

Full Case Report

Case 578

ETHICS -- Electronic Tendering (Denmark)

Model multilingual Online system for tenders from Denmark

Executive summary of the case:

Abstract

ETHICS: Electronic Tender Handling, Information and Communications System.

National Procurement Ltd. Denmark (SKI) is owned by the Ministry of Finance and the National Association of Local Authorities, Denmark. Its mission is to co-ordinate procurement, perform tenders and negotiate a framework for contracts on behalf of all Danish Public agencies.

Since 1995 SKI has actively developed and implemented ETHICS an electronic tendering solution which has trimmed workflows, procedures and the size and complexity of the organisation involved in this process. The system has been fully operational since last year and covers planning, drafting and publication of tenders, management of all associated processes, issuing and running online tenders in a secure way using the newest collaboration technology and digital certificates; and also assisting in the final decision and award process as well as supporting team rooms for external specialists, advisors and users.

The impact of the solution in SKI has brought about fundamental changes:

- The productivity has more than doubled, so that twice as many tenders are being run annually using the same number of staff.
- Quality and transparency has improved with the effect that there have been no complaints or legal issues raised.
- The standardisation of the knowledge base used in running the organisation has meant that despite a staff turnover of 50% over the last 4 years, new staff have adapted to the system easily and there have been no delays or disruptions to services.

Case description:

Background

In the public sector goods and services represent considerable expenses in the total budget. If public procurement is done with care a lot of money can be saved. However, the buying process has become increasingly complex. New tender and competition regulations are being issued constantly and increasing demands for documented quality, price, delivery, and environmental and energy controls.

National Procurement/SKI has a great commercial expertise in the many terms and conditions that complicate public procurement. We create an obvious benefit to society by ensuring that the almost 20,000 public buyers do not buy a pig in a poke, and avoid using time and efforts on making the same investigations, evaluations and negotiations.

National Procurement was established with the defined goal to secure the public sector savings and benefits through better prices, safer purchases and more efficient working processes.

We want to be leading within the development of framework agreements with suppliers who sell goods and services to the public sector. Our background is a great commercial expertise in procurement as well as know-how on the special buying conditions characterising the procedures for public decision-makers.

We are a strong partner to all public buyers and suppliers to the public sector and offer experienced and skilled acting.

In order to achieve these goals, SKI has constantly endeavoured to trim the organisation and exploit technological offerings where it makes sense. When in 1995 the organisation was first faced with the task of making a framework for all governmental purchase of PC's and PC equipment for 3 years, the traditional way of doing public tenders almost brought the organisation to it's knees: 36 Vendors answered by delivering more than 30,000 pages for evaluation of very different quality, stressing the manual decision process.

This experience started the search for better ways of doing things.

Objectives

After 2 years the first version of the tendering solution was implemented with the following short term objectives:

- It should be able to work with the existing office system selected to minimize training and conversion.
- It should be possible to manage a number of concurrent tenders and check status.
- It should provide buyers/specialists with all existing knowledge and documents available from earlier tenders.

In order to standardize questionnaires and criteria:

- It should be possible to receive bids from vendors and extract answers for input into a decision process.
- It should be an open, transparent process following the EU directive to the letter.
- The vendors should realize that an effort was being made to simplify as much as possible.
- Fair and open process, no complaints or legal issues with vendors (or end users/buyers).
- The end users, buyers in the govt. agencies, should be able to influence the decision process.

When implementation started, further aspects were added. The long-term objectives of using the ETHICS approached should be:

- To support the Danish Governments drive towards eGovernment, particularly within eProcurement.
- To support the EU eGovernment initiatives.
- Implement secure on line tendering using the EU directive on digital certificates.
- Leverage contacts and linkage with initiatives for Online procurement in Local Government as well as nationally.

Resources

The ETHICS solution was developed over a period of five years as a result of a very productive co-operation between the technical specialists, a small IT service company called [inno:vasion], the specialists in SKI and the experts in the various fields of procurement. The assistance of and review by the Danish official legal advisor was built into the final solution.

The combination of skills and the commitment by SKI management as well as the Board, was also an extremely positive factor, as it enabled management and developer to discuss possible changes in procedures and traditions, leading to a business process redesign that went hand in hand with the systems implementation. Thus the system is designed to fulfil needs of management, specialists, end users, vendors as well as controllers and auditors. This makes the ETHICS solution quite unique.

The ICT platform selected was centred around the IBM Lotus/Domino solution, as it contained a lot of the required basic functionalities for different views across multiple databases, support for workflows as well as for locking and protecting data, using encryption where needed, and also because Domino has the capabilities of producing a webservice both for intranet users and for external internet users through

adequate firewalls.

In the case of SKI the organisation was already using Microsoft outlook for normal document handling, emails, letters etc., and the standard documents produced in this way were easily transferred to the databases controlled by Domino. The internal users simply open a browser window to access ETHICS. This means that no special hardware requirements are put on the workstations as long as they are equipped with browsers.

A short summary of the Technology deployed in ETHICS:

Open standards used wherever possible. The ETHICS core system can be run on NT, on Linux or other platforms supporting Domino. The clients only need to have a browser, so in effect anybody can log on to ETHICS.

Multiple access points still have to be available for some tenders, where it will not be possible to maintain the requirement that all vendors will access ETHICS online. In most relevant tenders we aim at enforcing the use of the Internet as a requirement. For disabled persons the ETHICS system, although with an excellent graphical interface, can also be operated by blind people using audio feedback.

Scalability: The system is highly scalable, it only depends on how many hardware servers you want to install in any cluster. The intranet solution is likewise capable of supporting installations with several 100 buyers.

Open Access tools: The multilingual part most especially, has been tested extensively, and all menus, tables, standard information are table driven, which means that the choice of language in your browser will invoke which table set should be shown. In this way even multilingual organisations (in Belgium for instance) will be able to use the same system. Translation of the basic document, however, is outside the scope of ETHICS.

Successful use of PKI was first tested in the autumn of 2002. This was a necessary feature to secure the communication between the individual vendor and the procurement agency during the tender, and also for the vendor to sign the proposal and send it in an encrypted version to the SKI tender box. Even if the system is designed to standard EU PKI implementation, local differences in implementation can be handled through minor modifications of the plug in needed for signing and for encryption. For special tenders, where participants identity needs to be kept anonymous to SKI and the evaluation team, an independent third party may act as a registration authority and issue the tender specific key that needs to be associated with each vendor.

It has constantly been advocated by the SKI management, that as much as possible should be based on standard software, so the balance between customized/turnkey solutions and standard solutions seems to offer best opportunities for constantly adapting the system to newest developments, including open source. The use of standard components like Quickplace, a standard Lotus tool for establishing and organising virtual meeting rooms, the use of Adobe as a tool for creative creation of questionnaires, and the use of standard components to extract data and secure conversion to open formats, such as XML, HTML is also of great importance.

It has been a critical design point from the beginning to ensure the confidentiality of the Vendors material and data. This has led to our strong recommendation, that the vendor does not fill in any questionnaires while he is on line, but downloads the questionnaires, completes them and audits them within the confines of his own intranet, and finally protects them by signing and encrypting the proposal before uploading. Once the proposals are uploaded, they are kept locked until the deadline, when the tender box closes for outside access and opens for named officers, responsible for handling and evaluating. From then on, the answers cannot be changed, and all actions are logged. All personnel related information is subject to the Danish law of Data protection and logged and audited accordingly. The website itself is protected using the newest technology for firewall protection and access management using the Lotus secure system.

Activities

When the initial development was started, it was stated that the ease-of-use of the system also meant that the training program needed to bring the buyers/consultants as well as the managers on to the system had to be limited. The first version of the system was developed and presented in 1998, and following a

demonstration and a half day introduction, the employers accepted the system and used it. The incremental implementation model proved successful, and the same experience was realized when the Online secure tender room was first opened to vendors for participation during a SW bid in the autumn of 2002: Only a few email questions and everybody was on board, even if the use of digital certificates at that point was completely new to all participants.

Only when we started to launch the online tender modules did we realize that it would be worthwhile for our peer organisations to study our approach and best-of-breed solution, and so we decided to go for more publicity. In this respect we were helped by the EU-sponsored analysis on eProcurement systems in place in Europe, that was performed in the spring of 2002 and which pointed towards ETHICS as one if not the only one of its kind in Europe. Later in May we were invited to New York to present the experiences of ETHICS to a large community from a number of countries under the World Bank leadership. Since we signed an agreement with IBM to assist us in marketing the solution internationally, we have had a number of visitors from various countries and many are at this moment evaluating how they should start pilots.

The reorganizing of the back office is a must in most cases, like in ours, where the major benefit of mapping out procedures and processes is to build on the strength of the employees and extract the best available local knowledge and get rid of individual ways that may not be very helpful to colleagues nor very productive qualitatively or quantitatively.

During the implementation phase we tested each step separately, first simply publishing information on the web, then making it possible to download diskettes with questionnaires, and then taking the final step and opening up the Online, web-based tenders.

We believe the solution is extremely innovative, it was one of the very first to demonstrate clearly the use of PKI in practice, it is the first to demonstrate use of secure virtual team rooms, it is one of the first to demonstrate how intelligent assessment tools can be used to reduce the complexities of the decision process and one of the first to solve the problem of multilingual support.

Managing eGovernment implementation the way we managed the implementation of ETHICS is clearly also of interest outside the narrow scope of eProcurement.

ETHICS helps to coordinate the tenders between different levels of government and between agencies. The requirements collection phase and the market research phase makes it possible to share the knowledge with key users or user groups before starting to draft the call for tender.

Directly and indirectly ETHICS helps towards removal of barriers to pan-European procurement services, partly because of standardizing the EU directive in an easy-to-use way, partly because the communication/publishing of tenders are made automatically, and partly because of the multilingual possibilities offered. This will help attract vendors to major bids across the old borders of Europe.

By implementing ETHICS, the role of the buyers/specialists in the organisation has become much more visible, and delegation of authority has led to job enrichment for these specialists. This has, on the other side, also led to the point where some of the former, traditionally oriented public servants preferred to step down, as their job content changed considerably. This is a challenge and a careful balance has to be demonstrated by management.

Risk management is of course of great importance when working with major bids, some of which are very strategic and all of which are very visible. Even if Denmark has a very fine reputation of no fraud and a transparent administration, it is the key decision point for the success of any tendering system that it is completely transparent in all aspects, that decision criteria are clearly published and clearly and demonstrably used in the evaluation based on the original input from the vendors. Since the introduction of the first tender based on diskettes/templates, we have had no complaints from any vendor, as results and reason for results in all cases could be clearly demonstrated. This has further increased the belief in a well managed, neutral and efficient organisation.

Output and Results

The practical, direct measurable results and impact in SKI of using ETHICS can be summarized in this way:

Productivity more than doubled as a result of implementing ETHICS: in 1996 20 major tenders were

managed by a staff of 9 specialists and 20 admin employees. In 2002, 40 major tenders were handled and more than 80 ongoing frame contracts covering more than 2 billion individual articles/line items of different products or services

Growth in turnover has reached more than 36% year over year since 1998 indicating increasingly happy customers (the 8500 public agencies buying on the SKI negotiated contracts)

No complaints or legal issues with vendors since 1998. This is not only a soft quality measure, but definitely also significant, as the costs and business damage incurred if any complaints had been made, could have been quite substantial.

ETHICS has proved that it is preserving and re-using the organizational know how in a very productive way: During the last 4 years, 50% of the staff has been changed without any disruptions or delays in plans.

Among the qualitative improvement we should mention:

Easier involvement of end users/potential buyers as advisors early in the planning process. The closer we get to correct understanding of requirements, the easier it is to concentrate on strategic items and the more business and thus savings will be generated from the contracts negotiated.

More efficient use of experts in the evaluation phase as well. The use of group/collaboration oriented technologies makes it easy to demonstrate real differences in scoring and pinpointing significant differentiators between offerings.

Efficient management control system avoids delays, secures quality of process and adherence to EU regulations.

Demonstrated use of digital certificates and electronic security is helping to break down barriers in attitude among private vendors competing for public orders. This again is helping to increase the internal competitiveness of the vendors, that have participated in SKI tenders.

By following the EU regulations strictly, SKI has demonstrated to other countries the value of an open and transparent publication policy as well as a role model for on line tendering and publication of awards.

The working conditions for the staff has improved and is still improving based on the re-use of intelligence, legal conditions, questionnaires.

Lessons and conclusions

The visibility of the ETHICS solution is now increasing dramatically since it has been presented not only to the World Bank constituency, but also in any major meetings in IPPA , announced through local marketing activity by IBM, Lotus and business partners, but also because of active participation in the dissemination process by key officers in IAPSO.

Since last year, almost 20 major demonstrations have been performed and approximately 15 additional country organisations, regional authorities or individual authorities have heard about ETHICS.

In May, the ETHICS solution will be among the key items on the annual Lotus Government Global Forum, to be held in Stockholm May 4-7 for 400 key government officials from around the Globe.

The solution has been installed at the IBM Government excellence center in Berlin since January this year.

The key learning points are that the ETHICS solution is a highly transferable solution, that can be adapted directly to all European countries following the EU directive and supporting also local deviations in use of the Public Key Infrastructure with minor adaptation costs. Due to its support for multiple languages, it may be well suited especially for candidate countries that want to encourage international participation in tenders for their infrastructure.

We have found a major interest for the project in large organisations like the Defence, where clear regulations and transparency prevails, and also found interest to apply the solution in an ASP application service provider environment, where a number of small communities could benefit from the imbedded skills

without having to hire expensive consultants or specialists.

As such we believe that this kind of tendering will be a necessary first step towards creating value-chain integrated public procurement eMarkets on an international scale.

References and links

The homepage describing the SKI organisation is located at www.ski.dk
- English: www.ski.dk/english/_default.asp

The homepage describing the ETHICS solution and the intranet functionality can be found at a dedicated site: qp.ethics.dk/eu

This requires a username and password to be entered: username: euaward1 / euaward2 / euaward3 / euaward4 , password: euevaluate

Further, the existing solution can be seen as any vendor will see it at the address ski.ethics.dk

Presentation and description of the ETHICS system can also be found at the World Bank global seminar page: wbln0018.worldbank.org/OCS/egovforum.nsf/Main/Biblio2

Contact Information

Organisation: National Procurement Denmark

Name: Vagn Andersen

Address:

Vestergade 2
1456 K Copenhagen
Denmark

Telephone: +45 3342 7048

Fax: +45 3391 4144

E-mail: va@ski.dk

Contact Information

Organisation: National Procurement Denmark

Name: Søren Jacobsen

Address:

Vestergade 2
1456 Copenhagen
Denmark

Telephone: +45 3342 7000

Fax: +45 3391 4144

E-mail: sj@ski.dk