

BENEFICIARY COMMUNITIES

- The CCBs members and VCs from Bolan, Loralai and Jhal Magsi appreciated the role of SDRB for linking them with major funding agencies and NGOs especially the PPAF for under local level development projects on cost sharing basis;
- Project has rigorously worked towards developing linkages of the communities with service providers and impacted on many development activities. In district Loralai, role of WESS, TVO, Action Aid and LAFAM was appreciated. In district Jhal Magsi and Bolan, role of Taraqee Foundation was highly acknowledged;
- CCBs' representatives thanked the efforts of SDRB and its continued support in registration process. They also requested for further strengthening and its linkage development in future;
- CCBs formed in the project district appreciated the efforts of the project in the establishment of DMICs and regarded it an extensive source of information for the formulation of CCB projects.
- Increased interaction with the female community councils enabled them undertake several initiatives at local level as opening of girls schools on self help basis, enrollment of girls in boys schools, improving the sanitation conditions in the village.
- Representation of women in VCs and CCBs was welcomed by the female community members. They agreed that they knew better about their rights, the Local Government System and the importance of monitoring of public facilities in their respective areas;
- CCBs' representatives who had participated in the study trips showed high level of satisfaction and suggested that such practice should be continued in future
- Women from the project district participated in the study visits and regarded the experience as a great learning opportunity.
- Female CCBs appreciated the efforts of SDRB that led to the formation of CCBs in the area and continued support of the project will help them to perform better in future.

6- *To date what lessons (both positive and negative) can be drawn by the experience of the project.*

a. Positive Experiences:

- Projects initiatives in connection with the Local Government Commission have highly been appreciated by the project.
- The new model of data collection for PIS in Ziarat involving councilors has proved to be efficient, cost effective and has led to greater ownership of project activities at the district level.
- Several gender related policy recommendations by the project as amendments in LGO 2001 for gender mainstreaming, incorporation of gender guidelines in PC1s and formation of district core groups have been incorporated in GRAP Balochistan formally approved by the cabinet.
- Capacity building activities have led to the improvement of performance of district government institutions
- Increased women participation in the council session was witnessed during the year.

- The development of first ever successful model of BLRMIS was greatly appreciated by all concerned and the GDA has submitted a proposal to GoB for its replication in Gawadar
- Budgetary allocations were made to the female councilors at all tiers of the district government and many of them had implemented projects in their areas.
- Female Community councils have played a positive role in the monitoring of public services.
- DMICs have recognized by the District Governments and being used as resource centers for private and public sector institutions;
- After the recognition of PIS by GoB, there is growing response at the policy level for improving public services delivery.
- Participatory Monitoring and Development Seminars have brought visible impact on improving PSDM. SDRB tried to institutionalize these events within government structure during phase I & II because many non-functional facilities were made functional. New program packages offered by the government were timely introduced. These events also rehabilitated the trust of communities on service providers/ Government;
- Involvement of the revenue department staff at the district level has led to increased ownership of the BLRMIS model as well as the capacity building of the staff for its replication

b. Negative Experiences:

- Meager development budget in the last two years within the districts is creating frustration among District Governments and the Citizen Community boards formed in the district
- Two parallel approaches i.e. development schemes with community participation and schemes without community participation in the same district is a discouraging factor. There is a need to have a clear and uniform policy at the provincial level;
- Resource constraint with the line departments to make non function public facilities functional is a discouraging factor. There is a need to have special allocations in the budget of line departments in this regard;
- Poor budgetary allocations for human resource development activities by the district governments for its employees are not being addressed. Allocations of provincial government under devolution are completely spent on construction and renovation of offices;
- Resistance and limited understanding among line departments and communities on discussing women issues.
- Lack of ownership, will and commitment by the IT Department GoB in establishing the District IT Offices as envisaged under LGO 2001 and taking over of DMICs badly affected the sustainability of the PIS and DMICs.

<p>7- <i>If the project has been evaluated, what is the implementation status of the recommendations made by the evaluators?</i></p>

The project has been evaluated in November 2004

The formulation of new project document is underway and 1st draft was shared with UNPD-CO.

8- *Do you propose any substantive revision to the project documents? If yes, what are they? State justification.*

As mentioned above, the formulation of new Project Document is underway.

9- *Provide any other information that may further support or clarify your assessment of the project. You may include annexes, as you deem necessary.*

10- Important Visits

• Resident Representatives' Visit

Resident Representative for UNDP along with the Chief of Governance Unit visited the project in January 2004. A presentation of SDRB was given and various communities were visited. During discussion, RR raised many issues regarding sustainability, cost effectiveness and replication of the PIS model in district Ziarat. He also asked for providing computers to District Nazim Loralai and Tehsil Nazim Bori with PIS installed for their increased access to information.

• Sr. Deputy Resident Representative's Visit

Mr. Haoliang Xu, the Sr. Deputy Resident Representative for UNDP along with the Chief of Sustainable Unit visited the project from May 31st to 4th June 2005. Detailed presentations about the Progress of SDRB and PIS were given at PMU Quetta. The Sr. DRR also visited the DMIC Loralai and obtained comments and feedback on the PIS & DMICs from the District Government Ziarat. He also discussed the impact of community participation related activities of the Project with the representatives of CCBs in Loralai. During discussion, RR raised many issues regarding sustainability, cost effectiveness and replication of the PIS model in the entire Province. He stressed the need for close and effective collaboration between UNPD funded projects in the Province.

• Monitoring Mission-UNDP

Monitoring mission from the UNDP visited the project areas from 22-25 July, 2003. PMU staff accompanied the mission at field level. Many meetings were held with different stakeholders. Some new ideas related to re-alignment of the project were discussed.

Other important visitors include:

- Additional Chief Secretary (Development)
- Asian Development Bank Missions
- Secretary IT Department GoB
- Secretary Social welfare and Women Development
- Director General Audit Balochistan
- Concern World Wide

- IUCN-Quetta
- Mercy Corps International
- Northern Area Development Programme and P&DD Northern Areas
- Taraqee Foundation
- Participatory Integrated Development Society
- Water Environment and Sanitation Society
- Agha Khan Foundation

For target groups:	
Name:	
Title:	
Signature:	Date:
For Project management:	
Name:	
Title:	
Signature:	Date:
For the government:	
Name:	
Title:	
Signature:	Date:
For UNDP:	
Name:	
Title:	
Signature:	Date:

Part 3 – (3)

Financial Summary